

Supplementary Report to

A New Global Paradigm:

Understanding the Transnational Progressive Movement,
the Energy Transition and the Great Transformation
Strangling Alberta's Petroleum Industry

A Report for Commissioner Steve Allan
Anti-Alberta Energy Public Inquiry

Dr T.L. Nemeth

October 2020

Table of Contents

- I. Introduction 3
- II. Great Reset..... 5
 - A. European Green Deal 17
 - B. The Biden Plan 22
- III. Canada and the Great Reset 24
- IV. Task Forces and Summits – Planning for Recovery 30
 - A. Task Force for a Resilient Recovery 31
 - B. Canada 2020-Global Progress Recovery Project and Recovery Summit 35
 - C. Mark Carney..... 45
- V. Implications for Alberta and Canada 51
- VI. Conclusion 72
- VII. Works Cited 77

The pandemic represents a rare but narrow window of opportunity to reflect, reimagine, and reset our world.... It is time to start questioning old assumptions and developing a new paradigm.... The only acceptable response to such a crisis is to pursue a “Great Reset” of our economies, politics, and societies.

–Prof. Klaus Schwab, Founder and Executive Chairman, World Economic Forum¹

It is not just to think about how do we cut the supply of oil, but how do we cut the demand for oil. ...The pandemic has done more than any carbon tax could have done.... Again, we can make it permanent to the degree that we change the relative price....Then eventually we can try to have a slower recovery and we can reach this peak oil demand.

–Jose Antonio Gonzalez Anaya, former CEO of PEMEX²

Any public money going to companies should come with guarantees on transformation of the companies towards achieving societal goals of more inclusive and sustainable growth...we are not here to save companies but to transform them.

–Mariana Mazzucato, UCL Institute for Innovation and Public Purpose³

¹ The Great Reset, June 2020, <https://weforum.org/focus/the-great-reset>, and “Post COVID Capitalism,” Project Syndicate, 12 October 2020. Available at: https://www.project-syndicate.org/commentary/post-COVID-capitalism-great-reset-by-klaus-schwab-2020-10?a_la=english&a_d=5f831b07e0993d5fd0b705b7&a_m=&a_a=click&a_s=&a_p=homepage&a_li=post-COVID-capitalism-great-reset-by-klaus-schwab-2020-10&a_pa=curated&a_ps=main-article-a2&a_ms=&a_r=

² Jose Antonio Gonzalez Anaya, Project Syndicate Event “The Green Recovery,” Day 2, Session Two – Closing the Circuit on the Energy Transition, 17 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ko0kNo6Dt5s>.

³ Mariana Mazzucato, Project Syndicate Event “The Green Recovery,” Day 2, Session One – Can Green Business Be Good Business? 17 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ko0kNo6Dt5s>.

I. Introduction

There is a transnational global movement to facilitate a *Great Transformation* or *Great Reset* to a new global economy that intends to halt fossil fuel use and development in order to create a new global “green” decarbonized, net-zero civilization based on a technocratic, beyond GDP, degrowth, nature and well-being based, circular economy.⁴ Although the movement has been working towards this goal for some time, with particularly catastrophic effects for the petroleum industry in Alberta and Canada, the spark or catalyst for an acceleration of this Great Transformation has been the coronavirus pandemic of 2020. Since the writing of the original report, “A New Global Paradigm: Understanding the Transnational Progressive Movement, the Energy Transition and the Great Transformation Strangling Alberta’s Petroleum Industry,” there has been a great deal of activity across the Transnational Progressive Movement to capitalize on the COVID-19 pandemic crisis and not let it be squandered or go to waste as some argue happened after the 2008/09 financial crisis.⁵ The COVID-19 lockdowns are seen by those within the Transnational Progressive Movement as a “great but narrow window of opportunity” to push a Great Reset⁶, or Great Transformation⁷, or System Change⁸ for the Western and global

⁴ As Environmental Defence Canada points out and confirms in its report, *Not Just a Canadian Phenomenon: Citizen Opposition to Oil and Gas Production Around the World* (Environmental Defence, July 2020), the well-coordinated attack on Canada’s fossil fuel industry is part of a larger global movement to shut down fossil fuel development and use, particularly in developed countries of the West.

⁵ See for example, Frans Timmermans speaking at the Recovery Summit, 16 September 2020, Day 3 Sustainability. Available at: <https://youtu.be/QRqfkzYwmkw>, or <https://recoveryproject.ca/the-recovery-summit/> or on Apple podcasts, <https://podcasts.apple.com/ca/podcast/the-recovery-project/id1506654021>. See also, Dr. Fatih Birol, “What the 2008 Financial Crisis can Teach us about Designing Stimulus Packages Today,” 19 April 2020, International Energy Agency. Available at: <https://www.iea.org/commentaries/what-the-2008-financial-crisis-can-teach-us-about-designing-stimulus-packages-today>.

⁶ The Great Reset, June 2020. Available at: <https://www.weforum.org/focus/the-great-reset>.

⁷ Kristalina Georgieva, “From Great Lockdown to Great Transformation,” IMF Managing Director’s Opening Remarks to the US Chamber of Commerce, 9 June 2020. Available at: <https://www.imf.org/en/News/Articles/2020/06/09/sp060920-from-great-lockdown-to-great-transformation>.

⁸ Friends of the Earth International, for example, refer to the recovery opportunity as “a transformative system change agenda.” See, No Author, “Principles for a Just Recovery Based on Environmental, Social, Gender, and Economic Justice,” (Amsterdam: August 2020), 1. Available at: https://www.foei.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/08/FoEI_just_recovery_principles_english.pdf.

economies through the various national recovery stimulus packages that seek to alienate or disincentivize investment and operations of the hydrocarbon industry, while diverting and expanding investment in renewable energy towards a goal of “decarbonization” and net-zero carbon emissions.

This supplement is intended to update developments since the submission of the original report in the acceleration of the Great Transformation or Great Reset that have taken place between May and early October 2020, examine Canada’s role in these developments, and reflect on the implications for Alberta. To that end, this supplement will be divided into four sections. The first section will examine the Great Reset – what it is and who supports it, and the various other intersecting progressive initiatives such as the European Green Deal and the climate change platform of the American Democratic Party presidential candidate Joe Biden. The second section will consider the Canadian support for the Great Reset and how that has been reflected so far in various federal initiatives. The third section will explore the recommendations and support structure for change that have been put forward through the various task forces, summits, and reports promoting policy ideas for a Green Recovery to “Build Back Better”. The last section will survey the implications for Alberta and the modern Western way of life.

During the first few months of the pandemic there was a media blitz with numerous op-eds and statements made by a variety of progressives on the “silver lining” of the pandemic with respect to climate change, and how this was an historic opportunity to fundamentally transform the global economy.⁹ The strategy is to build and sustain momentum¹⁰ for the idea of “building

⁹ See section VI “The “Silver Lining” of the Coronavirus Pandemic,” in T.L. Nemeth, “A New Global Paradigm: Understanding the Transnational Progressive Movement, the Energy Transition and the Great Transformation Strangling Alberta’s Petroleum Industry,” April 2020, 92-105.

¹⁰ See for example, Ralph Torrie, Celine Bak, Toby Heaps, “Building Back Better with a Bold Green Recovery,” June 2020, 9. Available at: https://www.corporateknights.com/wp-content/uploads/2020/09/2020-09-14-Building-Back-Better-with-a-Bold-Green-Recovery_FINAL_enfr.pdf; Task Force for a Resilient Recovery, “Bridge

back better”¹¹ in a manner shaped and designed by the Transnational Progressive Movement; to create a sense of inevitability around the desired changes to phase out hydrocarbons and replace current energy systems with unreliable intermittent renewable energy, among other societal transforming policies including an overhaul of modern farming practices.¹² Since the lockdowns in Western countries have been prolonged with lingering detrimental effects on national and global economies, what has the Transnational Progressive Movement been doing to facilitate this Great Transformation of the global system?

II. Great Reset

On 3 June 2020, through the World Economic Forum (WEF), the Prince of Wales (Prince Charles), Klaus Schwab (WEF), Secretary General of the UN Antonio Guterres, Kristiana Georgieva of the IMF, the president of Microsoft, the CEO of BP, the CEO of Mastercard, the General Secretary of the International Trade Union Confederation, and the executive director of Greenpeace International launched the Great Reset initiative.¹³ A week later, during a phone call

to the Future: Final Report from the Task Force for a Resilient Recovery,” September 2020, 6. Available at: https://www.recoverytaskforce.ca/wp-content/uploads/2020/09/TFRR-Final-Report_EN.pdf.

¹¹ This concept is normally utilized in the context of natural disasters and is encapsulated in the United Nations Sendai Framework for Disaster Risk Reduction. Available at: <https://www.undrr.org/news/building-back-better-sendai>. Karen Tso, CNBC International Squawk Box host, “Global Opening Moment,” 21 September 2020, “we seek momentum in the countdown to 2030.” [10:02]. Available at: <https://www.weforum.org/events/sustainable-development-impact-summit-2020/sessions/global-opening-moment-times-shown-are-cet>.

¹² See for example the concluding comments of Ceyla Pazarbasioglu, Vice President, Equitable Growth, Finance and Institutions, World Bank Group at the Victoria Forum webinar, “The Great Reset”, 20 August 2020, “This is a great opportunity and the stakes are really high, so coordinating at different levels will be critical. ... There is so much momentum right now, there is an opportunity because no one wants to look back and see it as a missed opportunity.” Available at: <https://victoriaforum.ca/2020-forum/webinar-7/>. Other participants at this webinar included Dr. Paul Beaudry, Deputy Governor, Bank of Canada, and Senator Yuen Pau Woo, Senate of Canada.

¹³ For the full almost 90 minute launch of the Great Reset initiative of 3 June 2020 see, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pfVdMWzKwjc>. A summary can be found at the World Economic Forum, <https://www.weforum.org/press/2020/06/the-great-reset-a-unique-twin-summit-to-begin-2021>; Prince Charles’s statement can be read here, HRH The Prince of Wales. Remarks by HRH The Prince of Wales at a virtual roundtable event hosted by HRH’s Sustainable Markets Initiative and The World Economic Forum, 3 June 2020. Available at: <https://www.princeofwales.gov.uk/speech/remarks-hrh-prince-wales-virtual-roundtable-event-hosted-hrhs-sustainable-markets-initiative>; <https://www.princeofwales.gov.uk/thegreatreset>.

with Prince Charles, Prime Minister Justin Trudeau praised him for “championing the Great Reset initiative to build a better and more sustainable future for all,” and “discussed economic recovery and sustainability initiatives that will support the objectives of the Great Reset.” Perry Bellegarde, leader of the Assembly of First Nations, was also contacted by Prince Charles and agreed to “help promote the Great Reset” in Canada, an issue he and Prime Minister Trudeau discussed ahead of the Throne Speech in September 2020.¹⁴ With such seemingly broad support across different segments of global society for this initiative, including Canada, what exactly is the Great Reset?

In the initial launch on 3 June 2020, Klaus Schwab outlined three main components: first, governments ought to direct markets towards fairer outcomes through more coordinated taxation, fiscal, and regulatory policies, improved trade, and a shift to a “stakeholder economy”. In addition, equality of outcome was championed, “governments should implement long-overdue reforms that promote more equitable outcomes.... these may include changes to wealth taxes, the withdrawal of fossil-fuel subsidies, and new rules governing intellectual property, trade, and competition.” Second, governments and private entities need to ensure that investments progress common goals of equality and sustainability. Stimulus funds should be used to create a new system that is “more resilient, equitable, and sustainable [by] building “green” urban infrastructure and creating incentives for industries to improve their track record on environmental, social, and governance (ESG) metrics.” Third, the fourth industrial revolution (4IR), an idea Schwab has been cultivating for 50 years, ought to be harnessed to advance

¹⁴ Prime Minister Trudeau speaks with His Royal Highness The Prince of Wales and the Commonwealth group of Permanent Representatives to the United Nations, 11 June 2020. Available at: <https://pm.gc.ca/en/news/readouts/2020/06/11/prime-minister-trudeau-speaks-his-royal-highness-prince-wales-and-jorge-barerra>, “AFN national chief to help Prince Charles promote ‘Great Reset’ environmental initiative in Canada,” CBC News, 8 June 2020. Available at: <https://www.cbc.ca/news/indigenous/afn-chief-bellegarde-prince-charles-great-reset-1.5603502>; Prime Minister and National Chief Joint Readout, 18 September, 2020. Available at: <https://pm.gc.ca/en/news/readouts/2020/09/18/prime-minister-and-national-chief-joint-readout>.

technological innovations not just in medicine, as with the developments of vaccines, telemedicine and contact tracing, but in every sector. This means accelerating the digital transformation of society, enhanced use of blockchain, artificial intelligence, automation, and perhaps even surveillance.¹⁵ This framework is not intended to be an abstract academic exercise but rather a scaffold for all countries to utilize in order to transform the entire global system.

Klaus Schwab explained,

Every country, from the United States to China, must participate, and every industry, from oil and gas to tech, must be transformed. In short, we need a “Great Reset” of capitalism.... Incremental measures and ad hoc fixes will not suffice to prevent this scenario. We must build entirely new foundations for our economic and social systems.... In fact, one silver lining of the pandemic is that it has shown how quickly we can make radical changes to our lifestyles. [emphasis added]¹⁶

While the initial launch of the Great Reset outlined three core ideas, in July 2020, a more detailed outline of the Great Reset was revealed in book form by Klaus Schwab and Thierry Malleret. The three core ideas evolved to five pillars: shared prosperity, catalysing cooperation, better business (stakeholder capitalism), harnessing technology (advancing the 4IR), and liveable planet. But there is more to the Great Reset than just a collection of ideas.

The WEF and its Great Reset initiative is comprehensive, thorough, and well-organized. A Great Reset internet hub has been established outlining the detailed research and policy prescriptions on offer as well as some practical applications, which resemble variations of a global Green New Deal. There are nineteen different platforms for shaping the future from the promotion of digitalization to new materials to a circular economy to the CommonPass, an electronic health identification app to facilitate travel currently being trialled at Heathrow

¹⁵ These concepts are developed further in Klaus Schwab and Thierry Malleret, *COVID-19 and The Great Reset* (Agentur Schweiz, July 2020).

¹⁶ Klaus Schwab, “Now is the Time for a ‘Great Reset’,” World Economic Forum, 3 June 2020. Available at: <https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2020/06/now-is-the-time-for-a-great-reset/>.

airport.¹⁷ From June 2020 until the WEF annual meeting in May 2021, there are weekly virtual meetings – “Great Reset Dialogues” – discussing issues, problems and opportunities in facilitating the Great Reset, and an annual sustainability summit to network and further discuss ideas and strategies in September 2020, which will then all be distilled into concrete proposals for global action at the annual meeting in 2021.¹⁸ The WEF has emerged as a central hub in the Transnational Progressive Movement and describes itself as “a trusted platform for informed collaboration and cooperation between all stakeholders – reinforced by a track record of success over five decades. The Forum now offers its experience in building purpose-driven communities in service of the extraordinary challenge and opportunity the world faces for a “Great Reset”.¹⁹ One such purpose-driven community it has helped to foster since the signing of the Paris Agreement has been the sustainable development crowd.

In September 2020, the WEF hosted its fourth annual Sustainable Development Impact Summit, a completely virtual event this year, concurrent with the UN General Assembly, with over 3,000 participants – up from 700 in 2018 – from 130 countries.²⁰ Speakers ranged from world leaders, corporate leaders, NGOs, major media, academics, institutes, banks, city leaders, youth, and so on – the full range of the Transnational Progressive Movement. The summit was organized across 60 sessions around the Great Reset theme and the five pillars described above.

¹⁷ The Commons Project. Available at: <https://thecommonsproject.org/commonpass>. This project is funded by the World Economic Forum and the Rockefeller foundation. The CommonPass is a digital application for “individuals to access their lab results and vaccination records, and consent to have that information used to validate their COVID status without revealing any other underlying personal health information. The framework delivers a simple yes/no answer as to whether the individual meets the current entry criteria, but the underlying health information stays in the individual’s control.”

¹⁸ These are streamed on the WEF website or are available as a podcast, “The World versus Virus”, on the web or on various platforms like Apple. For example, <https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2020/09/great-reset-podcast-financing-sustainable-recovery-imf/>; or <https://thegreatreset.libsyn.com>.

¹⁹ World Economic Forum, “The Great Reset.” Available at: <https://www.weforum.org/great-reset>.

²⁰ Klaus Schwab, opening remarks, “Global Opening Moment,” livestream, [2:40]. Available at: <https://www.weforum.org/events/sustainable-development-impact-summit-2020/sessions/global-opening-moment-times-shown-are-cet>.

World leaders like the King of Jordan and the President of Colombia supported the idea of upgrading or resetting the international system to be more integrated, because the climate crisis has demonstrated so far that there has been ineffective collective action and the world needs something different, a more holistic approach. The President of Colombia further stressed that all peoples in the world need to embrace this cause, the energy transition must be accelerated around the world, and a circular economy needs to be implemented.²¹

At another session a few days later Christiana Figueres, the negotiator of the 2015 Paris Agreement, emphasized that the Great Reset is already happening and there is “extraordinary power” in publicly stating ambitions, because once an ambition is stated publicly innovation, supply, and value chain changes can be unleashed for the decarbonization transformation, gaining momentum and making the transformation quicker and deeper.²² She observed that decarbonization is leading to a true “resetting” of corporations. She applauded the shift away from “Milton Friedman’s primacy of shareholders” to stakeholders. In her view, stakeholder capitalism is accelerating in the corporate world, along with the momentum towards an intentional shift to a circular regenerative economy through digitalization and AI, which will lead to an exponential global transformation.²³ A common theme throughout the sessions was the idea

²¹ H.M. King Abdullah II ibn Al Hussein (King of Jordan), Ivan Duque (President of Colombia), “Global Opening Moment,” livestream, [5:47-7:45 – Jordan; 14:02-16:37 – Colombia]. Available at: <https://www.weforum.org/events/sustainable-development-impact-summit-2020/sessions/global-opening-moment-times-shown-are-cet>.

²² This echoes the position of central bankers who at a 2019 meeting of the Network for Greening the Financial System contended that attitudes and positions of bankers can be changed by talking publicly about the necessary transformation, potential risks of not changing, and ambitions for greening the financial system. NGFS Conference Plenary, “What can central banks do to mitigate climate related risks and scale up green finance,” NGFS 17 April 2019, at 22:55-24:38. Available at: <https://www.ngfs.net/en/page-videos-et-jeux/video-gallery>.

²³ Christiana Figueres, “Making Net Zero Possible,” 23 September 2020, [23:26-30:45]. Available at: <https://www.weforum.org/events/sustainable-development-impact-summit-2020/sessions/making-net-zero-possible-times-shown-are-cet>. Also at this session were Jesper Brodin (CEO, IKEA), Klaus Schwab (WEF), Mark Schneider (CEO, Nestle), Lisa P. Jackson (VP Environment, Policy and Social Initiatives, Apple; former EPA Administrator), Elizabeth Cousens (UN Foundation), Martin John Callahan (Minister for Climate Change and Corporate Responsibility, UK).

that this is a crucial decade, “the most important decade in humankind,” and a Great Reset is necessary.²⁴ Indeed, Figueres concluded that the only way decarbonization can succeed is with systemic changes supported by individuals; a complete system transformation along with individual lifestyle choices and actions such as making the right choices on what to eat, what to wear, how to get around, and who to vote for.²⁵ It is the linking together of the different strands and networks of society that progress and transformation can happen.

Through the Great Reset, the WEF brings together the different networks of the Transnational Progressive Movement in a way the UN alone cannot, nor can the European focused Club of Rome or the Open Society network. Indeed, all of these other groups including numerous foundations, think tanks, academics, environmental groups, media and corporations are contributing to the initiative as they continue their own activities pursuing a global economic and social transformation. For example, the Club of Rome has continued with its involvement with the EU and the UN through various members, but most predominantly through its co-chair Sandrine Dixson-Declève, who moderated a panel for the UN “nature for life” biodiversity summit in September 2020. In her opening remarks she said,

We through the planetary emergency partnership and the Club of Rome have been gathering organizations together to come behind the fact that we need this transformational change, and together we can actually do this. ...the economic system shift that we need to move away from wealth to well-being. It has to look at the financial ramifications, changing the financial system but also financing change -- upping the scale in terms of private and public investments to really draw out the stranded assets and bring in the new assets that are going to create the real resilience in our societies.²⁶

²⁴ The most important decade quote is from Jesper Brodin, CEO of IKEA, “Making Net Zero Possible,” 23 September 2020, [1:45; 6:49; 9:28]. Mark Schneider, the Nestle CEO, made a pledge to the UN last year to have the company’s operations be net-zero by 2050, and will have a detailed plan with milestones by the end of 2020 [15:40]. Available at: <https://www.weforum.org/events/sustainable-development-impact-summit-2020/sessions/making-net-zero-possible-times-shown-are-cet>.

²⁵ Christiana Figueres, “Making Net Zero Possible,” 23 September 2020, [39:10-42:29].

²⁶ United Nations Meeting, Nature for Life Hub, Day 3: Global Ambition Day, Session 3.3 Green Recovery and Green New Deals, 28 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.learningfornature.org/en/topic/session-3-green-recovery-and-green-new-deals/>. Many organizations, governments, and businesses are involved in the

The Planetary Emergency Partnership also worked among its partners to promote the Leaders Pledge for Nature, which Prime Minister Trudeau joined along with 70+ other nations. In preparation for the Biodiversity Summit in 2021, the UN has created five action tracks to support a concurrent UN Food Systems Summit.²⁷ Sandrine Dixson-Declève has been appointed a vice-chair for the action track on building resilience in food systems.²⁸ She has also just completed a role with the EU on the expert panel that developed a green taxonomy for the financial services industry, and continues as a member of the expert group on Economic and Societal Impact of Research & Innovation (ESIR) within the EU. Other Club of Rome members are also involved on EU expert panels that influence the policy direction of the EU.²⁹ In North America, many dismiss The Club of Rome as a long-discredited fringe organization, yet its members exert not inconsiderable influence on the policy direction of the EU that has led to its promulgation of the EU Green Deal. Likewise, many leaders, businesses, and organizations from around the world

planetary emergency partnership such as the WWF, the Potsdam Institute, Youth4Nature, Triodos Bank, Mastercard, We Mean Business Coalition, the World Economic Forum, UNEP, the EU, and so on. “The Planetary Emergency Partnership is a global platform of over 140 leaders from governments, UN, international organizations, business, civil society, youth movements, scientific institutions and academia. The platform grew out of a small group of partners convened by the Club of Rome to develop the Planetary Emergency Plan, and to promote the Club’s narrative of “emergence from emergency”, the notion that our current predicament is both an urgent call for action and an unprecedented opportunity for transformation. The platform’s high level political access and bottom-up, local level efforts support the ultimate high-level goal of a Planetary Emergency Declaration and Plan being adopted by global leaders by the end of 2020, now that the connection between nature, climate change and people’s health is even more important.” Available at: <https://clubofrome.org/impact-hubs/climate-emergency/open-letter-to-global-leaders-a-healthy-planet-for-healthy-people/>.

²⁷ Available at: <https://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/blog/2020/09/leading-advocates-for-transforming-global-food-systems-named-ahead-of-milestone-un-summit/>.

²⁸ Available at: <http://sdg.iisd.org/news/un-announces-leaders-of-five-action-tracks-for-food-systems-summit/>.

²⁹ For example, the Ellen MacArthur Foundation is also represented on the recently convened EU expert group the Platform on Sustainable Finance. Available at: <https://ec.europa.eu/transparency/regexpert/index.cfm?do=groupDetail.groupDetail&groupID=3731&NewSearch=1&NewSearch=1>. See also, Hans Joachim Schellnhuber, former president of the Club of Rome was on the Horizon 2020 Commission Expert Group - High-Level Panel of the European Decarbonisation Pathways Initiative (EDPI). Available at: <https://ec.europa.eu/transparency/regexpert/index.cfm?do=groupDetail.groupDetail&groupID=3459&NewSearch=1&NewSearch=1>.

are echoing the old *Limits to Growth* message of dwindling resources and overconsumption, including those in the WEF.

Many also dismiss the WEF as a place where society leaders can gather for a gabfest in Davos with little impact on actual policy outcomes, but it has become so much more than that, and exerts real influence on national governments, corporations, and civil society through its coordinating functions, and now as an incubator for policy ideas that can be introduced through its vast network of government, corporate/business, academic, labour, youth, and NGO members.³⁰ This is undertaken ostensibly with the goal to make the world a better place – but based on whose definition of “better”? In the view of Klaus Schwab, the purpose of the WEF is to supplant the economic, political, and social system established at the end of World War II (WWII) with a new technology-based corporatist framework, which will lead to the betterment of the world.³¹ The term used is “stakeholder capitalism,” which is rather misleading because it is really a rebranding of a corporatist based socialism under the rubric of capitalism in order to convince corporations, governments, and individuals that it is merely a refinement of capitalism, democracy, and free markets rather than their destruction.

The main progressive global institutions, governments, coordinating bodies, institutes, think tanks, academics, ENGOs, NGOs, media, youth, and corporations – the Transnational Progressive Movement—are on board with the Great Reset. Even when the UN held its general assembly and climate change meetings in September 2020, support from many different countries, UN officials, and the UN Secretary General, was expressed for the Great Reset.

³⁰ Mark Steyn, “The Reset Jet Set,” Steyn online, 17 August 2020. Available at: <https://www.steynonline.com/10566/the-reset-jet-set>.

³¹ Klaus Schwab, “Post-COVID Capitalism,” *Project Syndicate*, 12 October 2020. Available at: <https://www.project-syndicate.org/commentary/post-COVID-capitalism-great-reset-by-klaus-schwab-2020-10>. A group of academics penned an article in support of the need to transform the global system utilizing technology in order for the Great Reset to be successful, “Landry Signé, Addisu Lashitew, Sanjeev Khagram. The ‘great reset’ requires agile governance.” Available at: <https://insights.techreview.com/the-great-reset-requires-agile-governance/>.

However, the transformation of the world system means a restructuring of *all* global institutions including the UN itself, the IMF, the World Bank, the WTO and any other institutions that evolved out of the post WWII Bretton Woods framework. What is fascinating is how this cohort of leaders of these institutions seem to align in purpose, and perhaps in ideology, and are actively working towards what is likely their own demise, like the large foundations and corporations that were able to accumulate so much wealth through the capitalist system, yet are supporting and financing the destruction of capitalism.

An interesting signal for this initiative, though by no means unique, can be seen in the shift of Prime Minister Justin Trudeau. In May 2020, he expressed support for a global coordinated plan and was generally uncritical of the UN and the world system stating that “citizens need to have confidence in international institutions.”³² By September, this attitude had shifted. At the UN General Assembly meeting on 25 September 2020, Trudeau declared:

The international approach we’ve relied on since the second half of the 20th century was built on the understanding that countries would work together. The system is broken and the world is in crisis....Unless we change right now we have a chance, not a big chance, but a chance to shift course....we’re all in this together...like our grandparents’ generation years ago, we will lay the foundations of a better world.³³

As with the Transnational Progressive Movement, Trudeau is but one of several signalling a desire to replace the current international system.³⁴ The most recent iterations being Pope Francis

³² Prime Minister Justin Trudeau, “Prime Minister’s opening remarks at the United Nations High-Level Event on Financing for Development in the Era of COVID-19 and Beyond,” Ottawa, 28 May 2020. Available at: <https://pm.gc.ca/en/news/speeches/2020/05/28/prime-ministers-opening-remarks-united-nations-high-level-event-financing>. One could argue that Trudeau’s professed support for the UN in May was related to the vote for the Security Council seat that Canada desired, which was held after this speech in June 2020.

³³ Prime Minister of Canada Justin Trudeau Speech to the UN General Assembly, 25 September 2020, [0:16; 1:49-2:20; on “climate reckoning” 3:53-4:21; “the system is broken” 5:30-5:47; “we’re all in this together” 7:30; “our grandparents’ generation,” 10:30-10:36]. Available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=vAcvoa8otbw>.

³⁴ Ursula von der Leyen also called for a reforming of the multilateral system in the first European State of the Union Address, “Building the world we want to live in: A Union of vitality in a world of fragility,” 16 September 2020, 9-10. Available at: https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/SPEECH_20_1655. The President of China stated, “the global governance system calls for reform and improvement....The global governance system should adapt itself to evolving global political and economic dynamics.” H.E. Xi Jinping, “Statement by H.E. Xi Jinping President of the People’s Republic of China At the General Debate of the 75th

who wrote, quoting Pope Benedict XVI, that it was necessary to reform “the United Nations Organization, and likewise of economic institutions and international finance,”³⁵ without delegitimizing them, and Kristalina Georgieva, IMF Managing Director, who in her address to the annual joint meeting of the IMF and World Bank spoke of seizing “this *new Bretton Woods moment*” to create a better system.³⁶

Some may suggest that Prime Minister Trudeau’s statements are merely rhetoric – just going along with what other world leaders are saying. However, there is some evidence that the Prime Minister was projecting his support for the Great Reset, and reflecting what the machinery of the Canadian government was already beginning to do in examining ways to have Canada fulfill the pledge to pursue the Great Reset. For example, a month before the Prime Minister’s UN Speech, Deputy Bank of Canada Governor Paul Beaudry and Senator Yuen Pau Woo, along with Ceyla Pazarbasioglu of the World Bank participated in a Victoria Forum webinar with the theme “The Great Reset: Making Finance Work for an Inclusive and Resilient Future.” Both Canadians made the point that the entire Canadian and international financial system needs to be reset to help the transition to a greener economy and to ensure investment is going to the right places to facilitate the necessary comprehensive structural reforms for a Great Reset based on a

Session of the United Nations General Assembly,” Beijing, 22 September 2020, 5. Available at:

https://estatemnts.unmeetings.org/estatemnts/10.0010/20200922/cVOFMr0rKnhR/qR2WoyhEseD8_en.pdf

³⁵ Holy Father Pope Francis, Encyclical Letter *Fratelli Tutti*, The Holy See, October 2020, 43. Available at: http://www.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/encyclicals/documents/papa-francesco_20201003_enciclica-fratelli-tutti.html. The Pope went on to say, “Global society is suffering from grave structural deficiencies that cannot be resolved by piecemeal solutions or quick fixes. Much needs to change, through fundamental reform and renewal.” (45)

³⁶ Kristalina Georgieva, “A New Bretton Woods Moment,” Speech to joint meeting of IMF and World Bank, 15 October 2020. Available at: <https://www.imf.org/en/News/Articles/2020/10/15/sp101520-a-new-bretton-woods-moment>. Emphasis is in the original. See also, Madeline Albright and Ibrahim Gambari, “Recovery and Renewal at the UN,” *Project Syndicate* [online], 23 October 2020. Available at: https://www.project-syndicate.org/commentary/united-nations-75th-anniversary-chance-for-governance-reform-by-madeleine-albright-and-ibrahim-gambari-2020-10?_la=english&a_d=5f92e006e724d21984c938bd&a_m=&a_a=click&a_s=&a_p=homepage&a_li=united-nations-75th-anniversary-chance-for-governance-reform-by-madeleine-albright-and-ibrahim-gambari-2020-10&a_pa=curated&a_ps=&a_ms=&a_r=

green economy. Senator Woo’s description of what is necessary, and Deputy Governor

Beaudry’s subsequent comments, are worth quoting at length:

All of the things Beaudry mentioned are about how we can change the incentives, and re-price risk relative prices so that the financial sector will work towards the kinds of “reset” we need... The role of finance in the Great Reset isn’t just about the existing financial system stepping up to make the Reset possible, it is in some ways about the Reset of the financial system itself so that it can be aligned with the major structural reforms that are needed, and the two that we are focussing on, development finance, debt and recycling of surpluses, question of climate change; what specifically might be done to nudge the financial sector to do the things that will help with the structural change we need in these two areas. Simply setting the right investment framework and aligning relative prices for greater and better financial sector involvement is not enough for a Great Reset.

Deputy Governor Beaudry agreed and explained that the financial industry has not been idle in addressing the need for reform,

this is what the NGFS [Network for Greening the Financial System] is working towards -- trying to figure out a framework that will help the financial markets -- this is a lot of central banks in the world including the multilateral institutions that are working together to create that. I think this is an important piece, and Mark Carney among others are pushing there to get the financial system on board, and they are asking for a set of coordinated frameworks and we’re trying to deliver on that.³⁷

All of the participants agreed that a fundamental transformation was necessary and required coordination at different levels within and across nations and institutions – including governments, the corporate sector, households, the financial sector, central banks – “**everyone** has to play their role. [emphasis added]” They also agreed that the pandemic provides a great opportunity, insisting as many others have that now is the time for fundamental change because the window for action is short and there is so much momentum no one wants to look back later and say the opportunity was missed.

³⁷ These quotations are from the webinar, Victoria Forum, “The Great Reset: Making Finance Work for an Inclusive and Resilient Future,” Moderator Amadou Sy (IMF), Ceyla Pazarbasioglu (World Bank), Senator Yuen Pau Woo (Canada), Paul Beaudry (Deputy Governor, Bank of Canada), Victoria Forum, Webinar #7, 20 August 2020. Available at: <https://victoriaforum.ca/2020-forum/webinar-7/>.

There has been clear messaging from various segments of the Transnational Progressive Movement that fundamental change is necessary. This messaging has been reinforced to the general public through the protests, peaceful and violent, that erupted in June globally, initially motivated by a sense of racial injustice when a black man died when being arrested, and that have been ongoing for other reasons in some American cities.³⁸ The protests serve to legitimize and enhance to the general public the idea being expressed by various world leaders that there is something wrong with the current system, and that the entire system must be replaced.

Another way to reinforce this message is through the repetition of certain phrases and words to not only emphasize that change is necessary and happening, but to also signal participation in the movement. Examples of these include “Build Back Better,” “resilience,” “alignment,” and “pledges.”³⁹ Although the UN Secretary General came out with the “Build Back Better” phrase in reference to recovery packages on Earth Day in April 2020,⁴⁰ this has become the ultimate gesture or indication that one is on board with the agenda. It is the slogan of the UK government, Joe Biden’s campaign, the IMF, the OECD, the WEF, the Task Force for a Resilient Recovery, Canada 2020 and the Recovery Project, the World Resources Institute, the

³⁸ Associated Press, “Protests Support Floyd, Black Lives Matter on 3 Continents,” VOA News [online], 6 June 2020. Available at: <https://voanews.com/usa/nation-turmoil-george-floyd-protests/protests-support-floyd-black-lives-matter-3-continents>. Two American cities most affected by protests and occupiers are Portland, Oregon and Seattle, Washington. Interestingly, people who wish to donate to Black Lives Matter (<https://blacklivesmatter.com>) are taken to Act Blue, an online funding portal for progressive causes including Democratic party political candidates, where it highlights that donations will go the Black Lives Matter Support Fund at the Tides Foundation. See, https://secure.actblue.com/donate/ms_blm_homepage_2019.

³⁹ See for example, Terence Corcoran, “The ‘resilience’ ploy to seize the economy,” *The Financial Post* [online], 27 May 2020. Available at: <https://financialpost.com/opinion/terence-corcoran-the-resilience-ploy-to-seize-the-economy>; The Task Force for a Resilient Recovery; on alignment see Richard Florizone and Bruce Lourie, “Canada’s Long-Term Plan Sets a Course for a Strong, Resilient Recovery,” in which they review the Throne Speech and observe, “Aligned with global efforts and leading expertise, the Government of Canada has charted an important path forward, setting the course for a strong, resilient recovery.” Available at: <https://www.iisd.org/articles/canadas-long-term-plan-sets-course-strong-resilient-recovery>; on pledges, The Leaders’ Pledge for Nature. Available at: <https://www.leaderspledgefornature.org/>.

⁴⁰ Antonio Guterres, Secretary General United Nations, “Climate Change and COVID-19: UN Urges Nations to ‘recover better,’” 22 April 2020. Available at: https://www.un.org/en/un-coronavirus-communications-team/un-urges-countries-percentE2_percent80_percent98build-back-better-percentE2_percent80_percent99.

We Mean Business Coalition, Friends of the Earth Europe, the Suzuki Foundation, just to name a few. Indeed, aside from his pledge to the Great Reset, Prime Minister Trudeau further signalled his commitment when he prorogued parliament, stating, “we need to reset the approach of this government for a recovery to build back better.”⁴¹ Of all the entities proposing fundamental economic and societal restructuring to build back better through some kind of green recovery or Green New Deal, the EU is farthest along in introducing sweeping legislative and funding initiatives through the EU Green Deal.

A. European Green Deal

As the first large Western region to pursue a comprehensive overhaul through a Green Deal, it is unsurprising that the EU also uses the signal phrase, “Build Back Better.” As discussed in some detail in the report “A New Global Paradigm”, the EU introduced legislation for its Green Deal in the spring of 2020,⁴² and since then it has made the Green Deal and a green recovery a centrepiece of its COVID-19 recovery plans, including increasing the target of emissions reduction from 40 percent to 55 percent by 2030, earmarking 40 percent of the EU agriculture budget dedicated to climate, and designating 30 percent of the €1.8 Trillion economic rescue plan for climate action with some oversight on how the funds are spent.⁴³ It is not just an energy transition that is proposed, but an entire restructuring of European society including agricultural practices and lifestyles all of which are in alignment with the initiatives being put forward by the WEF and the Great Reset. Some recent initiatives announced include the following:

⁴¹ Paula Newton, “Canada’s Trudeau tries to reset amid economic unease and a growing ethics scandal,” CNN [online], 18 August 2020. Available at: <https://edition.cnn.com/2020/08/18/americas/canada-trudeau-scandal-intl/index.html>.

⁴² Nemeth, “A New Global Paradigm,” 78-89.

⁴³ Laurence Tubiana, “Eastbound and Green in Europe,” *Project Syndicate* [online], 8 October 2020. Available at: <https://www.project-syndicate.org/onpoint/eu-green-deal-joins-china-ecological-civilization-by-laurence-tubiana-2020-10>.

- a renovation wave that proposes a multi-year upgrading of European buildings for better energy efficiency utilizing public and private funding;⁴⁴
- a methane strategy to reduce emissions in energy, waste, and agriculture;⁴⁵
- InvestEU will mobilize €10 billion over ten years to enhance biodiversity and the circular economy;⁴⁶
- The European Recovery instrument, NextGeneration EU, will invest in hydrogen technology, renovation, and 1 million electric charging points;
- a €25 billion Just Transition Fund to help regions and industries affected by the energy transition;⁴⁷
- a Farm to Fork strategy⁴⁸ to restructure European agriculture which includes:
 - reducing the use of pesticides by 50 percent by 2030,
 - reducing fertilizers by 20 percent by 2030,
 - converting 25 percent of total EU farmland to organic farming by 2030,
 - adding sustainable food labels to encourage healthier eating particularly plant-based diets,
 - cutting food waste in half by 2030,
 - investment in “precision agriculture, agro-ecology (including organic farming), carbon farming and agro-forestry”, and
 - investing €10 billion for Research and Innovation from the Horizon Europe fund;
- a Biodiversity strategy that will:
 - reduce the use of pesticides by 50 percent by 2030,
 - protect 30 percent of land in Europe and 30 percent of sea in Europe,
 - target €20 billion per year for nature-based solutions and biodiversity initiatives, and
 - work towards a robust international biodiversity agreement next year to complement the Paris Agreement.

Many of the major documents outlining the various policy proposals, strategies, and frameworks either imply or state directly that this is an opportunity to alter or “improve” lifestyles. EU

⁴⁴ European Commission, “A Renovation Wave for Europe -greening our buildings, creating jobs, improving lives,” 14 October 2020. Available at: https://ec.europa.eu/energy/sites/ener/files/eu_renovation_wave_strategy.pdf.

⁴⁵ New Europe Online, “EU adopts renovation wave strategy to make buildings more efficient,” *New Europe Online*, 14 October 2020. Available at: <https://www.neweurope.eu/article/eu-adopts-renovation-wave-strategy-to-make-building-energy-efficient/>.

⁴⁶ Frans Timmermans, “Opening Remarks by Executive Vice-President Frans Timmermans at the Press Conference on a Green and Just Recovery,” 28 May 2020. Available at: https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/SPEECH_20_964. InvestEU is a joint public/private financing initiative between the European Investment Bank group, national promotional banks, and international institutions. Available at: https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/fs_20_40.

⁴⁷ Agnieszka Widuto, “EU Just Transition Fund: how does it work?,” 8 October 2020. Available at: <https://epthinktank.eu/2020/10/08/eu-just-transition-fund-how-does-it-work-animated-infographic/>.

⁴⁸ European Commission, Farm to Fork Strategy. Available at: https://ec.europa.eu/food/sites/food/files/safety/docs/f2f_action-plan_2020_strategy-info_en.pdf. https://eur-lex.europa.eu/resource.html?uri=cellar:ea0f9f73-9ab2-11ea-9d2d-01aa75ed71a1.0001.02/DOC_1&format=PDF ; a short fact sheet, file:///C:/Users/Get/AppData/Local/Temp/factsheet-farm-fork_en.pdf-1.pdf.

President von der Leyen made this clear in her State of the Union address when she announced, “We need to change how we treat nature, how we produce and consume, live and work, eat and heat, travel and transport. ... This is a plan for a true recovery.”⁴⁹ In discussing some of the new green recovery initiatives, von der Leyen remarked, “Our European Green Deal is bigger [than investments]. It is a systemic change.”⁵⁰ Although reference to lifestyle and systemic changes are embedded in the various documents and von der Leyen’s speech, it is not highlighted in media reports, and it is unclear if the general public understands what this means and that to fulfill the EU Green Deal this will happen.

The Club of Rome issued its latest report *Planetary Emergency 2.0* in August 2020 that encapsulates many of the elements that inform the EU Green Deal, which should be unsurprising given that there are several Club of Rome members who have contributed to the EU policies. Notably, the Planetary Emergency Plan recommends a doubling of wind and solar installations every four years while at the same time, recommending that countries,

immediately agree to halve consumption and production footprints in developed and emerging economies and close loops in inefficient industrial, energy and agricultural value chains and production processes by 2030. Enhance regenerative land- use and halt unsustainable natural resource exploitation, including rare earths/minerals.⁵¹

⁴⁹ President Ursula von der Leyen, European State of the Union Address, “Building the world we want to live in: A Union of vitality in a world of fragility,” 16 September 2020, 6. Available at: https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/SPEECH_20_1655.

⁵⁰ Frederic Simon, “EU launches ‘renovation wave’ for greener, more stylish buildings,” *Euractiv* [online], 15 October 2020. Available at: <https://www.euractiv.com/section/energy/news/eu-launches-renovation-wave-for-greener-more-stylish-buildings/>.

⁵¹ Club of Rome, “Planetary Emergency 2.0,” August 2020, 9. Available at: https://clubofrome.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/09/COR-PEP_Sep2020_A4_16pp-v2.pdf. This is point 8 in the section, “10 Urgent Actions for the Transformation,” point 6 is the doubling of wind and solar capacity.

This is another example of the contradiction inherent in the movement: how can wind and solar installations be doubled globally every four years if there is a concurrent halting of the mining of rare earth elements that are integral to the construction of the renewable energy installations?⁵²

Canada is watching the developments in the EU and taking note, but it remains to be seen how far in Europe's direction Prime Minister Justin Trudeau's government will go in its recovery plans as a great deal depends on the outcome of the forthcoming American election.⁵³ The problem for Europe and the Great Reset is that the rest of the world is not following Europe's lead so far.⁵⁴ At the Project Syndicate "The Green Recovery" virtual event, Mary Robinson, former President of Ireland, agreed that the EU's holistic approach is a good example for the world to follow with the Green Deal, the policy on biodiversity, and the farm to fork strategy, telling the panel that "We can't just think about climate change, we have to commit to changing the whole economy." When asked by one of the moderators why other countries were not following Europe's lead Robinson replied that it is a political problem with America under President Donald Trump who is committed to pull the US out of the Paris Agreement, and that the world is waiting to see the outcome of the election. In the various webinars and summits

⁵² The word "unsustainable" is never defined in the context of mining, and is left open to interpretation on a country by country basis: "The manner and priority in which these actions are implemented will vary from country to country, but the overall objective of rapid carbon emissions reduction, nature regeneration, and enhancing human health and well-being should be a common goal over the next decade." Club of Rome, "Planetary Emergency 2.0," August 2020, 9.

⁵³ Canada, and the current Canadian government, as Stéphane Dion points out "is the most European of non-European countries; we are very close to the values you see in Europe that are universal values." Stéphane Dion speaking with Helena Gaspard, Canada 2020-Global Progress, The Recovery Project, "Democratic Permeability in Times of Global Crises: Power, Politics, and Rights," 30 July 2020, [22:15 to 23:21]. Available at: https://blubrry.com/recovery_project/65164714/democratic-permeability-in-times-of-global-crises-power-politics-and-rights/.

⁵⁴ Despite the praise China received for its declaration at the UN General Assembly that it will reach peak emissions by 2030 and be net-zero or carbon neutral by 2060, it is merely a reiteration of its targets in the Paris Agreement, and it is not bound by the agreement to actually fulfill these targets nor is there any penalty if it does not do so. China, like India, Russia, Africa, and developing Asia are exempt from the same level of emission reductions that are being required by developed nations through the principle of differentiation. H.E. Xi Jinping, "Statement by H.E. Xi Jinping President of the People's Republic of China At the General Debate of the 75th Session of the United Nations General Assembly," Beijing, 22 September 2020, 5. Available at: https://estatemnts.unmeetings.org/estatemnts/10.0010/20200922/cVOfMr0rKnhR/qR2WoyhEseD8_en.pdf.

from May to October, looming over the deliberations was the upcoming American election in November 2020. As Frans Timmermans said at the Canada 2020-Global Progress Recovery Summit,

we can lead on this as Europeans but if we lead and then look back and nobody is following, then there's no point, there's no point. We need to convince the rest of the world to tag along. ...So much depends on the election on the 3rd of November in the United States for the world as a whole not just for the United States.⁵⁵

For the overwhelming majority of participants at the various webinars, summits, and task forces, if not all, the preference is for a win by Democrat Presidential candidate Joe Biden. Robinson was hopeful that Joe Biden would win stating,

Vice President Biden has made it clear he would recommit the United States and I believe he would recommit strongly. It requires a big engagement of people, and we're beginning to see that, led, I have to say that with joy, led by children -- the Friday's for Future led by Greta Thunberg and millions of children, and the young people who are engaged, the way they've required in the United States on the Democratic platform a much greener deal than would otherwise be there.⁵⁶

Equally hopeful about a Biden victory was Nobel Laureate Joe Stiglitz, who was also on this panel at "The Green Recovery" event. In his view, if Trump is re-elected, it will take many years for the American economy to recover from the pandemic, but if Biden is elected, "I am much more hopeful, and I am very hopeful that there will be a green recovery. ...His motto has been

⁵⁵ Canada 2020-Global Progress, The Recovery Summit, Day 3: Sustainability, Frans Timmermans, [3:10-3:21; 4:19-4:28]. Available at: <https://recoveryproject.ca/content/the-recovery-summit-sustainability/> or <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=OrqfkzYwmkw>. However, Timmermans reassured the audience that whatever happens in the election it will be important to establish a global framework that American states, cities, corporations, and NGOs can join even if the federal government does not. Timmermans also praised Canada for the tremendous work it has done so far; it has given Europe hope and it is encouraging that Europe is not alone.

⁵⁶ Project Syndicate, The Green Recovery Virtual Event, Panel Discussion and Q&A, Day 1, 16 September 2020, Question and Mary Robinson response, [10:44-13:25; 16:25-17:35]. Available at: <https://www.project-syndicate.org/videos/ps-events-the-green-recovery-day-2>, or https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YFMN2DA_NhI. It should be noted that Project Syndicate is part of the Transnational Progressive Movement's media wing and is funded by the Open Society Foundations, the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation, the MasterCard Foundation, the European Climate Foundation, the European Journalism Centre, the Children's Investment Fund Foundation, the Mohammed bin Rashid Al Maktoum Knowledge Foundation, the Heinrich Böll Stiftung, the Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung, GAM, the Google Digital News Initiative, McKinsey Global Institute, the Nature Conservancy, and the Sustainable Development Solutions Network. <https://www.project-syndicate.org/about>.

‘Build Back Better’ and I think that’s exactly right.”⁵⁷ Stiglitz was also asked if Joe Biden was ready with a green plan to implement and his response was, “very much so. ... But the commitment to the Green New Deal...it’s a whole package of policies and all these things are on the table.”⁵⁸ Despite declaring in the presidential debate on 29 September 2020 that he did not support the Green New Deal,⁵⁹ Joe Biden’s campaign platform states, “Biden believes the Green New Deal is a crucial framework for meeting the climate challenges we face.”⁶⁰ Indeed, this was pointed out by an NBC debate fact check.⁶¹ It is worthwhile at this point to examine the Biden climate plan and its alignment with the Green New Deals and Great Reset.

B. The Biden Plan

Leading the crafting of the “Biden Plan” were co-chairs John Kerry (who participated in a WEF Great Reset dialogue)⁶² and Alexandria Ocasio-Cortez along with Varshini Prakash, co-founder of the Sunrise movement.⁶³ It is true that some elements of the Green New Deal as

⁵⁷ Project Syndicate, The Green Recovery, Day 1, 16 September 2020, Question and Joe Stiglitz response, [51:22 to 53:17].

⁵⁸ Project Syndicate, The Green Recovery, Day 1, 16 September 2020, Question and Joe Stiglitz response.

⁵⁹ When asked by moderator Chris Wallace, “So, do you support the Green New Deal?” Biden replied, “No, I don’t support the Green New Deal. ... That is not my plan. The Green New Deal is not my plan.” Available at: <https://www.rev.com/blog/transcripts/donald-trump-joe-biden-1st-presidential-debate-transcript-2020>.

⁶⁰ Democratic Party, Presidential Campaign Platform for Joe Biden, “The Biden Plan for a Clean Energy Revolution and Environmental Justice.” Available at: <https://joebiden.com/climate-plan/#>.

⁶¹ NBC News, First 2020 presidential debate: Fact-checking Biden and Trump. Available at: <https://www.nbcnews.com/politics/2020-election/first-2020-presidential-debate-fact-checking-biden-trump-n1241403>.

⁶² Great Reset Dialogues, “Six leaders discuss why we must reform the social contract after COVID-19.” Available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ddGQTcuV-eg>; for the complete conversation see, <https://soundcloud.com/world-economic-forum/the-great-reset-redesigning>. John Kerry remarked in the dialogue, “This is a big moment, and the World Economic Forum ... is really going to have to play a front and center role in defining the Great Reset in a way that nobody misinterprets it as just taking us back to where we were, but preparing us to deal with global climate change with this massive inequity through globalization through the failure of the contract to protect disadvantaged people — all of which is being laid bare as a consequence of COVID-19.” 26 June 2020, [5:30-6:15].

⁶³ Tara Golshan, “Joe Biden and Bernie Sanders Reveal Names for Joint Policy Task Forces,” *Huffington Post* [online], 13 May 2020. Available at: https://www.huffingtonpost.co.uk/entry/joe-biden-bernie-sanders-climate-task-force-ocasio-cortez_n_5ebb5b87c5b6ae915a8be292?ri18n=true&guccounter=1&guce_referrer=aHR0cHM6Ly9jb25zZW50Lnlh aG9vLmNvbS92Mi9jb2xsZWN0Q29uc2VudD9zZXNzaW9uSWQ9M19jYy1zZXNzaW9uXzc1NjVlODliLWRlNj MtNGVjYS1hMzRlLWI4NzMyMTYxMjhiYQ&guce_referrer_sig=AQAAAEXj-pSasKp-1qKodEQJt9g_GZE_FJQmoWW0LiWi20LEa-0-

presented last year were left out or modified for the Biden campaign platform, such as “‘Medicare for All,’ a federal jobs guarantee and a strict zero carbon-emissions mandate,” but almost all of the rest of the proposals are included in the Biden plan including the pledge to have a 100 percent clean energy economy and net-zero by 2050.⁶⁴ Key policy proposals that are similar to the US Green New Deal include:

- invest in retrofitting buildings over four years and subsidize construction of 1.5 million energy efficient homes,
- all American electricity to be carbon free by 2035, with the economy net-zero by 2050,
- build 500,000 charging stations for electric vehicles,
- phase out the sale of fossil-fueled vehicles,
- invest in a high-speed railroad revolution and upgrade America’s railroads in general,
- promote a just transition for those who will become unemployed during the energy transition,
- invest in resiliency and clean manufacturing,
- protect biodiversity and increase soil carbon storage, and
- make the US the “world’s clean energy superpower.”⁶⁵

The point in describing the Biden Plan is to demonstrate that it is in full alignment with the Great Reset and other Green New Deals being discussed and implemented in other jurisdictions. It is also important to note that the Center for American Progress (CAP), a key part of the Transnational Progressive Movement, has significant ties to Joe Biden’s campaign and his climate change initiatives. To mobilize support, particularly youth support,⁶⁶ for the Biden Plan,

[E97xwjsErF599BuPq92zi3vztjrytVvVijA_K43mfB3snATHkAyRE4JsVPdyMYJuhJcGXECXzT-AWv_5xlnwv-NyY67DmavtO7xK888pFd3dVamlXDNnks6Xq3yx](https://www.congress.gov/bill/116th-congress/house-resolution/109/text). The climate change task force included Alexandria Ocasio-Cortez (co-chair), John Kerry (co-chair), Varshini Prakash (Sunrise movement), Catherine Flowers (Center for Rural Enterprise and Environmental Justice, Rep. Kathy Castor (D-Fla), Kerry Duggan (former Obama policy advisor), Gina McCarthy (former EPA Administrator), Rep. Donald McEachin (D-Va).

⁶⁴ Jordan Weissman, “Joe Biden is Campaigning on the Green New Deal Minus the Crazy,” *Slate* [online], 15 July 2020, <https://slate.com/business/2020/07/joe-bidens-climate-plan-is-the-green-new-deal-minus-the-crazy.html>.

⁶⁵ This is a very brief summary of the detailed, “Biden Plan for a Clean Energy Revolution and Environmental Justice,” 2020. Available at: <https://joebiden.com/climate-plan/#>. While the Biden plan adds elements pertaining to international affairs and national security that were not part of the Green New Deal, most of the elements of the Green New Deal resolution proposed by Alexandria Ocasio Cortez and others in 2019 are included in Biden’s Plan. See, H.Res.109, Recognizing the duty of the Federal Government to create a Green New Deal. Available at: <https://www.congress.gov/bill/116th-congress/house-resolution/109/text>.

⁶⁶ At the Recovery Summit, John Podesta explained how they hire a lot of young people and give them a lot of responsibility and power to help shape the program in both CAP and Climate Power 2020. Canada 2020-Global

John Podesta, founder of CAP, founded Climate Power 2020. This new group, whose advisory board includes John Kerry, John Holdren, Stacey Abrams, Gina McCarthy, Tom Steyer and others, was instrumental in getting moderator Chris Wallace, at the last minute, to add climate change to the first presidential debate.⁶⁷ The breathtaking economic and social transformation contained in the Biden Plan also serves to underscore why the potential re-election of Donald Trump is of such concern to the Transnational Progressive Movement – it will make the implementation of the Great Reset and the Great Transformation more difficult, and influence Canada’s green policy future.

III. Canada and the Great Reset

As discussed earlier, in June, Prime Minister Justin Trudeau expressed interest in designing recovery initiatives “that will support the objectives of the Great Reset.” To achieve this Great Reset an energy transition is required, and a circular economy must be implemented. This process was already underway in Canada before the pandemic, but the Government has been under great pressure from various progressive groups to accelerate this process through a directional recovery stimulus with “green strings.” That being said, what has Canada been doing so far with its recovery initiatives? Have they been tilting towards the Great Reset?

Progress, The Recovery Summit, Day 3: Sustainability, 16 September 2020, [57:11-58:08]. Available at: <https://recoveryproject.ca/content/the-recovery-summit-sustainability/>, also at <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=QrQfkzYwmkw>.

⁶⁷ Press Release, “Climate Finally Got a Debate Question. Trump Used it to Prove He’s a Climate Denier,” Climate Power 2020, 30 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.climatepower2020.org/resources/climate-must-be-centerpiece-of-debates/>. See also, Versha Sharma, “Climate Change Finally Came Up At A Debate, And Trump Talked About ‘Dead Trees’ And ‘Immaculate Air’,” Now this is News, 30 September 2020. Available at: <https://nowthisnews.com/politics/climate-change-finally-came-up-at-a-debate-and-trump-talked-about-dead-trees-and>.

In August 2020, Prime Minister Trudeau appointed Chrystia Freeland, a member of the World Economic Forum Board of Trustees, as Canada’s new Finance Minister.⁶⁸ In the run-up towards the Throne Speech of September 2020, where the government would announce its policy direction or goals for the next legislative session, newly minted Finance Minister Chrystia Freeland assured Canadians that decarbonization was going to be part of the economic plan and that “the restart of our economy needs to be green.”⁶⁹ Freeland’s comments aroused some concern amongst certain segments of Canadian society, particularly those in Western Canada worried about what that would mean for the petroleum industry. There was a great deal of speculation and anticipation about the potential for a recovery rooted in climate change initiatives. Rather than stating that goal directly, however, the much anticipated Throne Speech titled, *A Stronger More Resilient Canada*, was cleverly crafted to downplay the green recovery theme, while signaling its commitment to “build back better.”⁷⁰ Some key elements of the Throne Speech related to the Great Reset and climate change are as follows (the ones in bold were addressed in subsequent spending announcements):

- commitment to tax extreme wealth inequality,
- legislate the goal of net-zero by 2050,
- **retrofit homes and businesses,**
- **fund more transit facilities,**
- **make electric vehicles more affordable,**
- **increase the number of charging stations,**
- **fund investments in clean technology,**
- **maintain the carbon tax,**

⁶⁸ World Economic Forum, News Release, “World Economic Forum Appoints Two New Members to Board of Trustees,” 24 January 2020. Available at: <https://www.weforum.org/press/2020/01/world-economic-forum-appoints-two-new-members-to-board-of-trustees/>. As of January 2020, there were 29 Board of Trustees members. Notable members include Mark Carney, Kristalina Georgieva, Christine Lagarde, Al Gore, Larry Fink, Marc Benioff, Angel Gurría, Jack Ma, Luis Moreno, and of course Klaus Schwab.

⁶⁹ Mitchell Beer, “Freeland and Carney may be Canada’s Last, Best Chance for a Green Recovery,” *Policy Options* [online], 25 August 2020, <https://policyoptions.irpp.org/magazines/august-2020/freeland-and-carney-may-be-canadas-last-best-chance-for-a-green-recovery/>.

⁷⁰ Government of Canada, Speech from the Throne, *A Stronger More Resilient Canada* (Ottawa: Library and Archives Canada, 28 September 2020), 16. https://www.canada.ca/content/dam/pco-bcp/documents/pm/SFT_2020_EN_WEB.pdf.

- **set aside 25 percent of land and 25 percent of oceans in five years,**
- **ban single-use plastics,** and
- modernize the Environmental Protection Act.⁷¹

Even though there has yet to be a budget or a financial/economic update since the onset of the coronavirus pandemic, within days of the Throne Speech a spate of green spending programmes, aligned with suggestions from the Task Force for a Resilient Recovery, and the Transnational Progressive Movement’s various Green New Deals, were announced. The first announcement was the \$10 Billion for the Canada Infrastructure Bank to fund various green initiatives: \$1.5 billion for zero-emission buses, \$2.5 billion for clean power (interprovincial interconnections, clean power, and storage), \$2 billion for retrofitting buildings and large real estate owners, \$2 billion for large scale broadband, \$2 billion for “transformative agriculture infrastructure projects.”⁷² In a separate announcement, in a joint initiative with the government of Ontario, the federal government committed \$295 million to Ford Canada to build electric vehicles from their plant in Oakville, Ontario.⁷³ The federal government is also offering a \$5,000 rebate for electric vehicle purchases. On 7 October 2020, Environment and Climate Change Canada (ECCC) Minister Jonathan Wilkinson, citing the actions of the EU and the UK, announced a ban on six types of single use plastics beginning in 2021, “plastic checkout bags, straws, stir sticks, six-pack rings, cutlery, and food-ware made from hard-to-recycle plastics.”⁷⁴ All of these spending priorities were identified in the Resilient Recovery report, which are all in

⁷¹ Speech from the Throne, *A Stronger More Resilient Canada*.

⁷² Canada Infrastructure Bank, “Growth Plan: \$10 billion,” 1 October 2020. Available at: <https://cib-bic.ca/en/growth-plan/>. See also, <https://cib-bic.ca/wp-content/uploads/2020/10/Summary-of-the-CIB-Growth-Plan.pdf>.

⁷³ Paola Loriggio, “Feds, Ontario commit \$295M each to electric vehicle production at Oakville Ford plant,” *National Observer* [online], 8 October 2020. Available at: <https://www.nationalobserver.com/2020/10/08/news/feds-ontario-commit-295m-each-electric-vehicle-production-oakville-ford-plant>.

⁷⁴ “Federal government to ban six disposable plastic products,” *The Globe and Mail*, 8 October 2020. Available at: <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/canada/video-federal-government-to-ban-six-disposable-plastic-products/>.

alignment with other Green New Deal type programmes like that of the EU Green Deal, Joe Biden’s platform, and the Great Reset.

Furthermore, in the fall of 2020, the Trudeau government plans to introduce proposed regulations for a comprehensive Clean Fuel Standard in the *Canada Gazette* with a 75-day comment period. Critics suggest that it will increase the cost of fuel upwards of 11 cents per litre, and apply to “companies that produce all forms of fuel.”⁷⁵ A lifecycle assessment model, inspired in part by the EU’s Fuel Quality Directive, is being developed to “determine the carbon intensity of the various fuels produced in and imported into Canada.”⁷⁶ As highlighted by the department of Environment and Climate Change Canada, the intent is to make it complementary with the carbon price, not replace it, meaning a significant increase in fuel prices perhaps with the hope of curbing demand.

One last notable element that signals Canada’s commitment to the Great Reset is the preparation being done to move Canada towards a circular economy. ECCC Minister Wilkinson

⁷⁵ David Staples, “Yet Another Trudeau fuel tax will mean 22 cents per litre carbon tax at the pumps,” *Edmonton Journal* [online], 7 October 2020. Available at: <https://edmontonjournal.com/new/national/david-staples-yet-another-trudeau-fuel-tax-will-mean-22-cents-per-litre-carbon-tax-at-the-pumps>. It is unclear if the federal government is planning on introducing legislation that will mandate emissions reductions, provincial and individual carbon budgets, and a means of accounting for mandated reductions. The government may choose to support current Bloc Quebecois (<https://parl.ca/LegisInfo/BillDetails.aspx?Language=E&billId=10866095>) and NDP private members’ bills (<https://parl.ca/LegisInfo/BillDetails.aspx?Language=E&billId=10866248>) for a Climate Accountability Act or it may introduce its own legislation. A group of six NGOs put together a policy brief in May 2020 outlining the legal foundation for such an Act, Julia Croome, “A New Canadian Climate Accountability Act,” <https://d36rd3gki5z3d3.cloudfront.net/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/Policy-Brief-New-Canadian-Climate-Accountability-Act-English.pdf?x23746>. This was followed up by a commentary in *Policy Options* in September 2020, Julia Croome, “Canada Needs a World-Class Climate Law,” *Policy Options* [online], 9 September 2020, <https://policyoptions.irpp.org/magazines/september-2020/canada-needs-a-world-class-climate-law/>. In addition, the Environment Funders Canada suggests that foundations ought to direct funding to such an initiative as one of its “cross-cutting levers”, Dunsky Energy Consultants, “Building Canada’s Low Carbon Future: Opportunities for the Philanthropic Sector,” Prepared for Environment Funders Canada, September 2020, 20. Available at: <https://environmentfunders.ca/wp-content/uploads/2020/10/EFCLowCarbonFutureReport-September2020-FINAL.pdf>.

⁷⁶ Government of Canada, Environment and Climate Change Canada, Clean Fuel Standard. Available at: <https://www.canada.ca/en/environment-climate-change/services/managing-pollution/energy-production/fuel-regulations/clean-fuel-standard.html>. See also, Mark Cauchi, “Clean Fuel Standard: Discussion Paper,” Environment and Climate Change Canada, February 2017. Available at: <https://www.canada.ca/en/environment-climate-change/services/canadian-environmental-protection-act-registry/clean-fuel-standard-discussion-paper.html>.

will be hosting the “Circular North America” side event in November 2020 as a prelude to hosting the World Circular Economy Forum in 2021.⁷⁷ The Ellen MacArthur Foundation, a member of the Club of Rome and influential in shaping the EU’s circular economy component of the EU Green Deal, is an organizing partner for the Canadian event. Although the Canadian government has not announced or publicized that it intends to follow the path of a circular economy, as one news article pointed out, Minister Wilkinson affirmed in his announcement on the ban of certain single-use plastics that once plastics are under control other segments of society will follow a “transition to a circular economy.”⁷⁸ The UN Under-Secretary General and Executive Director for the Environmental Program, Inger Andersen, praised Wilkinson at a recent meeting, thanking him for Canada’s commitment to building momentum for embracing the circular economy in North America to aid the global green recovery.⁷⁹

While these initiatives are in alignment with the Great Reset, there are some that seem to contradict the goal of decarbonization and a net-zero economy. On 25 September 2020, the Canadian government announced \$320 million for the Atlantic offshore workers, on top of the \$75 million given in April to lower offshore emissions, to support “activities such as safety improvements, maintenance and upgrades of existing facilities, and research and development.”⁸⁰ There has been no further assistance for the western Canadian petroleum

⁷⁷ Government of Canada, “Circular North America: A World Circular Economy Forum Side Event.” Available at: <https://www.canada.ca/en/services/environment/conservation/sustainability/circular-economy/circular-north-america.html?wbdisable=true>.

⁷⁸ Terence Corcoran, “Circular Central Planning,” *Financial Post* [online], 9 October 2020. Available at: <https://financialpost.com/opinion/terence-corcoran-circular-central-planning>. See also Government of Canada, “Canada’s Plastics Agenda.” Available at: <https://www.canada.ca/en/environment-climate-change/services/science-technology/canada-science-plastic-agenda.html#toc10>.

⁷⁹ Inger Andersen, “North America and the Circularity Transition,” Plenary of the World Circular Economy Forum, Journey to a circular economy in the Canada-US region, 29 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.unenvironment.org/news-and-stories/speech/north-america-and-circularity-transition>.

⁸⁰ Government of Canada, Department of Finance News Release, “Government of Canada supports Newfoundland and Labrador’s Offshore Energy Sector Workers,” 25 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.canada.ca/en/department-finance/news/2020/09/government-of-canada-supports-newfoundland-and-labradors-offshore-energy-sector-workers.html>. See also, CBC, “Feds write cheque for \$320M to support workers,

industry since the announced funding in April 2020 for orphan/inactive well cleanup and an Emissions Reduction Fund, with a focus particularly on methane, to help reduce emissions in the petroleum sector. In addition, earlier in June 2020, an exemption from the onerous Impact Assessment Act was granted to the Atlantic offshore exploratory drilling operations.⁸¹ In an interview with Anne McClellan for the Canada 2020-Global Progress Recovery Project, Minister for Natural Resources, Seamus O'Regan, who also happens to represent Newfoundland, praised the streamlining of the regulatory process so that instead of going through years of assessment, as the western Canadian energy projects must, the environmental impact reviews of Atlantic offshore projects can now be completed within 90 days.⁸² While it may seem that this exemption contradicts the aims of the Great Reset, or Great Transformation to a net-zero economy, the reality is that some fossil fuels will be necessary in the short to mid-term and the preference, it would seem, is that this will predominantly come from outside of Alberta, outside of the oilsands. Evidence for this can be found, not only in the lack of assistance for the western Canadian petroleum industry, but also in the delay in Cabinet approval of a proposed natural gas pipeline loop between Northern Alberta and Northern B.C. After two years of consultation with indigenous communities and environmental assessments to twin an existing pipeline, the decision was delayed by the Cabinet to allow for further consultation with indigenous

lower emissions for N.L.'s struggling offshore," 25 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/newfoundland-labrador/offshore-announcement-o-regan-furey-1.5738954>. The CBC news report suggested there is some indication that the Federal Government is in negotiations to purchase an equity share in the stalled Husky White Rose offshore project.

⁸¹ Sander Duncanson, Tommy Gelbman, Simon C. Baines, Jan Nitoslawski, "Regulation for offshore drilling creates welcome efficiencies under the Impact Assessment Act," Osler [online], 11 June 2020. Available at: https://www.osler.com/en/resources/regulations/2020/regulation-for-offshore-drilling-creates-welcome-efficiencies-under-the-impact-assessment-act?utm_source=Mondaq&utm_medium=syndication&utm_campaign=LinkedIn-integration.

⁸² Anne McClellan interview with Seamus O'Regan, "Canada's Energy Future," The Recovery Project, 9 June 2020. Available at: <https://recoveryproject.ca/content/canadas-energy-future-in-conversation-with-minister-seamus-oregan/>.

communities along the route. A further Cabinet decision is due by the end of October 2020, but the company announced even if the project is approved construction will be delayed by another year.⁸³ While it is unclear what sources will provide the Cabinet with recommendations or advice on which they will base their decision, as will be shown in the next section, there seems to be evidence that progressive external sources are having considerable influence on Canada's recovery planning.

IV. Task Forces and Summits – Planning for Recovery

Even though the Canadian Federal Government has a large and experienced civil service to develop and provide public policies, the Liberal party in power, emulating the EU and its expert advisory panels, has a penchant for external sources of progressive policy advice. One aspect of the Transnational Progressive Movement is its proficiency in organizing and pulling together networks of academics, think tanks, politicians, businesses, civil society, and media; thus, there is no shortage of advice for how the Canadian government ought to assist and transform the economy it forced to shut down.⁸⁴ Although there have been a few non-progressive oriented task forces and reports, like the Task Force for Real Jobs, Real Recovery,⁸⁵ the Alberta

⁸³ Ron Wallace, "Ottawa's delay of Alberta's gas pipeline: Building back slower," *Financial Post*, 8 October 2020. Available at: <https://www.msn.com/en-ca/money/topstories/opinion-ottawas-delay-of-alberta-s-gas-pipeline-building-back-slower/ar-BB1a1RJB>.

⁸⁴ Adam Radwanski, "The pressure's on for Trudeau to use COVID-19 relief to fight climate change. But how?" *The Globe and Mail* [online], 19 May 2020. Available at: <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/business/article-the-pressures-on-for-trudeau-to-use-COVID-19-relief-to-fight-climate/>. See for example, Vanessa Corkal, Philip Gass, and Aaron Cosbey, "Green Strings: Principles and Conditions for a Green Recovery from COVID-19 in Canada," International Institute for Sustainable Development, June 2020. Available at:

<https://www.iisd.org/system/files/2020-07/green-strings-COVID-19-canada-en.pdf>; Friends of the Earth International, "Principles for a Just Recovery," August 2020. Available at: https://www.foei.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/08/FoEI_just_recovery_principles_english.pdf; and CANRac, Ecojustice, Environmental Defence, Équiterre, Pembina Institute, and West Coast Environmental Law, "Policy Brief: A New Canadian Climate Accountability Act: Building the Legal Foundation to Achieve Net-Zero Emissions by 2050," May 2020. Available at: <https://d36rd3gki5z3d3.cloudfront.net/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/Policy-Brief-New-Canadian-Climate-Accountability-Act-English.pdf?x23746>, and also a longer version. Available at: <https://www.ecojustice.ca/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/A-New-Canadian-Climate-Accountability-Act-Detailed-Report-1.pdf>.

⁸⁵ <https://realrecovery.ca>.

Economic Recovery Council,⁸⁶ and the Canadian Taxpayers Federation Road to Recovery Framework,⁸⁷ these received little national coverage and, given the Throne Speech and spending announcements so far, are unlikely to have influence on the policies of the federal Liberal government. In contrast, there have been several progressive task forces and reports circulating very similar ideas about a Marshall Plan, New Deal, Moonshot-style comprehensive economic and social restructuring; however, the focus here will be on those more likely to have an influence on how Canada moves forward. With the involvement of various Canadian Cabinet ministers in the Task Force for a Resilient Recovery⁸⁸ and the Canada 2020-Global Progress Recovery Project and Summit,⁸⁹ it is likely that more of those ideas and proposals will be incorporated into the forthcoming federal policies along with the initiatives already announced in and immediately after the Throne Speech as discussed in the previous section. Additionally, this section will also briefly explore a little more closely the potential influence of Mark Carney, who has been called on to informally advise Prime Minister Justin Trudeau on the direction of Canada's economic recovery.

A. Task Force for a Resilient Recovery

In May 2020, a mix of fifteen progressives – environmental NGOs, consultants, academics, former government officials and others – formed an independent task force to advise the Canadian federal government on a post-COVID recovery spending plan. One key member who sparked a great deal of interest was Gerald Butts, long-time friend, and former Chief of Staff to Prime Minister Justin Trudeau. Another panel of eleven progressive expert advisors from an array of think tanks, two from the financial services industry, and one academic were also part

⁸⁶ <https://www.alberta.ca/economic-recovery-council.aspx>.

⁸⁷ [http://www.taxpayer.com/media/Road percent20to percent20recovery percent20FINAL.pdf](http://www.taxpayer.com/media/Road%20to%20recovery%20FINAL.pdf).

⁸⁸ <https://www.recoverytaskforce.ca>.

⁸⁹ <https://recoveryproject.ca>, and <https://recoveryproject.ca/the-recovery-summit/>; see also, <https://canada2020.ca>.

of the team. The task force received funding from five Canadian foundations, with individuals from some of the foundations included as members or advisors. There were also a number of different partner organizations, most from the sustainability field, such as the Transition Accelerator, Smart Prosperity Institute, International Institute for Sustainable Development, Efficiency Canada, Clean Energy Canada, Insurance Bureau of Canada, and Ivey Foundation. All of these different partner organizations contributed various white papers and research reports to support a comprehensive green economy shift – instead of calling it a Green New Deal it is called Bold Moves for a Resilient Recovery.

Another partner organization that made a large contribution to the Task Force for a Resilient Recovery final report was Corporate Knights, a progressive business group that publishes a quarterly magazine insert for *The Globe and Mail*. It ran a series of seven “Building Back Better” roundtables covering different aspects of a green recovery. The roundtables were hosted by Diana Fox Carney, the wife of Mark Carney, and included the participation of some Cabinet Ministers like Catherine McKenna, Jonathan Wilkinson and Seamus O’Regan, ENGOS like the WWF, academics like Chris Bataille, activists like Tzeporah Berman, think tank analysts, and union representatives, but with very few voices from business.⁹⁰ At the end of the roundtables, a synthesis report was written and signed by many corporate leaders, most of whom did not participate in the events, and then sent to then Finance Minister Bill Morneau.⁹¹ The

⁹⁰ Corporate Knights TV Event Schedule: Building Back Better roundtable dates, Planning for a Green Recovery, 18 April 2020. Available at: <https://www.corporateknights.com/channels/climate-and-carbon/corporate-knights-presents-recovering-strong-green-renovation-wave-15872033/>. Coincidentally, Sean Mullin, co-founder of Brookfield Institute for Innovation and Entrepreneurship participated in the opening roundtable. The Brookfield Institute was co-founded by Jack Cockwell who heads up the Brookfield Foundation and is on the board of directors of Brookfield Asset Management that just hired Mark Carney to guide them through taking advantage of new green investment rule changes that Carney is helping to create. One panel included the participation of Suncor’s Mark Little.

⁹¹ Ralph Torrie, Celine Bak, Toby Heaps, “Building Back Better with a Bold Green Recovery,” June 2020. Available at: https://www.corporateknights.com/wp-content/uploads/2020/09/2020-09-14-Building-Back-Better-with-a-Bold-Green-Recovery_FINAL_enfr.pdf.

synthesis report outlined detailed recommendations on how to spend federal money in the following seven programme areas:

- deep retrofits of homes and workplaces,
- accelerated electric vehicle (EV) uptake,
- support for active mobility (e.g. walking and biking),
- greening of the electricity grid,
- decarbonizing of heavy industry,
- nature-based climate solutions for our forests and farmland, and
- making Canada a leading supplier of EV components and zero-carbon natural resources.⁹²

One recommendation of note: in the “greening of the electricity grid” the authors proposed to make Canada’s entire grid carbon free by investing in intraprovincial grid infrastructure that would see exponential growth in solar and wind farms across Alberta and Saskatchewan to replace their natural gas and coal electricity plants.⁹³ These recommendations, along with the proposals from all of the other contributing partners, were then distilled down to five in the final report of the Task Force outlining the “Bold Moves for a Resilient Recovery.” The five bold moves from the Task Force are as follows, with those that are highlighted in bold italics represented in the Throne Speech and spending announcements:

- ***Invest in climate resilient and energy efficient buildings,***
 - ***Expand public-private financing facilities for building retrofits,***
 - Expand existing provincial and municipal building retrofit programs, enhancing energy efficiency and climate resiliency,
 - Train a diverse green building workforce,
 - ***Demonstrate large-scale standardized retrofits,***
 - Work with provinces to ensure that new buildings meet stringent net-zero and resilience codes, and that a newly developed ‘ResiliGuide’ rating system can enable the financial sector to incent building resilience,
 - Create an Indigenous Infrastructure Fund,
- ***Jumpstart Canada’s production and adoption of zero-emission vehicles,***
 - ***Support the development of the Canadian ZEV industrial ecosystem,***
 - Introduce a phased in ZEV mandate for all vehicle classes,

⁹² Torrie, Bak, and Heaps, “Building Back Better with a Bold Green Recovery,” 6.

⁹³ Torrie, Bak and Heaps, “Building Back Better,” 30-31. The authors also make the claim that all of the different energy efficiency measures will reduce overall energy consumption even though transportation will be converted from hydrocarbons to electricity.

- *Kickstart the adoption of ZEVs across Canada,*
- *Accelerate the installation of EV charging infrastructure across Canada*
- ***Go big on growing Canada’s clean energy sectors,***
 - *Accelerate investments in clean, robust power grids,*
 - *Support Canada’s next-generation energy solutions,*
 - Catalyze and support national Indigenous clean energy action platforms,
 - Support Canadian leadership in an emerging low-carbon hydrogen economy,
- ***Invest in the nature that protects and sustains us,***
 - *Invest in natural infrastructure,*
 - Accelerate global leadership in conservation and support Indigenous reconciliation,
 - *Grow financing for nature-based services,*
 - Grow and train the workforce for ecosystem restoration, monitoring and management, and nature tourism,
- ***Grow clean competitiveness and jobs across the Canadian economy.***
 - Develop clean competitiveness roadmaps, capital strategies and action plans for key sectors,
 - Invest in advanced skills and infrastructure,
 - *Accelerate the production and adoption of clean technologies across the economy,*
 - Increase the fairness of climate action.⁹⁴

Each “bold move” contains a number of recommendations on how to implement the proposed policy changes, similar actions in other jurisdictions, how much and where to direct massive amounts of federal funding. Even though the spending amounts were lower in the government announcements than what was recommended by the task force, every main climate change point made in the Throne Speech and in the spending and policy announcements made to date, were reflected in the reports, which are highlighted above. Some bear a striking resemblance to the disastrous Ontario Green Energy Act, which Gerald Butts and Bruce Lourie (both task force members) helped to create. Without getting into the details of every recommendation, it is useful to point out that the proposals suggest that the federal government will have to mandate provincial cooperation by withholding federal infrastructure money if a province or territory does not “have in place an infrastructure system plan to build a low carbon economy.”⁹⁵ Of interest,

⁹⁴ Task Force for a Resilient Recovery, “Bridge to the Future,” 9-51.

⁹⁵ Task Force for a Resilient Recovery, “Bridge to the Future,” 48.

both reports refer positively to international initiatives to facilitate the energy transition and green the global economy, and the European Green Deal in particular, as examples for Canada to follow in its proposed decarbonization and green recovery efforts. While the Task Force for a Resilient Recovery focused on policy recommendations for a national green recovery response that would accelerate the energy transition and the Great Reset, another progressive organization, Canada 2020, with ties to the Liberal Party, offered a forum for broader ideas on how to facilitate not only a green recovery but transnational progressive cooperation to cultivate a fundamental transformation of the Canadian and global society.

B. Canada 2020-Global Progress Recovery Project and Recovery Summit

Canada 2020, founded in 2006 after the Liberals faced a crushing defeat in that year's federal election, was created as a space for discussion of progressive ideas and a progressive infrastructure outside of a political party that would eventually be incorporated into the Liberal party.⁹⁶ The organization was involved with Justin Trudeau's campaign, and is currently headed by Trudeau's personal friend Thomas Pitfield who also ran the Liberal Party's digital strategy in the 2015 election.⁹⁷ Canada 2020 defines itself as "Canada's leading independent progressive think tank. An active member of the Global Progress network, Canada 2020's goal is to build a community of progressive ideas and people that will move and shape governments."⁹⁸ The Global Progress network was founded by John Podesta with the aid of the Open Society Foundation, as a global offshoot of the Center for American Progress to bring together progressives from around the world to cooperate in fulfilling the goals of the Transnational

⁹⁶ Alex Paterson, "Q&A: Canada 2020's Founders, 10 Years Later," Canada 2020, 14 June 2016. Available at: <https://Canada2020.ca/2020-q-and-a-founders/>.

⁹⁷ Anne Kingston, "Inside the 'progressive' think tank that really runs Canada: How a small think tank called Canada 2020 gave rise to Justin Trudeau and became the country's new nexus of power," *Maclean's* [online], 12 October 2017. Available at: <https://www.macleans.ca/politics/ottawa/inside-the-progressive-think-tank-that-really-runs-canada/>.

⁹⁸ <https://canada2020.ca/about/>.

Progressive Movement.⁹⁹ Together, Canada 2020 and Global Progress launched the Recovery Project and the Recovery Summit in April and September 2020 respectively.

The Recovery Project was established as “an initiative designed to start conversations around social and economic recovery from COVID-19.”¹⁰⁰ The project intended to inform and shape Canadian policy options within an international context, therefore several of the participants were from abroad and offered an international perspective on ideas for recovery. Where the Task Force for a Resilient Recovery was focused on a green recovery, the Recovery Project had a broader scope of an entire societal as well as economic transformation. Bringing together representatives from government, academia, international organizations, and think tanks, it covered five key themes: shared prosperity, democratic institutions, sustainability, global public health, and inclusive societies.¹⁰¹ These “conversations” included brief written analyses, livestream broadcasts, and podcasts all collated and available on the Recovery Project website. Like the Task Force for a Resilient Recovery, some key Canadian Cabinet Ministers participated in the conversations about how to Build Back Better, along with an assortment of former federal and provincial leaders, representatives from think tanks and institutes, numerous international progressives, and others.¹⁰²

⁹⁹ One journalist suggests that Canada 2020 became the Center for American Progress’s Canadian hub. See, Kingston, “Inside the ‘progressive’ think tank that really runs Canada.”

¹⁰⁰ <https://recoveryproject.ca/about/>. Between its launch on 6 April and the end of September there were 34 podcasts and 17 livestreams.

¹⁰¹ The descriptive blurb about the project included “business” as one of the representative groups participating in the conversations, but the only “businesses” involved were a person from the Calgary Chamber of Commerce and two different indigenous business groups. Actual businesses did not participate.

¹⁰² Some participants over the months of dialogues included Tiff Maclem (Governor of the Bank of Canada), Heather Scofield (Toronto Star), Anne MacLellan (Board of Canada 2020 former Liberal Cabinet Minister), Alison Redford (former Alberta Premier), Gordon Campbell (former BC premier), Seamus O’Regan (Minister Natural Resources Canada), Catherine McKenna (Minister of Infrastructure), Matt Browne (Global Progress), Dawn Nakagawa (Berggruen Institute), Heather Boushey (Washington Center for Equitable Growth), David Miliband (President & CEO of the International Rescue Committee and former leader of UK Labour Party), Helle Thorning-Schmidt (former Danish Prime Minister, member Facebook oversight board; Berggruen Institute), Mary Robinson (former President of Ireland), and Stéphane Dion (Canada’s Ambassador to Germany and Canada’s Special Envoy to the European Union and Europe), to name some of the more than 70 participants.

While the Recovery Project spanned many different areas such as democratic institutions, inclusivity and global public health, the most instructive area for this supplemental report is sustainability and Canada’s energy future. In the summary of the various dialogues or conversations that discussed sustainability and the energy transition it was suggested that “climate change may very well be the next global emergency, and that when threats arise, political responses follow.” However, in Canada, a green recovery was likely to be a polarizing issue. Therefore, it was important for progressives to develop language “that transcends ideological lines,” while at the same time forming collaborations “between people from all political backgrounds, including academics, governments, and the private sector [that] can create forums for ongoing dialogue to create revolutionary change.” As with the Task Force for a Resilient Recovery, the policy prescriptions for a green recovery included,

investment in clean physical infrastructure, building efficiency retrofits, investment in education and training, natural capital investment and clean R&D. Policymakers would be wise to consult guidelines such as the **Green Economy Principles of wellbeing, justice, sufficiency and efficiency** when considering their plans. [emphasis added]¹⁰³

Other recommendations included “flexible work and work-from-home arrangements, increased localization and self-sufficiency,” and initiatives that would reduce skepticism in multilateralism and “coordinated global action.”¹⁰⁴ The summary concluded with some important observations of what progressives see as the benefits of the pandemic and the role of fossil fuels in the future of the economy, and is worth quoting at length:

The pandemic may also present an opportunity to move away from the use of fossil fuels **as there will likely be a decrease in all forms of transportation in the future....**Fossil fuels continue to be taxed below adequate levels or subsidized, **which continues to undercut the ability of renewables to be competitive.** ... it will be essential to maintain

¹⁰³ The Institute of Fiscal Studies and Democracy (IFSD), “The Recovery Project: Sustainability and COVID-19 Summary,” 3 September 2020, 2. Available at: <https://recoveryproject.ca/content/sustainability-and-covid-19/>.

¹⁰⁴ IFSD, “The Recovery Project: Sustainability and COVID-19 Summary,” 3.

environmental regulation and to provide support for industries contingent on environmental improvements. [emphasis added]¹⁰⁵

While the summary provides a good overview of the various conversations and brief reports, a significant conversation worth examining that illustrates the thinking of the Canadian government is Anne McClellan's interview of Minister of Natural Resources Seamus O'Regan.

In the interview, O'Regan was adamant that net-zero was going to happen in Canada and that there would not "be a future for our oil and gas industry unless we commit to net-zero." He explained that Mark Carney's determination to green the financial industry is becoming mainstream, which means if a company does not have a plan for addressing climate change or helping to reach net-zero, then investors do not want to commit, and Canadian oil becomes a box to tick for investors as non-compliant.¹⁰⁶ O'Regan explained, "the future that is confronting our oil and gas industry, as Mark Carney was saying, they see where the investment dollars are flowing, and if you do not change, the investment will not flow." Both agreed that Canada is pursuing a fundamental transformation of the energy sector not seen since the beginning of the Industrial Revolution and the creation of the internal combustion engine. But in order to see the transformation through, it is absolutely necessary to harness the collective will for change and get "buy-in" from as many people as possible. Despite concerns about the government making the "correct investments that work for people and will ultimately work to help us achieve our 2030, 2050 goals," O'Regan championed the idea to increase the number of EV charging stations, retrofitting commercial and residential buildings, carbon capture, hydrogen research, small nuclear reactor research, and new electrical grids, concluding that the great thing about alternative energy is that it is so labour intensive. In the end, O'Regan concluded that there is a

¹⁰⁵ IFSD, "The Recovery Project: Sustainability and COVID-19 Summary," 3.

¹⁰⁶ O'Regan also mentioned that the government of Newfoundland had committed to net-zero. Perhaps this helps explain why the Atlantic offshore received additional federal assistance.

role for the marketplace but “that doesn’t mean government doesn’t have a huge role; they can make significant investments, incent [sic], and regulate.” But, most importantly, “we need collective will coming out of this so that every region of the country is included in the answers to this.” McClellan added, “so much is premised on what governments do with their recovery plans: what they incent [sic], what they provide disincentives for, how they see their mix of energy, are they investing in infrastructure that’s carbon capture and storage, hydrogen economy, renewables, and everybody’s waiting to see what the world’s recovery plans will look like because it will tell us a lot about what the future of energy will look like.” It is clear from this discussion that early on the Canadian federal government already had in mind the sort of recovery plan it wanted that is aligned with the progressive plans circulating in other countries. This makes it difficult to ascertain or assess the level of influence of the Task Forces since the Liberal government clearly believes the same things. Perhaps then the purpose of these task forces and projects was to provide affirmation of the policy direction, intellectual legitimation from the academic participants for specific policies, and a perception for the public that there is momentum for transformation, not just in Canada from many different quarters, but globally.

Although many different international figures participated in the Recovery Project, the global nature of this endeavour is most evident in the Recovery Summit. The Recovery Summit evolved, or was “born out of the Recovery Project,” as a way to form a global political coalition to advance progressive aims. It describes itself as “a network of think tanks and research institutes designed to start the conversation about post-pandemic recovery. Held in advance of the UN General Assembly in September, the Summit was an opportunity to platform big ideas for a **coordinated, progressive global recovery effort** [emphasis added].”¹⁰⁷ It is notable that

¹⁰⁷ <https://recoveryproject.ca/the-recovery-summit/>.

the Canada 2020-Global Progress Recovery Summit, held in September 2020, welcomed many high profile European and American progressives to discuss with Canadian progressives, including some cabinet ministers on how to help Canada and the world “Build Back Better.”¹⁰⁸

The purpose of the Recovery Summit was to engage with global leaders so that Canada could learn from what progressives in other countries were doing, discuss the challenges facing the Great Reset, and explore how to “build a political coalition to advance these ideas.”¹⁰⁹ The summary report of the Summit is rather anodyne and does not reflect the tone and deliberations of progressive global developments that were discussed in the virtual panels. Therefore, it is important to highlight some of the key points and observations made during the discussions in order to get a better sense of the thinking and motivation behind the Transnational Progressive Movement and the Great Reset, and how this informs Canada’s approach in the issues of opportunity, whole system change, and working towards a global green new deal through similar coordinated national initiatives. Although there were five main themes, these have been distilled to three leitmotifs: opportunity for transformation, democracy and governance, and sustainability.

There was agreement throughout the summit that the pandemic has created a once in a generation opportunity for people to want a stronger federal response, like in the Great Depression, and progressives need to capitalize on the public’s shift away from viewing

¹⁰⁸ An example of participants include for Europe: Frans Timmermans (the first VP of the EU responsible for the Green Deal), Helle Thorning-Schmidt (former Prime Minister of Denmark), Miguel Matos (Socialist MP for Lisbon, Portugal), Sandro Gozi (Member of European Parliament, France and Renew Europe), Sadiq Khan (Mayor of London, UK); and for America: Neera Tanden (the President of the Center for American Progress), John Podesta (founder Center for American Progress), Lori Lightfoot (Mayor of Chicago), Dawn Nakagawa and Nils Gilman (Berggruen Institute), Heather Boushey (Washington Center for Equitable Growth), and Matt Browne, (Founder, Global Progress and Senior Fellow, Center for American Progress).

¹⁰⁹ Canada 2020-Global Progress, Recovery Summit, Day 1, Session 1: Shaping a Progressive Response: The Challenge Ahead, Matt Browne, 14 September 2020. Available at: <https://recoveryproject.ca/the-recovery-summit/>.

government as part of the problem to introduce comprehensive systemic restructuring. The problem globally is that there is an absence of global leadership; the participants believed that the US under President Trump had not been helpful. When discussing the international situation, Gerry Butts contended that the post-WWII institutions “need renovation; the world they were invented to structure and govern doesn’t exist anymore. We need to invent our way out of this.”¹¹⁰ This point was echoed throughout the various discussions over the course of the four day summit. One UN official suggested it was important to not let this opportunity of global uncertainty go to waste,

We don’t have enough opportunities like this to turn this terrible event that can catalyze, transform, and change us in the way we want to be. Global institutions are in a position to change; we need to take advantage of the shock, take an opportunity to change how we run things. The global governance system wasn’t fit for purpose in an interdependent world; we need new ideas, science and research, in order to make better changes.¹¹¹

Some of the participants suggested that in order to move forward and make changes to the global framework financing was needed, government sponsorship and philanthropy were not enough, and a global taxation system was proposed. Dr. James Orbinski concluded with the statement, “This is a pivot point: we can’t go back, but to go forward meaningfully, we need new practices.”¹¹²

The desire for new practices did not just include transnational institutions, but the very way in which national democracies functioned. Dawn Nakagawa, explaining a recent report by the Berggruen Institute, argued the problem was how to build an informed citizenry that can be

¹¹⁰ Canada 2020-Global Progress, Recovery Summit, Day 1, Session 1: Shaping a Progressive Response: The Challenge Ahead, Gerry Butts, 14 September 2020. Available at: <https://recoveryproject.ca/the-recovery-summit/>.

¹¹¹ Canada 2020-Global Progress, Recovery Summit, Day 1, Session 2: Global Public Health, Steven Hoffman, 14 September 2020. Available at: <https://recoveryproject.ca/the-recovery-summit/>.

¹¹² Canada 2020-Global Progress, Recovery Summit, Day 1, Session 2: Global Public Health, Ilona Kickbusch and Dr. James Orbinski, 14 September 2020. Available at: <https://recoveryproject.ca/the-recovery-summit/>.

forward looking and form solutions understanding that sometimes trade-offs are necessary for the greater good. She also suggested that institutional reform was necessary to broadly include citizens in the process, particularly the youth, so that people will feel like they are participating in and contributing to the decisions. Helle Thorning-Schmidt, former Prime Minister of Denmark, suggested that the increase in protests and social media groups indicates that democracy is not delivering on things people care about. She warned that if institutions do not change and find new ways for the public to participate it will be hard for democracy to survive, especially among younger generations.¹¹³ Frans Timmermans, speaking of the youth mobilized for climate change said, “We need to give youth a place where their idealism can be made concrete.... Volunteers that can act in other crises --pandemic or climate crisis – **so let’s embolden, weaponize, in fact, our younger generation to do this** [emphasis added].”¹¹⁴ Some supported the idea of citizen assemblies, as they have been trialled on certain issues, particularly climate change, in Ireland, France, and the UK. Klaus Schwab of the WEF is also an advocate for stakeholder or citizen assemblies.¹¹⁵ Progressives like the idea of citizen assemblies because it allows progressive viewpoints to “educate” a small group of citizens by dominating the discourse and excluding alternative ideas. The newly educated citizens then feel knowledgeable and empowered to make recommendations based on an intensive course of indoctrination. This has been particularly the case with the citizen climate assemblies.¹¹⁶

¹¹³ Canada 2020-Global Progress, The Recovery Summit, Day 3, Session 2: Democracy and Institutions, 16 September 2020.

¹¹⁴ Canada 2020-Global Progress, The Recovery Summit, Day 3, Session 1: Sustainability, 16 September 2020, [1:01:00-1:02:19]. Available at: <https://recoveryproject.ca/content/the-recovery-summit-sustainability/>.

¹¹⁵ Klaus Schwab, “A Better World Starts At Home,” Project Syndicate, 9 December 2019. Available at: <https://www.project-syndicate.org/onpoint/citizen-assemblies-to-end-polarization-by-klaus-schwab-2019-12?barrier=accesspaylog>.

¹¹⁶ To see how this operates in the context of climate change policy developments see, <https://www.climateassembly.uk/>. The website includes videos of the proceedings and lists the experts, who are solely from the progressive spectrum.

On the issue of sustainability, there was a proposal for a Youth Environment Service, where young people would serve for one year, volunteering to make the world more resilient and sustainable. An interesting comment was made by Frans Timmermans that the way the multilateral approach set up the Paris Agreement and the financial shift, “cities, NGOs and companies can join even if the federal government doesn’t.” He went on to say that progressives have an obligation “to show change is inevitable and we can shape it.”¹¹⁷ The EU green deal was mentioned and the fear that no one is following Europe’s lead because the US is not pursuing a Green New Deal, and that the outcome of the election was crucial. When asked how the world can prepare for the likely chaos on election night, Neera Tanden of the Center for American Progress said there was high recognition that “on election night, it will look like Trump is winning but will lose when all the votes are counted.” Therefore, she appealed for “democracies not to recognize the victory until all of the votes have been counted.” Gerry Butts concurred and said, “Neera’s right. Discretion is required from every country to wait to recognize the result. ... The media has done an excellent job explaining this process to the public, but the sheer number of things that can go wrong – unique unprecedented factors can affect the outcome.”¹¹⁸ John Podesta praised Biden’s Plan and emphasized that there is a broad deep commitment within the Democratic Party towards a second generation Green New Deal. He stated that there needs to be a clear vision for the world to coordinate a global economic recovery to build sustainability, address racial injustices, and other social justice causes, and that America will be able to lead on this with a Biden victory.

¹¹⁷ Canada 2020-Global Progress, The Recovery Summit, Day 3, Session 1: Sustainability, 16 September 2020. Available at: <https://recoveryproject.ca/content/the-recovery-summit-sustainability/>

¹¹⁸ Canada 2020-Global Progress, The Recovery Summit, Day 3, Session 1: Sustainability, 16 September 2020. Available at: <https://recoveryproject.ca/content/the-recovery-summit-sustainability/>

On Canada's contribution to sustainability, Catherine McKenna highlighted the cooperation between the federal government and the World Wildlife Fund to do important things. But, she argued, the most significant thing a government can do is bring people along; need to make smart choices – “everyone knows we need a clean green economy.... The youth want green jobs; it's important to have a price on pollution. We need to frame it as the science, the clean air, clean water, and animals.” In addition, she said, COVID was not a bad way to talk about the climate – “we owe it to everyone to use every tool in our toolbox to damn well move forward.”¹¹⁹ Frans Timmermans said one of the most influential things the EU did was to ban plastics because it had an immediate effect on individuals in their daily lives. He and other participants worried about social media and argued that “we need to channel this in the right direction.”¹²⁰

The Recovery Project and Summit may not have provided detailed policy prescriptions like the Task Force for a Resilient Recovery and other advice givers, but it did provide an informative and comprehensive sense of the determination, thinking and some strategy of accelerating the energy transition and Great Transformation. Time will tell how influential these conversations with European and American progressives are/were on the Liberal government's plans to support the Great Reset. However, Europeans and Americans are not the only ones contributing to Canada's recovery direction; Mark Carney has also been called upon as an informal advisor to Prime Minister Trudeau on Canada's economic recovery.

¹¹⁹ She also told the summit that the infrastructure bank will be making some announcements, but at the time she did not specify what they were. Canada 2020-Global Progress, The Recovery Summit, Day 3, Session 1: Sustainability, 16 September 2020. Available at: <https://recoveryproject.ca/content/the-recovery-summit-sustainability/>.

¹²⁰ Canada 2020-Global Progress, The Recovery Summit, Day 3, Session 1: Sustainability, 16 September 2020. Available at: <https://recoveryproject.ca/content/the-recovery-summit-sustainability/>.

C. *Mark Carney*

One individual who has been extremely active exerting influence and pursuing the Great Transformation is Mark Carney. As discussed in the report “A New Global Paradigm”, over the past several years, as head of the Bank of England, chair of the Financial Service Board, member of the G30, and member of the World Economic Forum’s Board of Trustees,¹²¹ Carney has been on a crusade to alter the rules of the financial services industry through the NGFS and the Task Force for Climate Related Financial Disclosures (TCFD). The initial purpose of the rule changes was to starve the hydrocarbon industry’s private companies of investors and financing, and divert the investment dollars to renewable energy projects in order to fund a global green shift.¹²² However, as will be seen, it is now proposed that the rule changes ought to extend to every financial decision in every sector. Since ending his term at the Bank of England in March 2020, Carney has continued this work as the UN special envoy for climate action and finance, the finance advisor to the UK Prime Minister’s preparation for COP 26 in Glasgow in 2021, and now as an informal advisor to the Canadian government for its post-COVID economic recovery.

In a statement announcing his new UN position Carney commented, “This provides a platform to bring the risks from climate change and the opportunities from the transition to a net-zero economy into the heart of financial decision-making.”¹²³ In February 2020, as the outgoing Governor of the Bank of England and as an advisor to the UK Prime Minister for COP 26, he launched the COP 26 “Private Finance Agenda to Drive a Whole Economy Transition”; its

¹²¹ World Economic Forum, Agenda Contributors, Biography Mark Carney. Available at: <https://www.weforum.org/agenda/authors/mark-carney/>.

¹²² An examination of the NGFS and TCFD is found in the section Divestment/Transforming the Industry, “A New Global Paradigm,” 31-40.

¹²³ Heather Scoffield, “Mark Carney’s new climate change job comes with new clout,” *The Toronto Star* [online], 1 December 2019. Available at: <https://www.thestar.com/politics/political-opinion/2019/12/01/mark-carneys-new-climate-change-job-comes-with-new-clout.html>.

overarching goal is to ensure that “every financial decision takes climate change into account.”¹²⁴ In his speech during this COP 26 launch he stated directly the need for a Great Transformation, “Achieving net zero will require a whole economy transition—every company, every bank, every insurer and investor will have to adjust their business models. This could turn an existential risk into the greatest commercial opportunity of our time.”¹²⁵ There were great expectations about what could be accomplished at COP 26 in November 2020, but due to COVID, it has been delayed until November 2021. However, Carney and Gerald Butts, at a GZERO virtual panel discussion in September 2020 agreed that it is actually fortuitous that COVID delayed COP 26. Not only does the delay give time for the US to change direction if/when Joe Biden is elected, so everyone can be on the same page moving forward, it also makes it a “high ambition” COP where countries will be more amenable to making transformational changes, particularly in diverting financing to the renewable sector or businesses or lifestyles that are approved to be “green”, in order to achieve the Great Reset for global society and companies.¹²⁶

Over the past several years Carney has been unceasing in his advocacy for shifting financing away from hydrocarbon investment to renewables and “green” operations, speaking on it at every opportunity. As a key supporter of the Great Reset, in a virtual discussion in early October 2020, he explained to Philip Steenkamp of Royal Roads University,

There is a Big Reset, a big strategic reset across virtually every sector of the economy, and that’s taking place at a time when the climate crisis has been becoming more urgent

¹²⁴ Bank of England, “COP 26 private finance strategy to drive Whole Economy Transition,” February 2020. Available at: <https://www.bankofengland.co.uk/-/media/boe/files/events/2020/february/cop26-private-finance-strategy.pdf?la=en&hash=4D961E25E8E80EAB2108EEA09628DBA461D60750>.

¹²⁵ Bank of England, Mark Carney, “The Road to Glasgow,” 27 February 2020. Available at: <https://www.bankofengland.co.uk/-/media/boe/files/speech/2020/the-road-to-glasgow-speech-by-mark-carney.pdf?la=en&hash=DCA8689207770DCBBB179CBADBE3296F7982FDF5>.

¹²⁶ GZERO Media, Panel Discussion “Net Zero: Climate Ambition and Action,” 16 September 2020, panelists: Julia Pyper, Gerald Butts, Lucas Joppa, Rachel Kyte, Mark Carney. Available at: <https://www.gzeromedia.com/unga/panel-how-can-the-world-get-to-net-zero-to-fight-climate-change>.

in front of mind.... I will tell you that, in terms of the financial sector, every major Wall Street bank, every major asset manager in the US, every major pension fund, is committed to the financial agenda that we have that has a simple objective which is to put in place by Glasgow, by the COP in Glasgow, the foundations so that every financial decision takes climate change into account; to think about climate risk as they're making their financial decisions and that influences them.

But for Carney, and others within the Transnational Progressive Movement, it is not enough to have a set of metrics that companies, banks, insurers, individuals can use to voluntarily report on their level of climate impact and climate risk, "it needs to be made mandatory so that it extends, you know, across all sectors – not everybody is implementing this – and across all geographies." Carney encapsulates this transformative vision very well in explaining that the "deliverables" or outcome of transforming the financial industry

is to have sub-national, regional, municipal, and other governments engaged and have their own commitments... so that this is cascading down; that it's not just at the multilateral level or national level but it's coming down to the level of our communities: our companies, our communities, our schools, our institutions, and what are we all doing to move towards these objectives.¹²⁷

All entities looking for investment dollars or seeking financial loans will have to comply with these obligations for assessing climate risk and quantifying what one is doing to support the net-zero targets, and will be ranked – 50 shades of green is how Mark Carney described it – "we need 50 shades of green, we need to be moving from brown to olive to light green to green. And the investments all organized around that principle at speed. ... Since this is a whole economy transition that's required, every sector will have elements of climate leadership and climate action." This means for every business, every loan, every financial transaction, interest rates, service fees, and approvals would be dependent on one's score – a bright green will be given

¹²⁷ "Mark Carney Talks Climate Action Leadership with Philip Steenkamp," Royal Roads University, 1 October 2020. Available at: <https://www.royalroads.ca/news-releases/steenkamp-and-carney-you-cant-diversify-away-climate-risk>. The conversation is also on Youtube. Available at: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jtZPhzDaA2U&feature=emb_logo.

preferential rates, a brown will face significantly higher rates if it receives financing at all. He reaffirmed this point in October 2020 at the G30, “Reaching net-zero will require a whole economy transition, that means every company in every sector, every insurer, every investor, every bank, will need to adjust their business models.”¹²⁸ The requirement for regional, national, and global finance will be, at minimum, for companies to have a clearly defined net-zero strategy in order to qualify for investments, loans or insurance.

Carney also sees this new financial structure of defined net-zero strategies as an opportunity for “individuals” through various investment funds to voluntarily redistribute the wealth, “that’s all money from the private sector, to be absolutely clear, it’s a consequence of private action and private desire to do this in the most efficient ways,” from the industrialized West to developing countries through “nature-based solutions, think reforestation, natural carbon sinks, and other carbon offsets.... it could be one of the big mechanisms by which money flows from advanced to emerging and developing economies and protects natural habitats while ensuring we are on a path collectively to net-zero.”¹²⁹ At a subsequent online panel discussion hosted by the Institute for International Finance, Carney again emphasized that carbon offsets are a “very major component” of a global climate solution.¹³⁰

A Bloomberg article points out the opportunities in this transformation: “the transition to a lower carbon world will require trillions of dollars of investment in renewable energy, electric vehicles, and a host of related technologies and infrastructure.”¹³¹ Investment firms will be looking to take advantage of the new opportunities and will need to navigate through the new

¹²⁸ “Mark Carney Talks Climate Action Leadership with Philip Steenkamp.”

¹²⁹ “Mark Carney Talks Climate Action Leadership with Philip Steenkamp.”

¹³⁰ Theophilos Argitis, “UN’s Carney Says Carbon Offset Market Has Become Imperative,” *Bloomberg Green* [online], 14 October 2020. Available at: <https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2020-10-14/un-s-carney-says-carbon-offset-market-has-become-imperative>.

¹³¹ Argitis, “UN’s Carney Says Carbon Offset Market Has Become Imperative.”

myriad requirements being constructed. To that end, Brookfield Asset Management, a Canadian “alternative” asset manager, hired Mark Carney as Vice Chairman in August 2020 to assist them in expanding their investments in the ESG market.¹³² Arguably, it is perhaps ethically murky for someone who is actively working within the UN and advising two different governments on how to change national and global financial rules to be working for a company that will be a direct beneficiary of those rule changes.¹³³ In an interview on his new role at Brookfield Carney said, “The question particularly for asset owners, pension funds, sovereign wealth funds and others is: How are you oriented? Are you on the right side, or the wrong side, of history?”¹³⁴ Indeed.

These examples of Carney’s thinking are by no means a singularity, a rare and unique occurrence, but rather reflect a worldview he has been articulating and working towards making concrete for several years. Emerging from the back-rooms of the UN, central banks, and global financial services industry, these ideas are heading for the mainstream. Repeating these same points unceasingly over the past several months, most recently at the launch of the G30 report he co-wrote, “Mainstreaming the Transition to a Net-Zero Economy,” he makes the important point, “What gets measured gets managed.... The specific steps in different countries will differ, but effective policy frameworks will satisfy some common principles.”¹³⁵ Truly, everyone will be managed because everyone’s life and lifestyle are going to be measured. A new form of planned

¹³² Scott Deveau and Jason Kelly, “Carney Joins Brookfield to Lead Firm’s Expansion Into ESG Funds,” *Bloomberg* [online], 28 August 2020. Available at: <https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2020-08-26/carney-joins-brookfield-to-lead-firm-s-expansion-into-esg-funds>.

¹³³ Carney is not alone. Interestingly, and similarly, former US senator John Kerry who helped craft Biden’s climate plan and is a supporter of the Great Reset has now become an investor and advisor to investment firm KRBN. The investment firm’s goal is to take advantage of a new Global Carbon Index, created by a group called Climate Finance with ties to members of KRBN, to facilitate the trading of carbon with the hope of increasing the cost of carbon. It would seem that progressives are anticipating the US establishing a carbon price and entering a global carbon market. Shirley Leung, “John Kerry takes the climate change fight to Wall Street,” *The Boston Globe* [online], 20 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.bostonglobe.com/2020/09/20/business/john-kerry-takes-climate-change-fight-wall-street/>. See also,

¹³⁴ Deveau and Kelly, “Carney Joins Brookfield to Lead Firm’s Expansion Into ESG Funds.”

¹³⁵ Group of Thirty, *Mainstreaming the Transition to a Net-Zero Economy: G30 Special Report Launch*, 8 October 2020, YouTube. Available at: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=CDErrkp_1Lo&feature=youtu.be.

economy is proposed by the G30 because “a whole economy transition requires transition plans and climate governance.”¹³⁶ Alongside recommendations about the necessity of a stringent carbon price, the need for offsets, making climate risk disclosure mandatory, and the need for global coordination, the G30 recommends that democratically elected governments ought to establish “‘Carbon Councils’—independent committees with expertise in climate science, environmental policy, business, or economics” to develop and implement net-zero policies.¹³⁷ The government would set a policy direction, but to be insulated from actions based on short-term thinking, Carbon Councils would be given the power to “calibrate the instruments” to fulfill the commitment to reach net-zero by 2050.¹³⁸ The purpose would be to “insulate decisions with significant long-term implications from short-term political pressures,” so that “Governments can build credibility more quickly by delegating key decisions to independent Carbon Councils.”¹³⁹ While the breadth of power and control given to these carbon councils might vary from country to country, the G30 suggests that in every nation carbon pricing should be determined solely by the carbon councils because it would be “based on objective scientific evidence,”¹⁴⁰ which would, in their view, make carbon pricing less contentious.¹⁴¹ Even with

¹³⁶ Group of Thirty Working Group on Climate Change and Finance, Mark Carney, Janet Yellen, et al, “Mainstreaming the Transition to a Net-Zero Economy,” October 2020. Available at: https://group30.org/images/uploads/publications/G30_Mainstreaming_the_Transition_to_a_Net-Zero_Economy.pdf.

¹³⁷ Carney, Yellen, et al, “Mainstreaming the Transition to a Net-Zero Economy,” 17.

¹³⁸ Carney, Yellen, et al, “Mainstreaming the Transition to a Net-Zero Economy,” 18.

¹³⁹ Carney, Yellen, et al, “Mainstreaming the Transition to a Net-Zero Economy,” xiv. One template suggested for this is the structure of how central banks are presumed to operate.

¹⁴⁰ Carney, Yellen, et al, “Mainstreaming the Transition to a Net-Zero Economy,” 18.

¹⁴¹ The call for a global network of national carbon pricing and trading has been circulating for many years. The most recent iteration is in the subcommittee report of the U.S. Commodity Futures Trading Commission. What is interesting about this report is that the chair of the committee responsible for the report was Bob Litterman, a former employee of Goldman Sachs who is serving on the board of the WWF, Resources for the Future, Sloan Foundation, Commonfund, and others. The editor of the subcommittee report was Leonardo Martinez-Diaz from the World Resources Institute. The subcommittee had 34 members, who were reportedly “fairly balanced”, but in reality the membership was heavily skewed towards supporting progressive policies such as a heavy carbon tax and carbon pricing; real industry representatives were outnumbered comprising 5 out of the 34 members. Bob Litterman, “Managing Climate Risk in the U.S. Financial System: Report of the Climate-Related Market Risk Subcommittee, Market Risk Advisory Committee of the U.S. Commodity Futures Trading Commission,” September 2020. Available at: <https://www.cftc.gov/sites/default/files/2020-09/9-9->

Carbon Councils there is the possibility for “backtracking on ambitious climate agendas,” if a government is replaced. Therefore, it is suggested that it is important to have politicians, regardless of party, share the same goals. A broad-based consensus “needs to be supported by clear communication and advocacy.”¹⁴² How these ideas will manifest in Canada’s policies based on Carney’s advice to Prime Minister Trudeau, Finance Minister Freeland, and the rest of the Cabinet for the yet to be announced post-COVID economic recovery plan and budget remains to be seen, but it is certain that they will have profound implications not just for Alberta but also for Canada.

V. Implications for Alberta and Canada

Thus far, this supplement to the report “A New Global Paradigm” has outlined how the Transnational Progressive Movement, using the COVID-19 pandemic and the consequent global economic lockdown as a catalyst, has accelerated the shift towards a new global paradigm through the WEF’s Great Reset. The Canadian government led by the Liberal Party of Justin Trudeau, cooperating and coordinating with other progressive governments and organizations, is committed to reshaping Canada’s economic foundation and social structure in the image of the Great Reset, as has been described in the previous sections. This endeavour threatens to completely upend Alberta’s economy and irrevocably alter the Canadian way of life. To achieve this Great Reset a complete energy and societal transition is required, and a circular economy with its accompanying lifestyle changes must be implemented. Economist Mariana Mazzucato expressed this unambiguously in a recent commentary:

Addressing this triple crisis [health, economic, and climate] requires reorienting corporate governance, finance, policy, and energy systems toward a green economic transformation.

[20%20Report%20of%20the%20Subcommittee%20on%20Climate-Related%20Market%20Risk%20-%20Managing%20Climate%20Risk%20in%20the%20U.S.%20Financial%20System%20for%20posting.pdf](#)

¹⁴² Carney, Yellen, et al, “Mainstreaming the Transition to a Net-Zero Economy,” xiv; 16.

To achieve this, three obstacles must be removed: business that is shareholder-driven instead of stakeholder-driven, finance that is used in inadequate and inappropriate ways and government that is based on outdated economic thinking and faulty assumptions [like GDP]....In the near future, the world may need to resort to lockdowns again—this time to tackle a climate emergency....Under a ‘climate lockdown’, governments would limit private-vehicle use, ban consumption of red meat and impose extreme energy-saving measures, while fossil-fuel companies would have to stop drilling. To avoid such a scenario, we must overhaul our economic structures to do capitalism differently.¹⁴³

While the threat of a “climate lockdown” may seem like hyperbole, and a way to shock the reader into taking immediate action, it is not far from the truth given the lifestyle shift being advocated by the Transnational Progressive Movement and the Great Reset. The implicit threat is that if the public will not concede to these changes voluntarily, a mandatory requirement might be necessary. In this section, the implications of this transformation will be discussed in the context of changes to financial and investment rules, the promotion of renewable energy and the environmental consequences, the proposed shift to a circular economy and its contradictions, the proposed transformation of agricultural production, and the type of lifestyle changes required to get to net-zero and fulfill the Great Reset, and lastly how to convince the voting public to voluntarily give up their current standard of living.

Through the work of Mark Carney and the NGFS, the TCFD, the G30, and other groups, as discussed in the previous section, private and public finance are working towards changing the rules of the game to punish the profitable efficient businesses at the heart of the hydrocarbon economy that have created an unprecedented level of global prosperity, and reward those that support the transformation such as renewable energy industries, and those that follow the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), have the right net-zero plan, and express the correct

¹⁴³ Mariana Mazzucato, “Avoiding a Climate Lockdown,” *Project Syndicate* [online], 22 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.project-syndicate.org/commentary/radical-green-overhaul-to-avoid-climate-lockdown-by-mariana-mazzucato-2020-09>. She also provided a partner analysis for the Task Force for a Resilient Recovery through the Smart Prosperity Institute. Available at: <https://institute.smartprosperity.ca/COVIDGreenRecovery>.

sentiments with respect to social justice issues. As Seamus O'Regan, Canadian Minister of Natural Resources, stated starkly in an interview to Reuters in August 2020, "If you do what is required to lower emissions, you will be rewarded with increased investment. If you don't, you'll be punished."¹⁴⁴ No sector of Canada's economy or society will be left untouched by this transformation, but the petroleum industry will be hit the hardest. The petroleum industry will be scaled back, defunded, and phased out, a process well under way in Canada with the changes to the regulatory structure that effectively prevent new pipelines from being built in western Canada, or emissions friendly oil sands projects to be approved, like the Teck Frontier Mine. Since Canada will still need oil and gas in the short to mid-term, it seems that the Canadian government's preference is that it will come from the Atlantic coast rather than Alberta.¹⁴⁵ Indeed, the east coast offshore petroleum industry is being treated more favourably than the west to ensure it remains solvent during the economic downturn, as seen in the recent Impact Assessment Review rule exemption and additional financial support to the Newfoundland and Labrador offshore petroleum industry. Future financing will either be severely constrained or will not be forthcoming to the private petroleum sector once the ESG and TCFD taxonomies are fully in place and mandatory by 2023 – something Mark Carney is working diligently towards.

While financing for private hydrocarbon companies and regulations for hydrocarbon projects are being constrained in Western developed countries, something one analyst calls "energy suicide," the same is not true for state owned petroleum companies and developing

¹⁴⁴ Charles Kennedy, "Canada Has to Cut Oil Production Emissions to Attract Investors," Oilprice.com [online], 12 August, 2020. Available at: <https://oilprice.com/Latest-Energy-News/World-News/Canada-Has-To-Cut-Oil-Production-Emissions-To-Attract-Investors.html>; See also, Rod Nickel, "Canadian oil expansion hinges on emission cuts to draw investors: minister," Reuters, 11 August 2020. Available at: <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-global-oil-canada/canadian-oil-expansion-hinges-on-emission-cuts-to-draw-investors-minister-idUSKCN2572IN?rpc=401&>.

¹⁴⁵ This view is also articulated by Conrad Black in "Just Trudeau's Coordinated Assault on Canadian Energy," *National Post* [online], 9 October 2020. Available at: <https://nationalpost.com/opinion/conrad-black-trudeaus-environmental-policies-threaten-canada-itself>.

countries.¹⁴⁶ In August 2020, China signed a major deal with Abu Dhabi securing significant shares and concessions in various oil, natural gas, LNG, and chemical projects. There is also some speculation that China is providing significant loans to Middle Eastern governments in exchange for concessions.¹⁴⁷ National Oil Companies pose a conundrum for the Great Transformation because they not only control most of the world's oil reserves, many are in developing countries and, as one former executive of a National Oil Company pointed out, have a "duty to fund their governments." Most of the national oil companies do not need outside financing so the pressure from transnational financial institutions will have little effect. Furthermore, as Omran Al-Kuwari of the Qatar Foundation argued, developing countries "are hoping to monetize and grow their economies, and you're telling them to keep it in the ground." On paper these things may seem like a good idea, he said, but there is a complicated political economy, and these policies will "affect a lot more people than we realize."¹⁴⁸ The implications for Canada are that while it is phasing out its petroleum industry, particularly in western Canada, and its economy grows weaker in part because of inefficient and unreliable renewable energy, China's economy will prosper by maintaining the dominance of fossil fuels in its energy production and consumption, purchased from developing countries who will be grateful that China has not told them to keep their oil and gas in the ground, while selling to Canada and other

¹⁴⁶ Tilak Doshi, "The West Intends Energy Suicide: Will It Succeed?" *Forbes* [online], 10 October 2020. Available at: <https://www.forbes.com/sites/tilakdoshi/2020/10/10/the-west-intends-energy-suicide-will-it-succeed/>.

¹⁴⁷ Simon Watkins, "China To Expand Its Influence In The Middle East With Major Oil Deal," Oilprice.com, 11 August 2020. Available at: <https://oilprice.com/Energy/Crude-Oil/China-To-Expand-Its-Influence-In-The-Middle-East-With-Major-Oil-Deal.html>. Total France has not sold its Abu Dhabi concerns, nor has ENI. It would seem activities in Russia, Africa and the Middle East are exempt from the financial restrictions levied against Canadian hydrocarbon activities. This could be due to the fact that these countries and regions are exempt from the emissions reductions of the Paris Agreement.

¹⁴⁸ Omran Al-Kuwari, Project Syndicate Event, "The Green Recovery," Day 2, Session Two – Closing the Circuit on the Energy Transition, 17 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ko0kNo6Dt5s>.

Western countries a large portion of the materials and components for the solar panels and windmills proposed for the energy transition.

As discussed earlier, the federal government has made announcements promising and pouring money into renewable technologies and infrastructure such as electric buses, electric cars, charging stations and expanding renewable grids. There is little discussion of where the resources and materials, particularly the rare earth minerals, for all of these new products will come from; currently more than 70 percent of rare earths are mined and processed by Chinese companies with a terrible environmental and social record in developing countries, while the troubled Democratic Republic of Congo, facing concerns about the use of child labour, produces more than 60 percent of the world's cobalt, an essential mineral in the construction of modern batteries used for battery power-banks, industrial power storage for unstable grids, and electric vehicles.¹⁴⁹ There are other geopolitical issues that need to be addressed such as the location of these minerals, particularly rare earths like lithium, the royalty structures, accessibility, the potential for resource competition and other factors that could have a significant impact on national security.¹⁵⁰ The implications, particularly if America pursues a Green New Deal, are

¹⁴⁹ Kirsten Hund, Daniel La Porta, et al, "Minerals for Climate Action: The Mineral Intensity of the Clean Energy Transition," World Bank Group, (Washington: International Bank for Reconstruction and Development, 2020), 61, 94. Available at: <http://pubdocs.worldbank.org/en/961711588875536384/Minerals-for-Climate-Action-The-Mineral-Intensity-of-the-Clean-Energy-Transition.pdf>. China also produces nearly 70 percent of the world's natural graphite which is used in batteries for industrial energy storage. Amnesty International has warned that children are being used in the mining of Cobalt in the Democratic Republic of Congo, and a CBS News investigation confirmed the child labour and exposed the difficulty in tracing the sources through the supply chain. See, Amnesty International, "Democratic Republic of Congo: Government Must Deliver on Pledge to end Child Mining Labour by 2025," 1 September 2017. Available at: <https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/news/2017/09/democratic-republic-of-congo-government-must-deliver-on-pledge-to-end-child-mining-labour-by-2025/>; CBS News, "CBS News finds Children Mining Cobalt for Batteries in the Congo," *CBS News* [online], 5 March 2018. Available at: <https://www.cbsnews.com/news/cobalt-children-mining-democratic-republic-congo-cbs-news-investigation/>.

¹⁵⁰ Perrine Toledano, Martin Dietrich Brauch, Solina Kennedy, and Howard Mann, "Don't Throw Caution to the Wind: In the green energy transition, not all critical minerals will be goldmines," Columbia Center on Sustainable Investment, May 2020. Available at: <http://ccsi.columbia.edu/files/2020/05/Dont-Throw-Caution-to-the-Wind.pdf>.

staggering. Several countries will be competing over the next ten years for the resources and components to construct the windmills, solar panels, batteries, and transmission lines that are intended to replace the current hydrocarbon system, putting China in a powerful position to deny access to these resources and components, as they did to Japan in 2010¹⁵¹ and threatened to do to the US in 2020,¹⁵² and jeopardizing Canada's national security.

There is some indication that the Canadian government is examining the possibility of increasing mining of these strategic minerals to take advantage of the projected exponential increase in demand and thereby inadvertently guard its national security.¹⁵³ Indeed, a recent study published in *Nature Communications* warned that the required exponential increase in mining for the materials necessary for renewable energy will have deleterious consequences for remaining wilderness, protected areas, and biodiversity in various regions of the world, including Canada.¹⁵⁴ However, it is unclear if Canada's environmental impact assessments will derail future mining of the necessary resources. This is particularly important in light of Canada's "pledge for nature" and declaration to set aside 25 percent of its land "for nature" by 2025, and 30 percent by 2030 to fulfill its commitment to the UN biodiversity goals. The current rules

¹⁵¹ Yoichi Funabashi, "The Mideast has oil, China has rare earths," *Japan Times* [online], 9 August 2019. Available at: <https://www.japantimes.co.jp/opinion/2019/08/09/commentary/japan-commentary/mideast-oil-china-rare-earth/>.

¹⁵² Tim Treadgold, "China's Rare Earth Threat Sparks An International Backlash," *Forbes* [online], 7 August 2020. Available at: <https://www.forbes.com/sites/timtreadgold/2020/08/07/chinas-rare-earth-threat-sparks-an-international-backlash/>. Of course, realization of dependence and China's leverage has also spurred the United States and some of its allies to pursue alternative sources and the construction of separation facilities. For example, as the author points out, "The most important development after the threat to Lockheed Martin was a deal between the U.S. Defense Department and an Australian rare earth miner to push ahead, with a private U.S. partner, in planning the construction of a rare earth separation facility in Texas." It is unclear how quickly the facility can be constructed but is encouraging for diversification of supply.

¹⁵³ Mines Canada, "Canadian Minerals and Metals Plan, Update," September 2020. Available at: https://www.minescanada.ca/sites/default/files/pictures/PDF/cmmp-actionplan2020_update_en_final.pdf. I use the word inadvertently because there is no indication from the Canadian government that national security considerations are being contemplated let alone informing their decisions.

¹⁵⁴ Laura J. Sonter, Marie C. Dade, James E.M. Watson, Rick K. Valenta, "Renewable energy production will exacerbate mining threats to biodiversity," *Nature Communications* 11, 4174 [online], 1 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.nature.com/articles/s41467-020-17928-5>.

concerning nature preserves essentially prohibit the disturbance of the land, which means no development – no mining, no windmills, no solar panels.

As the World Bank pointed out in its report, “Minerals for Climate Action,” renewables also have a shorter life span with concurrent declining efficiency as they age and wear out, than natural gas, coal, and nuclear power – 20 years for wind, 30 years for solar, 10 years for battery storage compared with 30 years for gas, 40 years for coal, and 50 years for nuclear.¹⁵⁵ Not only do renewables consume more materials and occupy more land and ocean space, they must be replaced more often with the consummate increase in materials, and further dependence on the countries that produce those materials. As discussed in the main report “A New Global Paradigm,” concerns about the significant amount of materials required for renewable energy were expressed in a 2018 engineering study commissioned by the Dutch government that calculated just to make the Netherlands 100 percent renewable would consume **almost all** of the current global available minerals. Despite the conclusions of that engineering report, the Netherlands has committed to having a fully net-zero, circular economy by 2050.

Renewable energy is not only an inefficient means of generating electricity it is also inefficient with respect to the materials and land-use or spatial footprint required to generate the same amount of electricity as conventional power systems. The Michael Moore film *Planet of the Humans* documents in a very visual way these contradictory issues and problems with renewable energy. For inefficiency and unreliability, it should be noted, using data from the US, one analysis found that windmills and solar panels do not meet their nameplate rating by a considerable amount:

¹⁵⁵ Kirsten Hund, Daniel La Porta, et al, “Minerals for Climate Action: The Mineral Intensity of the Clean Energy Transition,” World Bank Group, (Washington: International Bank for Reconstruction and Development, 2020), 24. Available at: <http://pubdocs.worldbank.org/en/961711588875536384/Minerals-for-Climate-Action-The-Mineral-Intensity-of-the-Clean-Energy-Transition.pdf>.

windmills perform at 34.6 percent of their nameplate rating or the intended full-load output capacity. ...solar arrays perform at 25.7 percent of their nameplate rating. This is in contrast to natural gas and coal units that can perform at 85 percent or more of their nameplate ratings and nuclear units can perform at over 90 percent of their nameplate ratings.¹⁵⁶

Not only are windmills and solar panels incredibly inefficient and unreliable, in part because they are weather dependent, they are also voracious consumers of materials which are incorporated in such a way as to make most of them nonrecyclable once the windmills and solar panels have worn out.

A recent report by Mark Mills of the Manhattan Institute outlined how wind turbines, solar panels, and batteries for backup and electric vehicles require **ten times** the amount of materials compared to conventional power generation and machines that run on hydrocarbons. Furthermore, one 1,000 pound lithium ion battery for an electric vehicle requires 500,000 pounds of material to be mined and processed. In addition, according to the International Renewable Energy Agency (IRENA), by 2050 “worn out solar panels – **much of it nonrecyclable** – will constitute **double the tonnage of all today’s global plastic waste**, along with over 3 million tons per year of **unrecyclable plastics from worn-out wind turbine blades** [emphasis added].”¹⁵⁷ As for the land use or spatial footprint of renewable energy, there have been a few studies calculating and comparing how much land is used for renewables compared with conventional generation, while others have calculated the physical footprint for renewables to replace or produce the same amount of energy as all other non-renewable sources combined.¹⁵⁸

¹⁵⁶ Institute for Energy Research, Policy Brief, “The 100 Percent Renewable Energy Myth,” 8 February 2019, 2. Available at: <https://www.instituteforenergyresearch.org/renewable/the-100-percent-renewable-energy-myth/>

¹⁵⁷ Mark Mills, “Mines, Minerals and ‘Green’ Energy: A Reality Check,” July 2020, Manhattan Institute, 4. Available at: <https://www.manhattan-institute.org/mines-minerals-and-green-energy-reality-check>.

¹⁵⁸ Leiden University, “Renewable Energy Sources Can Take up to 1000 Times More Space Than Fossil Fuels,” *Phys.org* [online], 28 August 2018. Available at: <https://phys.org/pdf454672643.pdf>. See also, Nemeth, “A New Global Paradigm,” April 2020, 40-42.

A 2017 report by economic environmental think tank Strata calculated that coal, natural gas, and nuclear occupied significantly less space than wind farms or solar array complexes for generating the same amount of electricity using U.S. data from 2015. The results are listed in Table 1 below.

Table 1 Land Use by Electricity Source in U.S. in 2015

Electricity Source	Acres per Megawatt Produced
Coal	12.21
Natural Gas	12.41
Nuclear	12.71
Solar	43.50
Wind	70.64
Hydro	315.22

Source: Strata, The Footprint of Energy: Land Use of U.S. Electricity Production¹⁵⁹

Michael Shellenberger provides a visual overview comparing the spatial footprint of renewable energy to conventional fuels on his website, which is quite shocking.¹⁶⁰ In his book, he argues that if the United States were to go to 100 percent renewables the land use would increase from the current 0.5 percent to upwards of 50 percent depending on the type of renewable energy mix, explaining that the problem with renewables is their energy density because they have physical limits of maximum efficiency.¹⁶¹ Another policy brief by the Institute for Energy Research

¹⁵⁹ Landon Stevens, “The Footprint of Energy: Land Use of U.S. Electricity Production,” Strata, June 2017, 1. Available at: <https://www.strata.org/pdf/2017/footprints-full.pdf>.

¹⁶⁰ Michael Shellenberger, Power Density Slide Deck, Environmental Progress. Available at: <https://environmentalprogress.org/power-density-slide-deck>.

¹⁶¹ Michael Shellenberger, *Apocalypse Never* (Harper Collins, 2020), 182-188. See also, Michael Shellenberger, “On Behalf of Environmentalists, I Apologize for the Climate Scare,” *Forbes* [online], 29 June 2020. This article was originally published on the *Forbes* website but was controversially removed within 24 hours. It can now be found on Shellenberger’s website, <https://environmentalprogress.org/big-news/2020/6/29/on-behalf-of-environmentalists-i-apologize-for-the-climate-scare>.

suggests that to go 100 percent renewable energy production windmills and solar panels would occupy at least 1/3 of the continental US.¹⁶² The physical numbers of windmills and solar panels and industrial battery packs for backup that will be necessary to replace current hydrocarbon energy production is staggering. As described in the main report, “A New Global Paradigm,” the numbers are so great that they are almost unimaginable – tens of thousands of windmills on land and offshore, tens of millions of solar panels covering land and buildings, and millions of industrial battery packs also taking up space.¹⁶³ These facts seem to be at odds with the entire premise and purpose of both the circular economy that is supposed to be powered by renewable energy, and the environmental movement’s professed commitment to protecting the Earth under the principle of “do no harm”.

There is a striking contradiction between the goals of a circular economy and renewable energy. The circular economy, which Canada has apparently committed to follow and which is a component of the Great Reset, promotes the idea that raw materials on Earth are finite and that we are running out because we have been using too many without reusing or recycling material waste enough, “We take resources from the ground to make products, which we use, and, when we no longer want them, throw them away.”¹⁶⁴ One of the strongest advocates for the circular economy is the Ellen MacArthur foundation, an organizing partner for Canada’s hosting of the World Circular Economy Forum in 2021. Its founder, Dame Ellen MacArthur, is a member of the Club of Rome and the foundation often participates in expert panels or expert groups in the EU policy-making apparatus. It is also a partner in the Platform for Accelerating the Circular

¹⁶² Institute for Energy Research, Policy Brief, “The 100 Percent Renewable Energy Myth,” 8 February 2019. Available at: <https://www.instituteforenergyresearch.org/renewable/the-100-percent-renewable-energy-myth/>.

¹⁶³ See, Nemeth, “A New Global Paradigm,” 41-42.

¹⁶⁴ <https://www.ellenmacarthurfoundation.org/circular-economy/what-is-the-circular-economy>.

Economy established by the World Economic Forum in 2018.¹⁶⁵ The Foundation defines the circular economy as:

ACCESS VERSUS OWNERSHIP

it raises questions about the necessity of owning products in the way that we traditionally do. ... It is access to the service a product provides that is important, rather than the product itself.

By designing out waste and pollution, keeping products and materials in use, and regenerating rather than degrading natural systems, the circular economy represents a powerful contribution to achieving global climate targets.¹⁶⁶

While the circular economy preferences designing out waste, reusing materials, and only recycling as a last resort, it advocates renewable energy which, as described above, has a dismal record for reusing or even recycling its components of solar panels, windmills, and large-scale lithium batteries.

From an environmental perspective, the significantly higher environmental footprint of renewable energy and the death and destruction meted out to birds, bats, insects and other wildlife ought to be considered when calculating the pros and cons of pursuing this type of energy transition. For example, the US Fish and Wildlife Service estimate that between 140,000 and 500,000 birds are killed every year in America by windmills.¹⁶⁷ A study in 2013 out of the University of Colorado utilized available data and computer models to calculate that

¹⁶⁵ For the Ellen MacArthur Foundation involvement with the EU see for example, G7 Plastics Workshop in the context of 2030 Agenda implementation and towards G7 collaborative activities, Brussels, 22-23 March 2018, 2. Available at:

https://ec.europa.eu/environment/international_issues/pdf/g7_plastics_workshop_final_programme.pdf. The Ellen MacArthur Foundation is also represented on the recently convened EU expert group the Platform on Sustainable Finance. For the WEF PACE coalition see, <https://pacecircular.org/projects>.

¹⁶⁶ Ellen MacArthur Foundation, What is the Circular Economy? Available at: <https://www.ellenmacarthurfoundation.org/circular-economy/what-is-the-circular-economy>.

¹⁶⁷ United States Fish and Wild Life Service, “Wind Turbines: What is the Issue?” Available at: <https://www.fws.gov/birds/bird-enthusiasts/threats-to-birds/collisions/wind-turbines.php>. See also, Audubon Society, “Wind Power and Birds,” <https://www.audubon.org/news/wind-power-and-birds>.

approximately 600,000 bats were killed in the US at 21 wind farm sites in 2012.¹⁶⁸ Michael Shellenberger in his book *Apocalypse Never*, pointed out an engineering study from Germany that raises the alarm that windmills in Germany have made a significant contribution to the considerable decline in insects noted in that country.¹⁶⁹ Birds will face a double threat from the windmills and from the decrease in insects that comprise part of their diets. If the Canadian Federal Government follows the recommendations from the Task Force for a Resilient Recovery to fill Alberta and Saskatchewan with windmills and solar panels there is the potential for pollinators, essential to the agricultural economies of the prairies, to experience a catastrophic decline as they have in Europe. This could lead to a collapse in oil seed and other seed production affecting not only Canada's exports but also its food supply.

The Great Reset is an entire system change and requires significant transformation of modern agricultural practices that will affect the food supply. The closest example of what that means in practice is the EU's Farm to Fork and biodiversity strategies. These policy frameworks considerably constrain the ability of farmers to farm as they see fit. For example, in the EU, farmers will be required to reduce the amount of fertilizer and pesticides by 30 percent by 2030 and 50 percent by 2050. They will be told by the European Commission how to rotate their crops, with a recommendation of dividing large fields into smaller plots of different crops so as

¹⁶⁸ Mark A. Hayes, "Bats Killed in Large Numbers at United States Wind Facilities," *Bioscience* (December 2013 / Vol. 63 No. 12). Available at: <https://www.aibs.org/bioscience-press-releases/resources/Hayes.pdf>.

¹⁶⁹ Franz Trieb, "Interference of Flying Insects and Wind Parks," Deutsches Zentrum für Luft- und Raumfahrt (DLR) Institut für Technische Thermodynamik, October 2018. Available at: <https://www.dlr.de/tt/Portaldata/41/Resources/dokumente/st/FliWip-Final-Report.pdf>. The study estimated that 24,000 tons of insects (beetles, butterflies, aphids and other insects) traverse German windfarms in the summer months with approximately five percent lost due to blade impacts with a resultant loss of about 1,200 tons per year. (2) The conclusion was that this could have a cumulative impact on the population stability of the various species affected particularly if the losses took place during migration before the adult female insects laid their eggs. (11) Ultimately, "the study aims at raising awareness about wind power generation being one of the possible causes of insect biomass lost in several nature reserve areas in Germany." (25)

to improve biodiversity, and taking strips of the fields out of production and planting wildflowers and hedge rows. They will be “incentivized” to pursue organic farming instead of the current method, which will result in lower yields. For livestock producers, the goal is to reduce all forms of meat and livestock¹⁷⁰ – sheep, poultry, pork but especially the amount of cattle for beef and dairy – a divestment campaign has already begun in the UK against “Big Livestock.”¹⁷¹ Central to the Great Reset and the EU Green Deal is switching the type of food we eat; a plant-based diet will be encouraged through nudging – regulation, taxation, shaming, and media communication.¹⁷² These very ideas are being proposed in Canada under the guise of “resilience” and “sustainable food systems”.

¹⁷⁰ See for example the call by a group of academics in *The Lancet* for “high-income and middle-income countries” to legislate peak demand for livestock and “set appropriate reduction targets for production.” Helen Harwatt, William Ripple, Abhishek Chaudhary, Matthew Betts, Matthew Hayek, “Scientist call for renewed Paris pledges to transform agriculture,” *The Lancet* [online], 11 December 2019. Available at: [https://doi.org/10.1016/s2542-5196\(19\)30245-1](https://doi.org/10.1016/s2542-5196(19)30245-1). The article also includes a link to a “sign on” so academics can sign a petition to send to governments pressing for this action.

¹⁷¹ See Feedback Global’s divestment campaign, “Big Livestock vs. The Planet.” Available at: <https://feedbackglobal.org/campaigns/the-end-of-big-livestock/>. See also for example, Michael Shank, “3 ways to launch a factory farm divestment movement,” *The Hill* [online], 17 June 2020. Available at: <https://thehill.com/opinion/energy-environment/503130-ways-to-launch-a-factory-farm-divestment-movement>; and Clare Hamlett, “It’s Time for Fossil Fuel Divestment Campaigners to Take on the Meat Industry,” *Sentient Media* [online], 16 July 2020. Available at: <https://sentientmedia.org/fossil-fuel-divestment-campaigners-to-take-on-the-meat-industry/>. Hamlett writes, “If financiers continuing to pump money into agribusinesses were to **receive the full fossil fuel treatment**, I expect we would soon see the meat executives shaking in their boots too [emphasis added].” Rain Forest Action Network and the Carbon Cities Alliance were also named as beginning agribusiness or “factory farming” divestment campaigns. However, with the TCFD rule changes coming to the financial industry, a divestment campaign may not be necessary.

¹⁷² Anne Larigauderie, Project Syndicate Event, “The Green Recovery,” Day 1, Session Two – The Return(s) of Nature, 16 September 2020, [2:00:15-2:03:20]. Available at: www.project-syndicate.org/videos/ps-events-the-green-recovery-day-2. See also, Silje Kristiansen, James Painter & Meghan Shea, “Animal Agriculture and Climate Change in the US and UK Elite Media: Volume, Responsibilities, Causes and Solutions,” *Environmental Communication*, September 2020, 1-20. Available at: <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/17524032.2020.1805344>. The authors repeat the idea that individual behavioural changes as well as policy pushes are necessary to reach net-zero and reduce emissions: “Research suggests that multi-scale approaches at both the individual and state levels will be needed to reduce greenhouse gas emissions. In the area of animal agriculture, changes in individual dietary behavior are also seen as a very important component of the solution mix. However, a complex array of policy actions will also be needed to change food supply and production systems, particularly to make agriculture support better diets within environmental boundaries.” (13)

The Transnational Progressive Movement and its Canadian colleagues are gearing up to systematically alter Canada's agricultural sector as part of the Great Transformation and Great Reset. As part of the push for a complete system change, the COVID crisis has spurred a number of reports suggesting changes to Canada's agriculture system. Some of these recommendations include the promotion of local production and consumption, on-site renewable energy generation, building retrofits, battery electric farm equipment, advice on crop rotations, holistic grazing, mentorship in organic farming practices, and crop insurance discounts for resilience practices to name a few.¹⁷³ Many of these recommendations come from the newly created Farmers for Climate Solutions, formed in February 2020, and self described as "an unprecedented collaboration of Canada's most progressive farming organizations." These progressive organizations include Équiterre, Seed Change, the National Farmers' Union, Canadian Organic Growers, and other provincial organic growers' associations. They are funded by eleven foundations including Make Way (formerly the Tides Foundation), the Ivey Foundation (one of the funders of the Task Force for a Resilient Recovery), the Metcalf Foundation, Prairie Climate Centre, and the Martel-Lemieux Fund for Sustainable Response to COVID-19.¹⁷⁴ Some of these funds were directed by the bundling organization Environment Funders Canada.¹⁷⁵ Of interest is that the funders of this new farmers group also fund other

¹⁷³ See for example, Farmers for Climate Solutions, "A Better Future Starts on the Farm: Recommendations for recovery from COVID-19 in Canadian agriculture," August 2020, 18. Available at: <https://static1.squarespace.com/static/5dc5869672cac01e07a8d14d/t/5f3c0f687316e95af6983f6c/1597771696221/FCS-Recommendations+for+recovery+from+COVID-19+in+Canadian+agriculture-EN-web.pdf>; Food Secure Canada, "Growing Resilience and Equity: A Food Policy Action Plan in the Context of COVID-19," May 2020. Available at: https://foodsecurecanada.org/sites/foodsecurecanada.org/files/fsc_-_growing_resilience_equity_10_june_2020.pdf; Canadian Commission for UNESCO and UNESCO Chair on Food, Biodiversity, and Sustainability Studies, "Food Systems: Building Back Better Post COVID-19 Task Force," *iPolitics.ca* [online], 15 July 2020. Available at: <https://ipolitics.ca/2020/07/15/now-is-the-time-to-build-sustainable-food-system-resilience/>.

¹⁷⁴ Farmers for Climate Solutions, "A Better Future Starts on the Farm," August 2020, 18.

¹⁷⁵ Dunskey Consultants, "Building Canada's Low Carbon Future", 20.

progressive agricultural and environmental groups who produce reports with recommendations that are similar to the Farmers for Climate Solutions.¹⁷⁶ It is all so familiar. The way the process works, as with the attack on the Canadian hydrocarbon industry, is that several different organizations are funded by many of the same foundations and produce many separate but similar reports, their personnel are then included on advisory councils or expert panels to advise government diluting the voices of non-progressives, and the media report on the different reports all in order to create the impression that there is broad support for the progressive policies being proposed. The implications of the policies and initiatives recommended by the various advocacy groups, task forces, and the proposals for financial industry changes are that the very act of farming and livestock production – organic or conventional—will face numerous new costs and restructuring. These may come in the form of ever increasing regulations, ever increasing carbon taxes and charges, time spent calculating emissions and ESG factors for every private or public loan, increased costs for borrowing that will be dependent on how “green” or “brown” the farming operation is based on the taxonomies being promoted by Mark Carney, diminishment of livestock herds, unreliable energy, decreasing or unreliable mechanization if farm equipment becomes electric, and reduced yields due to regulations concerning fertilizers, pesticides and herbicides to name a few possible outcomes.

Some governments like those in the EU and in Canada suggest to their citizens that the energy transition will just be replacing one form of energy with another and that although people might have to make some lifestyle changes, the standard of living will see little change; the

¹⁷⁶ See for example, Food Secure Canada, “Growing Resilience and Equity,” May 2020; the Green Budget Coalition. Available at: <http://www.greenbudget.ca/>; National Farmers Union, “Tackling the Farming Crisis and the Climate Crisis,” November 2019. Available at: <https://www.nfu.ca/wp-content/uploads/2020/01/Tackling-the-Farm-Crisis-and-the-Climate-Crisis-NFU-2019.pdf>; National Farmers’ Union, “Envisioning a Post-Pandemic Agricultural System,” 23 June 2020. Available at: <https://www.nfu.ca/policy/envisioning-a-post-pandemic-agriculture-and-food-system/>.

reality will likely be much different.¹⁷⁷ Despite the public rhetoric, there is a growing body of studies and commentaries informing this push for an energy transition and circular economy which are clear that lifestyle changes must take place. Many of the participants in the various webinars over the past few months agreed that the transition to net-zero and the Great Reset could not be achieved without individuals in the developed countries significantly altering their lifestyle. What sort of lifestyle changes are proposed as necessary?

There have been a steady trickle of studies and opinion articles published to support the WEF and EU Green Deal suggestions that Western lifestyles will have to change in order to save the planet.¹⁷⁸ For example, in June, an article in *Nature Communications* argued that affluence is the root cause of environmental impacts and climate change, and “any transition towards sustainability can **only** be effective if far-reaching lifestyle changes complement technological advances [emphasis added].”¹⁷⁹ A month later, the WEF highlighted this report under its “Future of Consumption” stream and as part of its commitment in the Great Reset towards a circular economy.¹⁸⁰ The authors in the report make clear that a drop in the Western standard of living is a prerequisite for environmental sustainability:

on affluence as a driver, the strongest pillar of the necessary transformation is to avoid or to reduce consumption until the remaining consumption level falls within planetary boundaries, while fulfilling human needs. Avoiding consumption means not consuming certain goods and services, from living space (overly large homes, secondary residences

¹⁷⁷ Surprisingly, EU President Ursula von der Leyen mentioned briefly in her state of the union address that lifestyles will have to change, but this comment received very little public attention.

¹⁷⁸ This viewpoint is more thoroughly described in Kate Raworth’s book, *Doughnut Economics: Seven Ways to Think Like a 21st Century Economist* (White River Junction, VT: Chelsea Green Publishing, 2017), and in a recent book by Dietrich Vollrath, *Fully Grown: Why a Stagnant Economy is a Sign of Success* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2020). Raworth, of the University of Oxford, is a member of the Club of Rome and the WEF and has had some influence in the policy development of the EU Green Deal. See also a discussion with the authors in the podcast, “Why a New Wave of Economists Are Championing Slow Growth.” Available at: <https://www.wbur.org/onpoint/2020/02/12/economists-slow-economic-growth>.

¹⁷⁹ T. Wiedmann, M. Lenzen, L.T. Keyßer, et al, “Scientist Warning on Affluence,” *Nature Communications* 11, 3107, June 2020, 1. Available at: <https://www.nature.com/articles/s41467-020-16941-y#ref-CR35>

¹⁸⁰ Sean Fleming, “This is Now the World’s Greatest Threat – and it’s not Coronavirus,” 21 July 2020, *World Economic Forum*. Available at: <https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2020/07/affluence-bigger-threat-than-coronavirus-scientists-capitalism/>. See also, <https://www.weforum.org/agenda/archive/future-of-consumption>.

of the wealthy) to oversized vehicles, environmentally damaging and wasteful food, leisure patterns and work patterns involving driving and flying. This implies reducing expenditure and wealth along ‘sustainable consumption corridors’, i.e. **minimum and maximum consumption standards**. [emphasis added]¹⁸¹

This was clarified further by one of the authors who stated that growth, in any form whether its “green growth” or “sustainable growth” is the problem, “As long as there is growth—both economically and in population—technology cannot keep up with reducing impacts, the overall environmental impacts will [sic] only increase.”¹⁸² The authors suggest, “less affluent, simpler and sufficiency-oriented lifestyles to address overconsumption.”¹⁸³ The solution proposed is degrowth,¹⁸⁴ which includes several different components such as eliminating GDP¹⁸⁵ as a metric for prosperity and replacing it with some type of “well-being”¹⁸⁶ index, as New Zealand has implemented, because the expectation is that there will be a “shrinking of GDP if sufficient environmental policies are enacted”; reforming governance through citizen assemblies; rolling back neoliberal reforms with taxation and basic income changes as part of a Green New Deal along with relevant banning of products (beginning with certain plastics) or ecologically damaging industries; and transforming economic systems based on sharing and giving rooted in

¹⁸¹ Wiedmann, Lenzen, Keyßer, et al, “Scientist Warning on Affluence,” 2. See also, Diana Ivanova and Richard Wood, “Top 1 percent of EU households have carbon footprints 22 times larger than climate targets allow,” *The Conversation* [online] reposted on Phys.org, 27 August 2020. Available at: <https://phys.org/news/2020-08-eu-households-carbon-footprints-larger.html>. This is a summary of their research paper, “The unequal distribution of household carbon footprints in Europe and its link to sustainability,” *Global Sustainability*, June 2020, https://www.cambridge.org/core/services/aop-cambridge-core/content/view/F1ED4F705AF1C6C1FCAD477398353DC2/S2059479820000125a.pdf/unequal_distribution_of_household_carbon_footprints_in_europe_and_its_link_to_sustainability.pdf.

¹⁸² University of New South Wales, “Overconsumption and growth economy key drivers of environmental crises,” Phys.org, 19 June 2020. Available at: <https://phys.org/news/2020-06-overconsumption-growth-economy-key-drivers.html>.

¹⁸³ Wiedmann, Lenzen, Keyßer, et al, “Scientist Warning on Affluence,” 4.

¹⁸⁴ Project Drawdown, Drawdown Framework, <https://www.drawdown.org/drawdown-framework>.

¹⁸⁵ World Economic Forum, Beyond GDP, <https://www.weforum.org/focus/beyond-gdp>; see also, European Commission, “What is the Beyond GDP Initiative?” Available at: https://ec.europa.eu/environment/beyond_gdp/index_en.html.

¹⁸⁶ Available at: <https://globalwellnessinstitute.org/industry-research/happiness-wellbeing-index/>; see also, OECD Better Life Index, <http://www.oecdbetterlifeindex.org/>.

cooperation rather than competition. The metrics need to be changed so that one generation or one country cannot compare its level of prosperity, or lack of it, to another.

A recent article in the *Boston Review* titled “To Save the Climate, Give up the Demand for Constant Electricity,” argued that the necessary energy transition to renewable energy will mean that people in industrialized developed Western economies will just have to get used to intermittent unreliable electricity, like people in the developing world in places like Zimbabwe.¹⁸⁷ Indeed, the author suggests that Zimbabwe and other developing countries can “provide models for what we might call pause-full electricity. ... [they] indicate just and feasible ways of living amid intermittency.”¹⁸⁸ It is a noble price to pay to save the planet. But as the author says,

No one wants to live this way, of course. But responsible leadership must be prepared to dim the economy with shelter-in-place orders...when required for safety, interruption means survival and life. What applies in the pandemic also applies—and also with desperate urgency—in the climate crisis. We can live with some intermittency and rationing...Continuity costs too much. Climate change kills...Intermittency saves lives[.]¹⁸⁹

In the new world of electrified transportation, ride-sharing or public transit is preferred.¹⁹⁰ If one is permitted to own a car, not everyone who wants to own a car can have a car, and even if one has a car there is no guarantee that there will be enough electricity to run it. Laurence Tubiana, who helped draft the Paris Agreement, told The Green Recovery panel discussion that the EU plan is “to decrease the amount of energy consumption 50 percent by 2050. [To accomplish this]

¹⁸⁷ David McDermott Hughes, “To Save the Climate, Give up the Demand for Constant Electricity,” *Boston Review*, 5 October 2020. Available at: <http://bostonreview.net/science-nature/david-mcdermott-hughes-save-climate-give-demand-constant-electricity>.

¹⁸⁸ Hughes, “To Save the Climate.”

¹⁸⁹ Hughes, “To Save the Climate.”

¹⁹⁰ Wiedmann, Lenzen, Keyßer, et al, “Scientist Warning on Affluence,” 3.

we also need a change in behaviours of how we live, the way we live.”¹⁹¹ A professor from Harvard, Rebecca Henderson, argued that if the movement wants to ensure a fundamental transformation of energy and consumption “we need to change the behaviour of the people who buy their products, so that there’s lower demand for them.”¹⁹² This point was emphasized by Jose Antonio Gonzalez Anaya, former CEO of PEMEX, who said, “We should be thinking not just how do we cut the supply of oil, but how do we cut the demand for oil. ... It’s a matter of taking the right policies and politics to lower that demand. When we do that companies will slowly but surely -- private and national -- will stop producing that oil to feed that demand.”¹⁹³ Paul Beaudry, Deputy Governor of the Bank of Canada, explained that the transition to a greener economy needs everyone to play their part including individuals and households that will need to shift their behaviour and preferences; the way people currently live will need to be reconsidered. Beaudry did not clarify or explain what that meant, but went on to say, “We’re learning a lot from COVID. We’re at a particular time; we’ve learned from the shock how people’s behaviour could change,” and could change quickly.¹⁹⁴ The goal then would be to convince people to accept and make the lifestyle changes necessary for Canada to fulfill its commitment to net-zero and the Great Reset.

¹⁹¹ Laurence Tubiana, Project Syndicate Event. “The Green Recovery,” Day 2, Session Two – Closing the Circuit on the Energy Transition, 17 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ko0kNo6Dt5s>.

¹⁹² Rebecca Henderson, Project Syndicate Event. “The Green Recovery.” Day 2, Session One – Can Green Business Be Good Business?, 17 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ko0kNo6Dt5s>.

¹⁹³ Jose Antonio Gonzalez Anaya, Project Syndicate Event. “The Green Recovery,” Day 2, Session Two – Closing the Circuit on the Energy Transition, 17 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ko0kNo6Dt5s>. “As long as somebody wants something, someone will produce it. It is very difficult if people have a demand for something and companies don’t produce it. As long as the world demands 100M barrels of oil a day, someone is going to produce 100M barrels of oil a day.”

¹⁹⁴ Victoria Forum, “The Great Reset: Making Finance Work for an Inclusive and Resilient Future,” Moderator Amadou Sy (IMF), Ceyla Pazarbasioglu (World Bank), Senator Yuen Pau Woo (Canada), Paul Beaudry (Deputy Governor, Bank of Canada), Webinar #7, 20 August 2020. Available at: <https://victoriaforum.ca/2020-forum/webinar-7/>.

The Transnational Progressive Movement and its Canadian counterparts need the public on side for the transition to a low-carbon future. How will they do this? A new phase in the communications strategy is necessary to promote the shift and some organizations seek to take advantage of the pandemic to “channel the mobilization mindset” by “communicating the link between climate change and the vulnerability to pandemics.”¹⁹⁵ The federal government and its supporting advocacy groups need to craft a narrative to show people the benefits and how amazing life will be in a future net-zero society.¹⁹⁶ As discussed by the Canada 2020-Global Progress Recovery Project, it is important to the movement to develop the right kind of language that can bridge ideological lines, form collaborations for dialogue, find common ground, and overcome polarization in order to create revolutionary change. The *Nature Communications* article on affluence recommends that the

first immediate action anyone can take is to talk about overconsumption...how it is unsustainable and unethical or unjust....**The necessary alternative futures need to be discussed, envisioned and shared.** It is important to create a sense of collective responsibility and action. [emphasis added]¹⁹⁷

Perhaps this is why Canada’s Privy Council Office has created a position of “story-teller”, to help craft and disseminate such a message.¹⁹⁸ A significant part of the communication campaign for net-zero and the Great Reset will likely be undertaken by ENGOS and advocacy groups funded by Canadian and American philanthropies or foundations.

¹⁹⁵ Dunskey Energy Consulting, “Building Canada’s Low Carbon Future,” foreword.

¹⁹⁶ For a detailed outline of how to structure debates on ecological lifestyle changes to legitimize action, Mathieu Saujjot, Laura Brimont and Romain Schumm, “How to Debate the Transition Towards Sustainable Lifestyles?” Issue Brief No. 5, June 2020, *IDDRI, Sustainable Development and International Relations*. Available at: <https://www.iddri.org/en/publications-and-events/issue-brief/how-debate-transition-towards-sustainable-lifestyles>.

¹⁹⁷ Wiedmann, et al, “Scientist Warning on Affluence,” 7.

¹⁹⁸ Privy Council Office, Storyteller and Team Lead. Available at: <https://emploisfp-psjobs.cfp-psc.gc.ca/psrs-srpf/applicant/page1800?toggleLanguage=en&poster=1502120>; see also Rex Murphy, “The Trudeau government doesn’t need another storyteller. It’s already overstocked,” *National Post* [online], 5 October 2020. Available at: <https://nationalpost.com/opinion/rex-murphy-the-trudeau-government-doesnt-need-another-storyteller-its-already-overstocked>.

A report on future opportunities for “Building Canada’s Low Carbon Future” for philanthropies, commissioned by the foundation bundler Environment Funders Canada, emphasized in many places the need to construct and facilitate an effective communications strategy to persuade the Canadian public to embrace the net-zero way of life. One “innovative opportunity” identified was a “Transformative Education Campaign.” This proposal suggested that foundations could “leverage the social marketing and advertising industry to create a climate-action culture in Canada. Funders could partner with different levels of government to deliver a cross-country campaign tailored to different communities.” Another opportunity identified suggested the need for

a smart and creative strategy to build excitement around what a zero-carbon future might look like, especially in Alberta and Saskatchewan. The COVID-19 crisis is an opportunity to shift the way we see the world and to ‘open everyone’s hearts to seeing a path forward instead of holding on to the past.’¹⁹⁹

Regarding campaigns in the oil and gas sector, the priority of public communication was also targeted for philanthropic support in order to

advance a constructive national dialogue on the future of fossil fuels: The climate crisis necessitates a conversation on the future of oil and gas in Canada – and a plan to reskill and diversify Canada’s economy for a low carbon future. The Energy Futures Lab, the Alberta Narratives Project, and the Task Force for a Just Transition for Canadian Coal Power Workers and Communities offer important lessons for developing a **just transition** and overcoming polarization. [emphasis in the original]²⁰⁰

The report recommended that philanthropies help support campaigns to neutralise polarization and “build broad-based support for climate action,” by “advancing a national dialogue on the future of fossil fuels” and thereby accelerate the transformation. It was also important for foundations to coordinate action with “key climate players”, grassroots organizations, and different types of organizations in order to involve many stakeholders and build long-term

¹⁹⁹ Dunskey Energy Consulting, “Building Canada’s Low Carbon Future,” 31.

²⁰⁰ Dunskey Energy Consulting, “Building Canada’s Low Carbon Future,” 17.

relationships.²⁰¹ A key cross-cutting lever identified in the report was “public mobilization.”

Many within the Transnational Progressive Movement understand the key to facilitate and accelerate the Great Transformation is to mobilize the public. In this case, a broad-base of Canadians must be mobilized

to build dialogue to reduce climate politicization and polarization... [which] can bolster advocacy and public policy work, ensure governments have the public support necessary to pass and maintain critical legislation and send a clear signal to the private sector and political parties that a strong position on climate is an asset.²⁰²

This perspective of the need for broad political and societal support echoes that of Mark Carney and the G30 as discussed in the previous section, as well as Catherine McKenna at the Recovery Summit.²⁰³ This means that Albertans and Canadians are going to be bombarded with a multifaceted communications campaign – video, social media, podcasts, townhalls, conversations, and dialogues for example – about the different aspects of the Great Reset, perhaps extolling the necessity and benefits of a net-zero life, and the virtues of sacrificing oil and gas sector employment for the sake of the future global climate.

VI. Conclusion

Climate change is the cause to facilitate this Great Transformation to a net-zero future, while COVID is the catalyst to implement a Great Reset, and the Canadian federal government under Justin Trudeau is 100 percent committed to this endeavour. Danielle Smith is correct when she says, “The failing of conservatives is they don’t take progressives seriously when they

²⁰¹ Dunskey Energy Consulting, “Building Canada’s Low Carbon Future,” 33.

²⁰² Dunskey Energy Consulting, “Building Canada’s Low Carbon Future,” 24.

²⁰³ Canada 2020-Global Progress, The Recovery Summit, Day 3, Session 1: Sustainability, 16 September 2020. Available at: <https://recoveryproject.ca/content/the-recovery-summit-sustainability/>. Catherine McKenna said, “We have to be with people, so they understand why it matters...we have to bring people together.” See also, Group of Thirty Working Group on Climate Change and Finance, Mark Carney, Janet Yellen, et al, “Mainstreaming the Transition to a Net-Zero Economy,” October 2020, xiv; 16. Available at: https://group30.org/images/uploads/publications/G30_Mainstreaming_the_Transition_to_a_Net-Zero_Economy.pdf.

propose grandiose schemes.”²⁰⁴ As outlined in the report “A New Global Paradigm,” progressives have been advocating for, and actively working towards, an energy transition and a Global Green New Deal for some time. Now it is being repackaged as a Great Reset, but the goal is essentially the same: transform the entire global economy and system by ending fossil fuel production and consumption in the Western developed countries and transitioning to a technocratic decarbonized net-zero civilization. The onset of the COVID-19 pandemic and the enforced global economic shutdown was seen by the Transnational Progressive Movement as a once in a lifetime opportunity to achieve a rapid global transformation through the use of green recovery programmes. Klaus Schwab of the World Economic Forum, and various corporate and political stakeholders, launched the Great Reset Initiative in June 2020, and Prime Minister Justin Trudeau pledged his support. The transformative shift outlined by the Great Reset—governments directing markets, wealth taxes to facilitate equality of outcome, green recovery stimulus packages, and support of technological innovation and digitalization in line with the fourth industrial revolution—is being adopted in Canada.

In a likely move to lay the groundwork to generate public acceptance of a “green recovery”, several task forces were convened to offer recommendations to the Canadian government outlining where money ought to be spent to force a transition while denying useful assistance to the western Canadian petroleum sector. The two featured in this supplemental report made clear during the various conversations, panel discussions, and webinars that all believed the pandemic has created an unprecedented opportunity to transform the world, and the public is primed for more government intervention. Language is powerful and can convey certain

²⁰⁴ Danielle Smith, “Build Back Better Really Means an End to Alberta’s Fossil Fuel Future,” *Calgary Herald* [online], 21 August 2020. Available at: <https://calgaryherald.com/opinion/columnists/smith-build-back-better-really-means-an-end-to-fossil-fuels>.

meanings and trigger responses in people. It is no coincidence that all of the entities employing the Build Back Better or Resilient Recovery phrases support the Great Reset; it signals participation in the movement and prepares the public to be more receptive to the global plan. Conspicuously, the Great Reset platform, the various progressive task force recommendations, the EU Green Deal, the Green New Deal inspired Biden Plan, and Canada's plan outlined in the Throne Speech and the subsequent spending announcements, are all strikingly similar. However, this should be unsurprising if one considers that the structure of the Paris Agreement and the Great Reset is to have agreed upon broad principles, which are then left up to the individual countries to implement in a way that is suitable for their particular nation. The Great Reset and the Global Green New Deal are scaffolds on which nations can build their own plans.

But none of this can succeed without the support of the financial industry and the public. Mark Carney has been putting into practice the principle that Christiana Figueres identified at the WEF Net Zero panel discussion as the extraordinary power of publicly stated ambition:²⁰⁵ Keep stating and promoting the idea that the Great Reset and energy transition are happening, that the financial industry will be changing the rules that will create stranded assets, that it is all inevitable,²⁰⁶ and soon enough a critical mass of people will believe it and the fundamental transformation can accelerate. One could make an argument that the task forces and dialogues and advising from Mark Carney were not intended to influence the Liberal government because the government already knew what it wanted to do, but rather they were designed to affirm and

²⁰⁵ Christiana Figueres, World Economic Forum, Sustainable Development Summit 2020, "Making Net Zero Possible," 23 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.weforum.org/events/sustainable-development-impact-summit-2020/sessions/making-net-zero-possible-times-shown-are-cet>. Also available at: <https://youtu.be/0FnFhb-xIOQ?list=PL7m903CwFUgnlRj2X4c4PTOnDYPkaUwvd>

²⁰⁶ "One way or another, radical change is inevitable; our task is to ensure that we achieve the change we want," Mariana Mazzucato, "Avoiding a Climate Lockdown," *Project Syndicate* [online], 22 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.project-syndicate.org/commentary/radical-green-overhaul-to-avoid-climate-lockdown-by-mariana-mazzucato-2020-09>.

legitimize those predetermined choices and raise public awareness about a green recovery in order to normalize and gain acceptance for the transformative change.

What many in the public have yet to fully realize is that this forced energy transition is compelling a move from a system of efficiency and reliability in energy production, resource use, environmental spatial footprint, material and longevity to the exact opposite. Renewable energy based on wind and solar is inefficient, unreliable, uses exponentially more resources, takes up more space, and does not last as long. Not only will renewable energy production be unreliable and intermittent under this new green system, so will food production. A circular economy is being prepared for Canadians, which means a drastic alteration to current lifestyles. Canadians must get used to having everything they do measured and managed, as Mark Carney so eloquently put it, having intermittent electricity, monitoring household energy use, sharing major items including cars, paying more for food because there will be less of it, eating less meat and pursuing a plant-based diet, having expensive unreliable heat exchangers, paying more for financing if loans are even granted because of one's green score, working on solar panel and windmill installations, leading a life of "sufficiency" and survival rather than the life one chooses.

The Canadian government of Justin Trudeau, in line with the Great Reset and the Transnational Progressive Movement, supports a global and national system reset, is committed to the fundamental transformation of Canada's economic foundation and social structure, and is doing so through various green recovery style initiatives. The communications plan is to convince the Canadian public, particularly those in western Canada, to voluntarily accept and support this transition and revolution, even if it means restricted access to financing, less money per household because of carbon taxes, unreliable energy and poor heating, environmental

degradation for the sake of renewables, less food, less meat, reusing and sharing goods in a circular economy, and loss of meaningful employment. It seems that the communications strategy will have to be prepared to stretch the truth because a net-zero future seems rather dark, cold, and miserable.

Back in April, a few people who knew each other from centre-left think tanks had a conversation about how we do indeed need to build back better.... The guiding thought was that this can't be a left-wing conspiracy but had to be genuinely broad.... Nothing was concealed. Everyone knew who was doing it and why.... There is no Leninist shortcut to force the march of history that ends up in a better society. But if you really want to change a society now, in the age of social media in which everyone is connected to everything, to every other person and idea, then your conspiracy is going to have to be an open one.... And in this epochal moment of global pandemics, climate change, looming depression and the march of artificial intelligence – the change is going to have to be big and transformative. Nothing else will do.

–Neal Lawson, Build Back Better UK, July 2020²⁰⁷

²⁰⁷ Neal Lawson, “‘Build Back Better’ is not a secret left-wing plot – it’s simply common sense,” 9 July 2020, Open Democracy, <https://www.opendemocracy.net/en/oureconomy/build-back-better-is-not-a-secret-left-wing-plot-its-simply-common-sense/>.

VII. Works Cited

- Albright, Madeline and Ibrahim Gambari. “Recovery and Renewal at the UN.” *Project Syndicate* [online]. 23 October 2020. Available at: https://www.project-syndicate.org/commentary/united-nations-75th-anniversary-chance-for-governance-reform-by-madeleine-albright-and-ibrahim-gambari-2020-10?a_la=english&a_d=5f92e006e724d21984c938bd&a_m=&a_a=click&a_s=&a_p=homepage&a_li=united-nations-75th-anniversary-chance-for-governance-reform-by-madeleine-albright-and-ibrahim-gambari-2020-10&a_pa=curated&a_ps=&a_ms=&a_r=.
- Amnesty International. “Democratic Republic of Congo: Government Must Deliver on Pledge to end Child Mining Labour by 2025.” 1 September 2017. Available at: <https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/news/2017/09/democratic-republic-of-congo-government-must-deliver-on-pledge-to-end-child-mining-labour-by-2025/>.
- Andersen, Inger. “North America and the Circularity Transition.” Plenary of the World Circular Economy Forum, Journey to a circular economy in the Canada-US region. 29 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.unenvironment.org/news-and-stories/speech/north-america-and-circularity-transition>.
- Argitis, Theophilos. “UN’s Carney Says Carbon Offset Market Has Become Imperative.” *Bloomberg Green* [online]. 14 October 2020. Available at: <https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2020-10-14/un-s-carney-says-carbon-offset-market-has-become-imperative>.
- Associated Press, “Protests Support Floyd, Black Lives Matter on 3 Continents,” VOA News [online], 6 June 2020. Available at: <https://voanews.com/usa/nation-turmoil-george-floyd-protests/protests-support-floyd-black-lives-matter-3-continents>.
- Audubon Society. “Wind Power and Birds.” Available at: <https://www.audubon.org/news/wind-power-and-birds>.
- Bank of England. “COP 26 private finance strategy to drive Whole Economy Transition.” February 2020. Available at: <https://www.bankofengland.co.uk/-/media/boe/files/events/2020/february/cop26-private-finance-strategy.pdf?la=en&hash=4D961E25E8E80EAB2108EEA09628DBA461D60750>.
- Bank of England. Mark Carney. “The Road to Glasgow.” 27 February 2020. Available at: <https://www.bankofengland.co.uk/-/media/boe/files/speech/2020/the-road-to-glasgow-speech-by-mark-carney.pdf?la=en&hash=DCA8689207770DCBBB179CBADBE3296F7982FDF5>.
- Barerra, Jorge. “AFN national chief to help Prince Charles promote ‘Great Reset’ environmental initiative in Canada.” CBC News. 8 June 2020. Available at:

<https://www.cbc.ca/news/indigenous/afn-chief-bellegarde-prince-charles-great-reset-1.5603502>;

Beer, Mitchell. “Freeland and Carney may be Canada’s Last, Best Chance for a Green Recovery.” *Policy Options* [online]. 25 August 2020. <https://policyoptions.irpp.org/magazines/august-2020/freeland-and-carney-may-be-canadas-last-best-chance-for-a-green-recovery/>.

Birol, Dr. Fatih. “What the 2008 Financial Crisis can Teach us about Designing Stimulus Packages Today.” 19 April 2020. International Energy Agency. Available at: <https://www.iea.org/commentaries/what-the-2008-financial-crisis-can-teach-us-about-designing-stimulus-packages-today>.

Black, Conrad. “Justin Trudeau’s Coordinated Assault on Canadian Energy.” *National Post* [online]. 9 October 2020. Available at: <https://nationalpost.com/opinion/conrad-black-trudeaus-environmental-policies-threaten-canada-itself>.

Canada 2020-Global Progress. The Recovery Project. Anne McClellan interview with Seamus O’Regan. “Canada’s Energy Future.” 9 June 2020. Available at: <https://recoveryproject.ca/content/canadas-energy-future-in-conversation-with-minister-seamus-oregan/>.

Canada 2020-Global Progress. The Recovery Project. Helena Gaspard interview with Stephane Dion. “Democratic Permeability in Times of Global Crises: Power, Politics, and Rights.” 30 July 2020. Available at: https://blubrry.com/recovery_project/65164714/democratic-permeability-in-times-of-global-crises-power-politics-and-rights/.

Canada 2020-Global Progress. The Recovery Project. Available at: <https://recoveryproject.ca/>.

Canada 2020-Global Progress. The Recovery Summit. Day 1, Session 1: Shaping a Progressive Response; Tim Dixon, Co-founder, More in Common, Neera Tanden, President, Center for American Progress, Gerry Butts, Vice Chairman, Eurasia Group, Matt Browne, Founder, Global Progress and Senior Fellow, Center for American Progress. 14 September 2020. Available at: <https://recoveryproject.ca/the-recovery-summit/>. Also Available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LIHJRku6-Oc>.

Canada 2020-Global Progress. The Recovery Summit. Day 1, Session 2: Global Public Health; Dr. Tedros Ghebreyesus, Director-General, World Health Organization, Dr. Jane Philpott, Dean, Faculty of Health Sciences at Queen’s University, Dr. Alan Bernstein, President and CEO, CIFAR, Dr. Samantha Nutt, Founder, War Child Canada and War Child USA, Dr. Ramesh Rajasingham, Assistant Secretary-General for Humanitarian Affairs and Deputy Emergency Relief Coordinator, United Nations Office for Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs, Dr. Christos Christou, International President, Médecins Sans Frontières, Dr. Ilona Kickbusch, Founder and Chair, Global Health Centre, Dr. Steven Hoffman, Lead, UN Research Roadmap for COVID-19 Recovery and Director, Global Strategies Lab. 14 September 2020. Available at:

<https://recoveryproject.ca/the-recovery-summit/>. Also available at:
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LIHJRku6-Oc>.

Canada 2020-Global Progress. The Recovery Summit. Day 3, Session 1: Sustainability. Martin Moore, Senior Lecturer, Political Communications Education and Director, Centre for the Study of Media, Communications, and Power, King's College, Alex Laskey, Founder and Executive Chair, Rewiring America, Veronica Scotti, Global Chair, Swiss Re, Megan Leslie, President and CEO, World Wildlife Fund Canada, The Honourable Catherine McKenna, Canadian Minister of Infrastructure and Communities, Gergely Karácsony, Mayor of Budapest, John Podesta, former White House Chief of Staff, Founder and Director, Center for American Progress. 16 September 2020. Available at:
<https://recoveryproject.ca/the-recovery-summit/>. Also Available at:
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=QrqfkzYwmkw>.

Canada 2020-Global Progress. The Recovery Summit. Day 3, Session 2: Democracy and Institutions. Ben Scott, Executive Director, Reset, Emily Bell, Founding Director, Tow Center for Digital Journalism at Columbia University's Graduate School of Journalism, Karen Kornbluh, Director, Digital Innovation and Democracy Initiative, The German Marshall Fund of the United States, Tom Steinberg, Founder and former Director, mySociety, Dawn Nakagawa, Executive Vice President, Berggruen Institute, Mete Coban MBE, Founder and CEO, My Life My Say, Sandro Gozi, Member of European Parliament (France), Renew Europe, Eli Pariser, Co-founder, Avaaz. 16 September 2020. Available at: <https://recoveryproject.ca/the-recovery-summit/>. Also Available at:
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=QrqfkzYwmkw>.

Canada 2020-Global Progress. The Recovery Summit, Day 4: The Road to Recovery. Kevin Page, Founding President and CEO, Institute for Fiscal Studies and Democracy at the University of Ottawa, Heather Boushey, President, CEO, and Co-founder, Washington Center for Equitable Growth, Alan Yu, Senior Fellow, Center for American Progress, Frank Graves, President and Founder, EKOS Research Associates, Marcus Roberts, Director of International Projects, YouGov, Alex Paterson, Executive Director, Canada 2020, Matt Browne, Founder, Global Progress and Senior Fellow, Center for American Progress. 17 September 2020. Available at: <https://recoveryproject.ca/the-recovery-summit/>. Also available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=FNq8PZTbZwg>.

Canada Infrastructure Bank. "Growth Plan: \$10 billion." 1 October 2020. Available at:
<https://cib-bic.ca/en/growth-plan/>. See also, <https://cib-bic.ca/wp-content/uploads/2020/10/Summary-of-the-CIB-Growth-Plan.pdf>.

Canadian Commission for UNESCO and UNESCO Chair on Food, Biodiversity, and Sustainability Studies. "Food Systems: Building Back Better Post COVID-19 Task Force." *iPolitics.ca* [online]. 15 July 2020. Available at:
<https://ipolitics.ca/2020/07/15/now-is-the-time-to-build-sustainable-food-system-resilience/>.

- CANRac, Ecojustice, Environmental Defence, Équiterre, Pembina Institute, and West Coast Environmental Law. “Policy Brief: A New Canadian Climate Accountability Act: Building the Legal Foundation to Achieve Net-Zero Emissions by 2050.” May 2020. Available at: <https://d36rd3gki5z3d3.cloudfront.net/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/Policy-Brief-New-Canadian-Climate-Accountability-Act-English.pdf?x23746>, and also a longer version. Available at: <https://www.ecojustice.ca/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/A-New-Canadian-Climate-Accountability-Act-Detailed-Report-1.pdf>.
- Cauchi, Mark. “Clean Fuel Standard: Discussion Paper.” Environment and Climate Change Canada. February 2017. Available at: <https://www.canada.ca/en/environment-climate-change/services/canadian-environmental-protection-act-registry/clean-fuel-standard-discussion-paper.html>.
- CBC. “Feds write cheque for \$320M to support workers, lower emissions for N.L.’s struggling offshore.” 25 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/newfoundland-labrador/offshore-announcement-o-regan-furey-1.5738954>.
- CBS News. “CBS News finds Children Mining Cobalt for Batteries in the Congo.” *CBS News* [online]. 5 March 2018. Available at: <https://www.cbsnews.com/news/cobalt-children-mining-democratic-republic-congo-cbs-news-investigation/>.
- Chakrabarti, Meghna and Stefano Kotsonis. “Why a New Wave of Economists Are Championing Slow Growth.” WBUR – Boston’s NPR News Station. 12 February 2020. Available at: <https://www.wbur.org/onpoint/2020/02/12/economists-slow-economic-growth>.
- Climate Assembly UK. <https://www.climateassembly.uk/>.
- Club of Rome. “Planetary Emergency 2.0.” August 2020. Available at: https://clubofrome.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/09/COR-PEP_Sep2020_A4_16pp-v2.pdf.
- Corcoran, Terence “Circular Central Planning.” *Financial Post* [online]. 9 October 2020. Available at: <https://financialpost.com/opinion/terence-corcoran-circular-central-planning>
- Corcoran, Terence. “The ‘resilience’ ploy to seize the economy.” *The Financial Post* [online], 27 May 2020. Available at: <https://financialpost.com/opinion/terence-corcoran-the-resilience-ploy-to-seize-the-economy>.
- Corkal, Vanessa, Philip Gass, and Aaron Cosbey, “Green Strings: Principles and Conditions for a Green Recovery from COVID-19 in Canada,” International Institute for Sustainable Development, June 2020. Available at: <https://www.iisd.org/system/files/2020-07/green-strings-COVID-19-canada-en.pdf>;

- Corporate Knights TV Event Schedule: Building Back Better roundtable dates. Planning for a Green Recovery. 18 April 2020. Available at: <https://www.corporateknights.com/channels/climate-and-carbon/corporate-knights-presents-recovering-strong-green-renovation-wave-15872033/>.
- Croome, Julia. “A New Canadian Climate Accountability Act.” <https://d36rd3gki5z3d3.cloudfront.net/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/Policy-Brief-New-Canadian-Climate-Accountability-Act-English.pdf?x23746>.
- Croome, Julia. “Canada Needs a World-Class Climate Law.” *Policy Options* [online], 9 September 2020, <https://policyoptions.irpp.org/magazines/september-2020/canada-needs-a-world-class-climate-law/>.
- Democratic Party. Presidential Campaign Platform for Joe Biden. “The Biden Plan for a Clean Energy Revolution and Environmental Justice.” Available at: <https://joebiden.com/climate-plan/#>.
- Deveau, Scott and Jason Kelly. “Carney Joins Brookfield to Lead Firm’s Expansion Into ESG Funds.” *Bloomberg* [online]. 28 August 2020. Available at: <https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2020-08-26/carney-joins-brookfield-to-lead-firm-s-expansion-into-esg-funds>.
- Doshi, Tilak. “The West Intends Energy Suicide: Will It Succeed?” *Forbes* [online]. 10 October 2020. Available at: <https://www.forbes.com/sites/tilakdoshi/2020/10/10/the-west-intends-energy-suicide-will-it-succeed/>.
- Duncanson, Sander, Tommy Gelbman, Simon C. Baines, Jan Nitoslawski. “Regulation for offshore drilling creates welcome efficiencies under the Impact Assessment Act.” Osler [online]. 11 June 2020. Available at: https://www.osler.com/en/resources/regulations/2020/regulation-for-offshore-drilling-creates-welcome-efficiencies-under-the-impact-assessment-act?utm_source=Mondaq&utm_medium=syndication&utm_campaign=LinkedIn-integration.
- Dunsky Energy Consultants. “Building Canada’s Low Carbon Future: Opportunities for the Philanthropic Sector.” Prepared for Environment Funders Canada. September 2020, 20. Available at: <https://environmentfunders.ca/wp-content/uploads/2020/10/EFCLowCarbonFutureReport-September2020-FINAL.pdf>.
- Ellen MacArthur Foundation. Circular Economy: What is the Circular Economy? Available at: <https://www.ellenmacarthurfoundation.org/circular-economy/what-is-the-circular-economy>.
- Environmental Defence Canada. *Not Just a Canadian Phenomenon: Citizen Opposition to Oil and Gas Production Around the World* (Environmental Defence, July 2020).

- EU expert group membership of the Platform on Sustainable Finance. Available at:
<https://ec.europa.eu/transparency/regexpert/index.cfm?do=groupDetail.groupDetail&groupID=3731&NewSearch=1&NewSearch=1>.
- European Commission. “A Renovation Wave for Europe -greening our buildings, creating jobs, improving lives.” 14 October 2020. Available at:
https://ec.europa.eu/energy/sites/ener/files/eu_renovation_wave_strategy.pdf.
- European Commission. “What is the Beyond GDP Initiative?” Available at:
https://ec.europa.eu/environment/beyond_gdp/index_en.html.
- European Commission. Farm to Fork Strategy. Available at:
https://ec.europa.eu/food/sites/food/files/safety/docs/f2f_action-plan_2020_strategy-info_en.pdf. https://eur-lex.europa.eu/resource.html?uri=cellar:ea0f9f73-9ab2-11ea-9d2d-01aa75ed71a1.0001.02/DOC_1&format=PDF ; a short fact sheet,
file:///C:/Users/Get/AppData/Local/Temp/factsheet-farm-fork_en.pdf-1.pdf.
- European Commission. G7 Plastics Workshop in the context of 2030 Agenda implementation and towards G7 collaborative activities. Brussels, 22-23 March 2018. Available at:
https://ec.europa.eu/environment/international_issues/pdf/g7_plastics_workshop_final_programme.pdf.
- European Union President. Ursula von der Leyen. European State of the Union Address. “Building the world we want to live in: A Union of vitality in a world of fragility.” 16 September 2020. Available at:
https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/SPEECH_20_1655.
- Farmers for Climate Solutions. “A Better Future Starts on the Farm: Recommendations for recovery from COVID-19 in Canadian agriculture.” August 2020. Available at:
<https://static1.squarespace.com/static/5dc5869672cac01e07a8d14d/t/5f3c0f687316e95af6983f6c/1597771696221/FCS-Recommendations+for+recovery+from+COVID-19+in+Canadian+agriculture-EN-web.pdf>;
- Feedback Global. “Big Livestock vs. The Planet.” Available at:
<https://feedbackglobal.org/campaigns/the-end-of-big-livestock/>.
- Figueres, Christiana at World Economic Forum, Net Zero panel discussion, 23 September 2020.
- Fleming, Sean. “This is Now the World’s Greatest Threat – and it’s not Coronavirus.” World Economic Forum. 21 July 2020. Available at:
<https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2020/07/affluence-bigger-threat-than-coronavirus-scientists-capitalism/>.
- Florizone, Richard and Bruce Lourie, “Canada’s Long-Term Plan Sets a Course for a Strong, Resilient Recovery.” IISD Commentary. September 2020. Available at:

<https://www.iisd.org/articles/canadas-long-term-plan-sets-course-strong-resilient-recovery>.

Food Secure Canada. “Growing Resilience and Equity: A Food Policy Action Plan in the Context of COVID-19.” May 2020. Available at:

https://foodsecurecanada.org/sites/foodsecurecanada.org/files/fsc_-_growing_resilience_equity_10_june_2020.pdf;

Friends of the Earth International, “Principles for a Just Recovery Based on Environmental, Social, Gender, and Economic Justice.” Amsterdam: August 2020. Available at:

https://www.foei.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/08/FoEI_just_recovery_principles_english.pdf.

Friends of the Earth International. “Principles for a Just Recovery.” August 2020. Available at:

https://www.foei.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/08/FoEI_just_recovery_principles_english.pdf;

Funabashi, Yoichi. “The Mideast has oil, China has rare earths.” *Japan Times* [online]. 9 August 2019. Available at: <https://www.japantimes.co.jp/opinion/2019/08/09/commentary/japan-commentary/mideast-oil-china-rare-earths/>.

Georgieva, Kristalina. “A New Bretton Woods Moment.” Speech to joint meeting of IMF and World Bank, 15 October 2020. Available at:

<https://www.imf.org/en/News/Articles/2020/10/15/sp101520-a-new-bretton-woods-moment>.

Georgieva, Kristalina. “From Great Lockdown to Great Transformation.” IMF Managing Director’s Opening Remarks to the US Chamber of Commerce. 9 June 2020. Available at: <https://www.imf.org/en/News/Articles/2020/06/09/sp060920-from-great-lockdown-to-great-transformation>.

Global Wellness Institute. Happiness and Well-Being Index. Available at:

<https://globalwellnessinstitute.org/industry-research/happiness-wellbeing-index/>.

Golshan, Tara. “Joe Biden and Bernie Sanders Reveal Names for Joint Policy Task Forces.” *Huffington Post* [online], 13 May 2020. Available at:

https://www.huffingtonpost.co.uk/entry/joe-biden-bernie-sanders-climate-task-force-ocasio-cortez_n_5ebb5b87c5b6ae915a8be292?ri18n=true&guccounter=1&guce_referrer=aHR0cHM6Ly9jb25zZW50LnlhaG9vLmNvbS92Mi9jb2xsZW50Q29uc2VudD9zZXNzaW9uSWQ9M19jYy1zZXNzaW9uXzc1NjViodliLWRINjMtNGVjYS1hMzRILWI4NzMyMTYxMjhiYQ&guce_referrer_sig=AQAAAEXj-pSasKp-1qKodEQJt9g_GZE_FJQmoWW0LiWi20LEa-0-E97xwjsErF599BuPq92zi3vztjrytVvVijA_K43mfB3snATHkAyRE4JsVPdyMYJuhJcGXECXzT-AWv_5xlnwv-NyY67DmavtO7xK888pFd3dVamlXDNnks6Xq3yx.

- Government of Canada. “Canada’s Plastics Agenda.” Available at: <https://www.canada.ca/en/environment-climate-change/services/science-technology/canada-science-plastic-agenda.html#toc10> .
- Government of Canada. “Circular North America: A World Circular Economy Forum Side Event.” Available at: <https://www.canada.ca/en/services/environment/conservation/sustainability/circular-economy/circular-north-america.html?wbdisable=true>.
- Government of Canada. Department of Finance News Release. “Government of Canada supports Newfoundland and Labrador’s Offshore Energy Sector Workers.” 25 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.canada.ca/en/department-finance/news/2020/09/government-of-canada-supports-newfoundland-and-labradors-offshore-energy-sector-workers.html>.
- Government of Canada. Environment and Climate Change Canada. Clean Fuel Standard. Available at: <https://www.canada.ca/en/environment-climate-change/services/managing-pollution/energy-production/fuel-regulations/clean-fuel-standard.html>.
- Government of Canada. Speech from the Throne. *A Stronger More Resilient Canada*. Ottawa: Library and Archives Canada, 28 September 2020. https://www.canada.ca/content/dam/pco-bcp/documents/pm/SFT_2020_EN_WEB.pdf.
- Great Reset Dialogues. “Six leaders discuss why we must reform the social contract after COVID-19.” Available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ddGQTcuV-eg>; for the complete conversation see, <https://soundcloud.com/world-economic-forum/the-great-reset-redesigning>.
- Group of Thirty. “Mainstreaming the Transition to a Net-Zero Economy: G30 Special Report Launch.” 8 October 2020. YouTube. Available at: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=CDErrkp_1Lo&feature=youtu.be.
- Group of Thirty. Working Group on Climate Change and Finance. Mark Carney, Janet Yellen, et al, “Mainstreaming the Transition to a Net-Zero Economy.” October 2020. Available at: https://group30.org/images/uploads/publications/G30_Mainstreaming_the_Transition_to_a_Net-Zero_Economy.pdf.
- Guterres, Antonio. Secretary General United Nations. “Climate Change and COVID-19: UN Urges Nations to ‘recover better.’” 22 April 2020. Available at: <https://www.un.org/en/un-coronavirus-communications-team/un-urges-countries-percentE2-percent80-percent98build-back-better-percentE2-percent80-percent99>.
- GZERO Media. Panel Discussion. “Net Zero: Climate Ambition and Action.” 16 September 2020. Panelists: Julia Pyper, Gerald Butts, Lucas Joppa, Rachel Kyte, Mark Carney. Available at: <https://www.gzeromedia.com/unqa/panel-how-can-the-world-get-to-net-zero-to-fight-climate-change>.

- Hamlett, Clare. “It’s Time for Fossil Fuel Divestment Campaigners to Take on the Meat Industry.” *Sentient Media* [online]. 16 July 2020. Available at: <https://sentientmedia.org/fossil-fuel-divestment-campaigners-to-take-on-the-meat-industry/>.
- Harwatt, Helen, William Ripple, Abhishek Chaudhary, Matthew Betts, Matthew Hayek. “Scientist call for renewed Paris pledges to transform agriculture.” *The Lancet* [online]. 11 December 2019. Available at: [https://doi.org/10.1016/s2542-5196\(19\)30245-1](https://doi.org/10.1016/s2542-5196(19)30245-1).
- Hayes, Mark A. “Bats Killed in Large Numbers at United States Wind Facilities.” *Bioscience* (December 2013 / Vol. 63 No. 12). Available at: <https://www.aibs.org/bioscience-press-releases/resources/Hayes.pdf>.
- Holy Father Pope Francis, Encyclical Letter *Fratelli Tutti*, The Holy See, October 2020, 43. Available at: http://www.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/encyclicals/documents/papa-francesco_20201003_enciclica-fratelli-tutti.html.
- HRH The Prince of Wales. Remarks by HRH The Prince of Wales at a virtual roundtable event hosted by HRH’s Sustainable Markets Initiative and The World Economic Forum. 3 June 2020. Available at: <https://www.princeofwales.gov.uk/speech/remarks-hrh-prince-wales-virtual-roundtable-event-hosted-hrhis-sustainable-markets-initiative>; <https://www.princeofwales.gov.uk/thegreatreset>.
- http://www.taxpayer.com/media/Road_percent20to_percent20recovery_percent20FINAL.pdf.
- <https://realrecovery.ca>.
- <https://www.alberta.ca/economic-recovery-council.aspx>.
- <https://www.recoverytaskforce.ca>.
- Hund, Kirsten, Daniel La Porta, et al. *Minerals for Climate Action: The Mineral Intensity of the Clean Energy Transition*. World Bank Group. Washington: International Bank for Reconstruction and Development, 2020. 61, 94. Available at: <http://pubdocs.worldbank.org/en/961711588875536384/Minerals-for-Climate-Action-The-Mineral-Intensity-of-the-Clean-Energy-Transition.pdf>.
- Institute for Energy Research. Policy Brief. “The 100 Percent Renewable Energy Myth.” 8 February 2019. Available at: <https://www.instituteforenergyresearch.org/renewable/the-100-percent-renewable-energy-myth/>
- InvestEU. Press Release. About. Available at: https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/fs_20_40.

- Ivanova, Diana and Richard Wood. “The unequal distribution of household carbon footprints in Europe and its link to sustainability.” *Global Sustainability*. June 2020. Available at: https://www.cambridge.org/core/services/aop-cambridge-core/content/view/F1ED4F705AF1C6C1FCAD477398353DC2/S2059479820000125a.pdf/unequal_distribution_of_household_carbon_footprints_in_europe_and_its_link_to_sustainability.pdf.
- Ivanova, Diana and Richard Wood. “Top 1 percent of EU households have carbon footprints 22 times larger than climate targets allow.” *The Conversation* [online] reposted on Phys.org. 27 August 2020. Available at: <https://phys.org/news/2020-08-eu-households-carbon-footprints-larger.html>.
- Kennedy, Charles. “Canada Has to Cut Oil Production Emissions to Attract Investors.” Oilprice.com [online]. 12 August, 2020. Available at: <https://oilprice.com/Latest-Energy-News/World-News/Canada-Has-To-Cut-Oil-Production-Emissions-To-Attract-Investors.html>;
- Kingston, Anne. “Inside the ‘progressive’ think tank that really runs Canada: How a small think tank called Canada 2020 gave rise to Justin Trudeau and became the country’s new nexus of power.” *Macleans’s* [online]. 12 October 2017. Available at: <https://www.macleans.ca/politics/ottawa/inside-the-progressive-think-tank-that-really-runs-canada/>.
- Kristiansen, Silje, James Painter and Meghan Shea. “Animal Agriculture and Climate Change in the US and UK Elite Media: Volume, Responsibilities, Causes and Solutions.” *Environmental Communication*. September 2020, 1-20. Available at: <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/17524032.2020.1805344>.
- Larigauderie, Anne. Project Syndicate event “The Green Recovery,” 16 September 2020. Available at: www.project-syndicate.org/videos/ps-events-the-green-recovery-day-2.
- Lawson, Neal. “‘Build Back Better’ is not a secret left-wing plot – it’s simply common sense.” Open Democracy. 9 July 2020. Available at: <https://www.opendemocracy.net/en/oureconomy/build-back-better-is-not-a-secret-left-wing-plot-its-simply-common-sense/>.
- Leiden University. “Renewable Energy Sources Can Take up to 1000 Times More Space Than Fossil Fuels.” *Phys.org* [online]. 28 August 2018. Available at: <https://phys.org/pdf454672643.pdf>.
- Leung, Shirley. “John Kerry takes the climate change fight to Wall Street.” *The Boston Globe* [online]. 20 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.bostonglobe.com/2020/09/20/business/john-kerry-takes-climate-change-fight-wall-street/>.

- Litterman, Bob. “Managing Climate Risk in the U.S. Financial System: Report of the Climate-Related Market Risk Subcommittee, Market Risk Advisory Committee of the U.S. Commodity Futures Trading Commission.” September 2020. Available at: <https://www.cftc.gov/sites/default/files/2020-09/9-9-20%20Report%20of%20the%20Subcommittee%20on%20Climate-Related%20Market%20Risk%20-%20Managing%20Climate%20Risk%20in%20the%20U.S.%20Financial%20System%20for%20posting.pdf>.
- Loriggio, Paola. “Feds, Ontario commit \$295M each to electric vehicle production at Oakville Ford plant.” *National Observer* [online]. 8 October 2020. Available at: <https://www.nationalobserver.com/2020/10/08/news/feds-ontario-commit-295m-each-electric-vehicle-production-oakville-ford-plant>.
- Mazzucato, Mariana, Gregor Semieniuk and Jose Coronado. Smart Prosperity Institute. “Guest Blog: Public investments in a green recovery from COVID-19: What steps can Canada take?” August 2020. Available at: <https://institute.smartprosperity.ca/COVIDGreenRecovery>.
- Mazzucato, Mariana. “Avoiding a Climate Lockdown,” *Project Syndicate* [online], 22 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.project-syndicate.org/commentary/radical-green-overhaul-to-avoid-climate-lockdown-by-mariana-mazzucato-2020-09>.
- McDermott Hughes, David. “To Save the Climate, Give up the Demand for Constant Electricity.” *Boston Review*. 5 October 2020. Available at: <http://bostonreview.net/science-nature/david-mcdermott-hughes-save-climate-give-demand-constant-electricity>.
- Mills, Mark. “Mines, Minerals and ‘Green’ Energy: A Reality Check.” July 2020. Manhattan Institute. Available at: <https://www.manhattan-institute.org/mines-minerals-and-green-energy-reality-check>.
- Mines Canada. *Canadian Minerals and Metals Plan, Update*. September 2020. Available at: https://www.minescanada.ca/sites/default/files/pictures/PDF/cmmp-actionplan2020_update_en_final.pdf.
- Murphy, Rex. “The Trudeau government doesn't need another storyteller. It's already overstocked.” *National Post* [online]. 5 October 2020. Available at: <https://nationalpost.com/opinion/rex-murphy-the-trudeau-government-doesnt-need-another-storyteller-its-already-overstocked>.
- National Farmers Union. “Tackling the Farming Crisis and the Climate Crisis.” November 2019. Available at: <https://www.nfu.ca/wp-content/uploads/2020/01/Tackling-the-Farm-Crisis-and-the-Climate-Crisis-NFU-2019.pdf>;

- National Farmers' Union. "Envisioning a Post-Pandemic Agricultural System." 23 June 2020. Available at: <https://www.nfu.ca/policy/envisioning-a-post-pandemic-agriculture-and-food-system/>;
- NBC News. First 2020 presidential debate: Fact-checking Biden and Trump. Available at: <https://www.nbcnews.com/politics/2020-election/first-2020-presidential-debate-fact-checking-biden-trump-n1241403>.
- Nemeth, T.L. "A New Global Paradigm: Understanding the Transnational Progressive Movement, the Energy Transition and the Great Transformation Strangling Alberta's Petroleum Industry." April 2020.
- Network for Greening the Financial System. NGFS Conference Plenary, "What can central banks do to mitigate climate related risks and scale up green finance." NGFS 17 April 2019. Available at: <https://www.ngfs.net/en/page-videos-et-jeux/video-gallery>.
- New Europe Online. "EU adopts renovation wave strategy to make buildings more efficient." *New Europe Online*, 14 October 2020. Available at: <https://www.neweurope.eu/article/eu-adopts-renovation-wave-strategy-to-make-building-energy-efficient/>.
- Newton, Paula. "Canada's Trudeau tries to reset amid economic unease and a growing ethics scandal." CNN [online]. 18 August 2020. Available at: <https://edition.cnn.com/2020/08/18/americas/canada-trudeau-scandal-intl/index.html>.
- Nickel, Rod. "Canadian oil expansion hinges on emission cuts to draw investors: minister." Reuters. 11 August 2020. Available at: <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-global-oil-canada/canadian-oil-expansion-hinges-on-emission-cuts-to-draw-investors-minister-idUSKCN2572IN?rpc=401&>.
- No Author. "Federal government to ban six disposable plastic products," *The Globe and Mail*, 8 October 2020. Available at: <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/canada/video-federal-government-to-ban-six-disposable-plastic-products/>.
- OECD. Better Life Index. Available at: <http://www.oecdbetterlifeindex.org/>.
- Paterson, Alex. "Q&A: Canada 2020's Founders, 10 Years Later." Canada 2020. 14 June 2016. Available at: <https://Canada2020.ca/2020-q-and-a-founders/>.
- President of China. H.E. Xi Jinping. "Statement by H.E. Xi Jinping President of the People's Republic of China At the General Debate of the 75th Session of the United Nations General Assembly." Beijing, 22 September 2020, 5. Available at: https://estatements.unmeetings.org/estatements/10.0010/20200922/cVOFMr0rKnhR/qR2WoyhEseD8_en.pdf

Press Release. “Climate Finally Got a Debate Question. Trump Used it to Prove He’s a Climate Denier.” Climate Power 2020. 30 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.climatepower2020.org/resources/climate-must-be-centerpiece-of-debates/>.

Prime Minister of Canada. Prime Minister Justin Trudeau. “Prime Minister’s opening remarks at the United Nations High-Level Event on Financing for Development in the Era of COVID-19 and Beyond.” Ottawa, 28 May 2020. Available at: <https://pm.gc.ca/en/news/speeches/2020/05/28/prime-ministers-opening-remarks-united-nations-high-level-event-financing>.

Prime Minister of Canada. Prime Minister Justin Trudeau Speech to the UN General Assembly, 25 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=vAcvoa8otbw>.

Prime Minister of Canada. Prime Minister and National Chief Joint Readout. 18 September 2020. Available at: <https://pm.gc.ca/en/news/readouts/2020/09/18/prime-minister-and-national-chief-joint-readout>.

Prime Minister of Canada. Readouts. “Prime Minister Trudeau speaks with His Royal Highness The Prince of Wales and the Commonwealth group of Permanent Representatives to the United Nations.” 11 June 2020. Available at: <https://pm.gc.ca/en/news/readouts/2020/06/11/prime-minister-trudeau-speaks-his-royal-highness-prince-wales-and>;

Privy Council Office, Storyteller and Team Lead. Available at: <https://emploisfp-psjobs.cfp-psc.gc.ca/psrs-srfp/applicant/page1800?toggleLanguage=en&poster=1502120>.

Project Drawdown. Drawdown Framework. Available at: <https://www.drawdown.org/drawdown-framework>.

Project Syndicate Event. “The Green Recovery.” Day 1, Session One – Green Dealing. Moderators: Ben Chu and Lizzy Burden; Opening Remarks: Werner Hoyer, President of the European Investment Bank; Panel Discussion and Q&A with international media: Carlos Lopes, former Executive Secretary of the UN Economic Commission for Africa, Mary Robinson, former President of Ireland, Chair of The Elders, Joseph Stiglitz, Nobel laureate economist. 16 September 2020. Available at: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YFMN2DA_NhI.

Project Syndicate Event. “The Green Recovery.” Day 1, Session Two – The Return(s) of Nature; Opening Remarks: Juan Manuel Santos, former President of Colombia (2010-18), Nobel Peace laureate; Panel Discussion and Q&A with international media: Christiana Figueres, former Executive Secretary of the UN Framework Convention on Climate Change, co-founder of Global Optimism Ltd, Anne Larigauderie, Executive Secretary of the Intergovernmental Science-Policy Platform on Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services, Jennifer Morris, CEO of the Nature Conservancy, Johan Rockström, Director of the

- Potsdam Institute for Climate Impact. 16 September 2020. Available at: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YFMN2DA_NhI.
- Project Syndicate Event. “The Green Recovery.” Day 2, Session One – Can Green Business Be Good Business? Moderator: Jo Coburn; Opening Remarks: Gordon Brown, former Prime Minister of the UK; Panel Discussion and Q&A with international media: Eila Kreivi, Head of Capital Markets at the European Investment Bank, Rebecca Henderson, University Professor at Harvard Business School, Jim O’Neill, Chair of Chatham House, Mariana Mazzucato, Director of the UCL Institute for Innovation and Public Purpose. 17 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ko0kNo6Dt5s>.
- Project Syndicate Event. “The Green Recovery.” Day 2, Session Two – Closing the Circuit on the Energy Transition, Opening Remarks: Kevin Rudd, former Prime Minister of Australia; Panel Discussion and Q&A with international media: Omran Al-Kuwari, CEO of the Qatar Foundation International, Jose Antonio Gonzalez Anaya, former CEO of PEMEX, Jules Kortenhorst, CEO of the Rocky Mountain Institute, Laurence Tubiana, CEO of the European Climate Foundation; In Conversation: Abiy Ahmed, Prime Minister of Ethiopia, and Bertrand Badré, CEO of Blue Like an Orange Capital. 17 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ko0kNo6Dt5s>.
- Radwanski, Adam. “The pressure’s on for Trudeau to use COVID-19 relief to fight climate change. But how?” *The Globe and Mail* [online]. 19 May 2020. Available at: <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/business/article-the-pressures-on-for-trudeau-to-use-COVID-19-relief-to-fight-climate/>.
- Raworth, Kate. *Doughnut Economics: Seven Ways to Think Like a 21st Century Economist*. White River Junction, VT: Chelsea Green Publishing, 2017.
- Royal Roads University. “Mark Carney Talks Climate Action Leadership with Philip Steenkamp.” Royal Roads University. 1 October 2020. Available at: <https://www.royalroads.ca/news-releases/steenkamp-and-carney-you-cant-diversify-away-climate-risk>. The conversation is also on Youtube. Available at: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jtZPhzDaA2U&feature=emb_logo.
- Saujjot, Mathieu, Laura Brimont and Romain Schumm. “How to Debate the Transition Towards Sustainable Lifestyles?” Issue Brief No. 5, June 2020, *IDDRI, Sustainable Development and International Relations*. Available at: <https://www.iddri.org/en/publications-and-events/issue-brief/how-debate-transition-towards-sustainable-lifestyles>.
- Schellnhuber, Hans Joachim. Horizon 2020 Commission Expert Group - High-Level Panel of the European Decarbonisation Pathways Initiative (EDPI). Available at: <https://ec.europa.eu/transparency/regexpert/index.cfm?do=groupDetail.groupDetail&groupID=3459&NewSearch=1&NewSearch=1>.

- Schwab, Klaus “Post-COVID Capitalism.” *Project Syndicate*, 12 October 2020. Available at: <https://www.project-syndicate.org/commentary/post-COVID-capitalism-great-reset-by-klaus-schwab-2020-10>.
- Schwab, Klaus and Thierry Malleret. *COVID-19 and The Great Reset*. Agentur Schweiz, July 2020.
- Schwab, Klaus. “A Better World Starts At Home.” *Project Syndicate*. 9 December 2019. Available at: <https://www.project-syndicate.org/onpoint/citizen-assemblies-to-end-polarization-by-klaus-schwab-2019-12?barrier=accesspaylog>.
- Schwab, Klaus. “Now is the Time for a ‘Great Reset’.” World Economic Forum. 3 June 2020. Available at: <https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2020/06/now-is-the-time-for-a-great-reset/>.
- Schwab, Klaus. “Post COVID Capitalism,” Project Syndicate. 12 October 2020. Available at: https://www.project-syndicate.org/commentary/post-COVID-capitalism-great-reset-by-klaus-schwab-2020-10?a_la=english&a_d=5f831b07e0993d5fd0b705b7&a_m=&a_a=click&a_s=&a_p=homepage&a_li=post-COVID-capitalism-great-reset-by-klaus-schwab-2020-10&a_pa=curated&a_ps=main-article-a2&a_ms=&a_r=.
- Scofield, Heather. “Mark Carney’s new climate change job comes with new clout.” *The Toronto Star* [online]. 1 December 2019. Available at: <https://www.thestar.com/politics/political-opinion/2019/12/01/mark-carneys-new-climate-change-job-comes-with-new-clout.html>.
- Shank, Michael. “3 ways to launch a factory farm divestment movement.” *The Hill* [online]. 17 June 2020. Available at: <https://thehill.com/opinion/energy-environment/503130-ways-to-launch-a-factory-farm-divestment-movement>;
- Sharma, Versha. “Climate Change Finally Came Up At A Debate, And Trump Talked About ‘Dead Trees’ And ‘Immaculate Air’.” Now this is News. 30 September 2020. Available at: <https://nowthisnews.com/politics/climate-change-finally-came-up-at-a-debate-and-trump-talked-about-dead-trees-and>.
- Shellenberger, Michael. “On Behalf of Environmentalists, I Apologize for the Climate Scare.” *Forbes* [online], 29 June 2020. Available at: <https://environmentalprogress.org/big-news/2020/6/29/on-behalf-of-environmentalists-i-apologize-for-the-climate-scare>.
- Shellenberger, Michael. *Apocalypse Never* (Harper Collins, 2020), 182-188.
- Shellenberger, Michael. Power Density Slide Deck. Environmental Progress. Available at: <https://environmentalprogress.org/power-density-slide-deck>.

- Signé, Landry, Addisu Lashitew, Sanjeev Khagram. “The ‘great reset’ requires agile governance.” Available at: <https://insights.techreview.com/the-great-reset-requires-agile-governance/>.
- Simon, Frederic. “EU launches ‘renovation wave’ for greener, more stylish buildings.” *Euractiv* [online], 15 October 2020. Available at: <https://www.euractiv.com/section/energy/news/eu-launches-renovation-wave-for-greener-more-stylish-buildings/>.
- Smith, Danielle. “Build Back Better Really Means an End to Alberta’s Fossil Fuel Future.” *Calgary Herald* [online]. 21 August 2020. Available at: <https://calgaryherald.com/opinion/columnists/smith-build-back-better-really-means-an-end-to-fossil-fuels>.
- Sonter, Laura J., Marie C. Dade, James E.M. Watson, Rick K. Valenta. “Renewable energy production will exacerbate mining threats to biodiversity.” *Nature Communications* 11, 4174 [online]. 1 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.nature.com/articles/s41467-020-17928-5>.
- Staples, David. “Yet Another Trudeau fuel tax will mean 22 cents per litre carbon tax at the pumps.” *Edmonton Journal* [online]. 7 October 2020. Available at: <https://edmontonjournal.com/new/national/david-staples-yet-another-trudeau-fuel-tax-will-mean-22-cents-per-litre-carbon-tax-at-the-pumps> .
- Stevens, Landon. “The Footprint of Energy: Land Use of U.S. Electricity Production.” *Strata*. June 2017. Available at: <https://www.strata.org/pdf/2017/footprints-full.pdf>.
- Steyn, Mark. “The Reset Jet Set.” *Steyn online*, 17 August 2020. Available at: <https://www.steynonline.com/10566/the-reset-jet-set>.
- T. Wiedmann, M. Lenzen, L.T. Keyßer, et al, “Scientist Warning on Affluence,” *Nature Communications* 11, 3107, June 2020, 1. Available at: <https://www.nature.com/articles/s41467-020-16941-y#ref-CR35>
- Task Force for a Resilient Recovery, “Bridge to the Future: Final Report from the Task Force for a Resilient Recovery,” September 2020, 6. Available at: https://www.recoverytaskforce.ca/wp-content/uploads/2020/09/TFRR-Final-Report_EN.pdf.
- The Commons Project. Available at: <https://thecommonsproject.org/commonpass>.
- The Green Budget Coalition. Available at: <http://www.greenbudget.ca/>;
- The Institute of Fiscal Studies and Democracy (IFSD). “The Recovery Project: Sustainability and COVID-19 Summary.” 3 September 2020. Available at: <https://recoveryproject.ca/content/sustainability-and-covid-19/>.

- The Leaders' Pledge for Nature. Available at: <https://www.leaderspledgefornature.org/>.
- Timmermans, Frans. "Opening Remarks by Executive Vice-President Frans Timmermans at the Press Conference on a Green and Just Recovery." 28 May 2020. Available at: https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/SPEECH_20_964.
- Toledano, Perrine, Martin Dietrich Brauch, Solina Kennedy, and Howard Mann. "Don't Throw Caution to the Wind: In the green energy transition, not all critical minerals will be goldmines." Columbia Center on Sustainable Investment. May 2020. Available at: <http://ccsi.columbia.edu/files/2020/05/Dont-Throw-Caution-to-the-Wind.pdf>.
- Torrie, Ralph, Celine Bak, Toby Heaps, "Building Back Better with a Bold Green Recovery," June 2020, 9. Available at: https://www.corporateknights.com/wp-content/uploads/2020/09/2020-09-14-Building-Back-Better-with-a-Bold-Green-Recovery_FINAL_enfr.pdf;
- Transcript. First Presidential Debate between Donald Trump and Joe Biden. 30 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.rev.com/blog/transcripts/donald-trump-joe-biden-1st-presidential-debate-transcript-2020>.
- Treadgold, Tim. "China's Rare Earth Threat Sparks An International Backlash." *Forbes* [online]. 7 August 2020. Available at: <https://www.forbes.com/sites/timtreadgold/2020/08/07/chinas-rare-earth-threat-sparks-an-international-backlash/>.
- Trieb, Franz. "Interference of Flying Insects and Wind Parks." Deutsches Zentrum für Luft-und Raumfahrt (DLR) Institut für Technische Thermodynamik. October 2018. Available at: <https://www.dlr.de/tt/Portaldata/41/Resources/dokumente/st/FliWip-Final-Report.pdf>.
- Tubiana, Laurence. "Eastbound and Green in Europe." *Project Syndicate* [online]. 8 October 2020. Available at: <https://www.project-syndicate.org/onpoint/eu-green-deal-joins-china-ecological-civilization-by-laurence-tubiana-2020-10>.
- United Nations Meeting, Nature for Life Hub, Day 3: Global Ambition Day, Session 3.3 Green Recovery and Green New Deals, 28 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.learningfornature.org/en/topic/session-3-green-recovery-and-green-new-deals/>.
- United Nations, Sendai Framework for Disaster Risk Reduction. Available at: <https://www.undrr.org/news/building-back-better-sendai>.
- United States Congress. H.Res.109. Recognizing the duty of the Federal Government to create a Green New Deal. Available at: <https://www.congress.gov/bill/116th-congress/house-resolution/109/text>.

- United States Fish and Wild Life Service. “Wind Turbines: What is the Issue?” Available at: <https://www.fws.gov/birds/bird-enthusiasts/threats-to-birds/collisions/wind-turbines.php>.
- University of New South Wales. “Overconsumption and growth economy key drivers of environmental crises.” Phys.org. 19 June 2020. Available at: <https://phys.org/news/2020-06-overconsumption-growth-economy-key-drivers.html>.
- Victoria Forum Webinar. “The Great Reset: Making Finance Work for an Inclusive and Resilient Future,” Moderator Amadou Sy (IMF), Ceyla Pazarbasioglu (World Bank), Senator Yuen Pau Woo (Canada), Paul Beaudry (Deputy Governor, Bank of Canada), Victoria Forum, Webinar #7, 20 August 2020. Available at: <https://victoriaforum.ca/2020-forum/webinar-7/>.
- Vollrath, Dietrich. *Fully Grown: Why a Stagnant Economy is a Sign of Success*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2020.
- Wallace, Ron. “Ottawa’s delay of Alberta’s gas pipeline: Building back slower.” *Financial Post*. 8 October 2020. Available at: <https://www.msn.com/en-ca/money/topstories/opinion-ottawas-delay-of-alberta-s-gas-pipeline-building-back-slower/ar-BB1a1RJB>.
- Watkins, Simon. “China To Expand Its Influence In The Middle East With Major Oil Deal.” Oilprice.com. 11 August 2020. Available at: <https://oilprice.com/Energy/Crude-Oil/China-To-Expand-Its-Influence-In-The-Middle-East-With-Major-Oil-Deal.html>.
- Weissman, Jordan. “Joe Biden is Campaigning on the Green New Deal Minus the Crazy.” *Slate* [online], 15 July 2020, <https://slate.com/business/2020/07/joe-bidens-climate-plan-is-the-green-new-deal-minus-the-crazy.html>.
- Widuto, Agnieszka. “EU Just Transition Fund: how does it work?” 8 October 2020. Available at: <https://epthinktank.eu/2020/10/08/eu-just-transition-fund-how-does-it-work-animated-infographic/>.
- World Economic Forum. “The Great Reset.” Available at: <https://www.weforum.org/great-reset>.
- World Economic Forum. “The Great Reset.” June 2020. Available at: <https://weforum.org/focus/the-great-reset>.
- World Economic Forum. “The World versus Virus Podcast.” Available at: <https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2020/09/great-reset-podcast-financing-sustainable-recovery-imf/>; or <https://thegreatreset.libsyn.com>.
- World Economic Forum. Agenda Contributors. Biography Mark Carney. Available at: <https://www.weforum.org/agenda/authors/mark-carney/>.
- World Economic Forum. Beyond GDP. Available at: <https://www.weforum.org/focus/beyond-gdp>.

- World Economic Forum. Future of Consumption portal.
<https://www.weforum.org/agenda/archive/future-of-consumption>.
- World Economic Forum. Great Reset Initiative. 3 June 2020. Available at:
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pfVdMWzKwjc>.
- World Economic Forum. News Release. “World Economic Forum Appoints Two New Members to Board of Trustees.” 24 January 2020. Available at:
<https://www.weforum.org/press/2020/01/world-economic-forum-appoints-two-new-members-to-board-of-trustees/>.
- World Economic Forum. PACE coalition. Available at: <https://pacecircular.org/projects>.
- World Economic Forum. Sustainable Development Summit 2020. “Global Opening Moment.” Speakers: H.M. King Abdullah II ibn Al Hussein, Klaus Schwab, Grace Forrest, Anushka Ratnayake, Rebecca Masisak, Ivan Duque, Alain Bejjani, Karen Tso. 21 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.weforum.org/events/sustainable-development-impact-summit-2020/sessions/global-opening-moment-times-shown-are-cet>. Also available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=0FnFhb-xIOQ&list=PL7m903CwFUgnlRj2X4c4PTQnDYPkaUwvd&index=22>.
- World Economic Forum. Sustainable Development Summit 2020. “Making Net Zero Possible.” Speakers: Speakers: Jesper Brodin, Klaus Schwab, Christiana Figueres, Mark Schneider, Lisa P. Jackson, Elizabeth Cousens, Martin John Callanan. 23 September 2020. Available at: <https://www.weforum.org/events/sustainable-development-impact-summit-2020/sessions/making-net-zero-possible-times-shown-are-cet>. Also available at: <https://youtu.be/0FnFhb-xIOQ?list=PL7m903CwFUgnlRj2X4c4PTQnDYPkaUwvd>.
- World Economic Forum. The Great Reset: A Unique Twin Summit to Begin 2021.
<https://www.weforum.org/press/2020/06/the-great-reset-a-unique-twin-summit-to-begin-2021>.